



British Columbia's  
Office of the Human Rights  
Commissioner

# Where we stand:

Recommendations monitoring report,  
2019–2024



Report | 2025



# Where we stand:

## Recommendations monitoring report, 2019–2024

**May 2025**

British Columbia's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner (BCOHRC) encourages the dissemination and exchange of information presented in this publication. All material presented in this publication is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International Licence with the exception of photographs and images, BCOHRC's logo, any branding or trademarks, content or material provided by third parties and where otherwise indicated. To review the licence, visit: [creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)



BCOHRC recognizes the important relationship between protecting the natural environment and protecting human rights. One way we reduce our environmental impact is by limiting print copies of our reports. However, if you have difficulties reading this report in its electronic format, you are welcome to contact our office to request a printed copy.

This publication can be found in electronic format on the website of British Columbia's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner: [bchumanrights.ca/where-we-stand](https://bchumanrights.ca/where-we-stand)

ISBN: 978-1-990626-17-3

© British Columbia's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner

536 - 999 Canada Place

Vancouver, BC V6C 3E1


1-844-922-6472 | [info@bchumanrights.ca](mailto:info@bchumanrights.ca)

# **Where we stand: Recommendations monitoring report, 2019–2024**

Report | 2025







To the Indigenous  
peoples of this place we  
now call British Columbia:  
Today we turn our minds to  
you and to your ancestors.  
You have kept your unceded  
homelands strong.  
We are grateful to live  
and work here.





British Columbia's  
**Office of the Human Rights  
Commissioner**

**MAY 2025**

The Honorable Raj Chouhan  
Speaker of the Legislative Assembly  
Parliament Buildings  
Victoria, BC V8V 1X4

Dear Mr. Speaker,

It is my pleasure to present the Human Rights Commissioner's report "Where we stand: Recommendations monitoring report, 2019–2024" to the Legislative Assembly. It has been prepared in accordance with sections 47.20(6) and 47.24 of the Human Rights Code.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'K. Govender', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

**Kasari Govender**  
Human Rights Commissioner

cc: Kate Ryan-Lloyd  
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly



## Table of contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>7</b>
Who we are .....	7
Mandate to make recommendations .....	8
Recommendation monitoring process .....	8
<b>Implementation of recommendations</b> .....	<b>10</b>
Summary of findings .....	10
Recommendation highlights .....	10
Letters to government .....	12
From hate to hope: Report of the Inquiry into hate in the COVID-19 pandemic .....	12
Equity is safer: Human rights considerations for policing reform in British Columbia .....	14
Disaggregated demographic data collection in British Columbia: The grandmother perspective .....	15
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>Appendix</b> .....	<b>18</b>
Summary of statistics .....	18
From hate to hope: Report of the Inquiry into hate in the COVID-19 pandemic .....	18
Equity is safer: Human rights considerations for policing reform in British Columbia .....	26
Disaggregated demographic data collection in British Columbia: The grandmother perspective ..	30
Letters to government .....	33



# Introduction

In the first five and a half years of the life of BC's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner (BCOHRC), the Commissioner had a dual role: building the Office from the ground up and delivering on the sweeping and potentially transformative mandate of promoting and protecting human rights in the province. Both the challenges and the promise were substantial.

Only seven months after the Office first came into existence, the COVID-19 pandemic hit and the world—and the human rights of people in B.C.—was thrown into chaos. This lent even more urgency to the Office's work. As the Commissioner noted in our first annual report:

***“So much has changed since I took office as B.C.’s first independent Human Rights Commissioner just over one year ago. To date, COVID-19 has infected more than 72 million people worldwide, killed more than 1.6 million, cost millions of jobs, upended society and lit the fuse of racism and fear. This is unfolding amid a worsening provincial health emergency: a tainted opioid epidemic killing more British Columbians each month than coronavirus. From the Black Lives Matter protests to the Wet’suwet’en solidarity protests, people have been rising up against racism and colonization, sparking conversations about systemic racism in policing and social institutions. These crises present extraordinary obstacles to preserving human rights.”***

It was in that context that the Commissioner first began to develop recommendations for change.

As the world has shifted beyond these crises toward new and ongoing human rights issues—and as we increasingly bear witness to existential threats to human rights, the world order, rule of law and even life on Earth—the Commissioner has strived to make recommendations that are relevant to the daily lives of the people in this province in transformative and tangible ways. Our focus has been on ensuring we see and reflect the experiences of those most marginalized in society.

BCOHRC produced this report to take stock of which of the Commissioner's recommendations have led to change and where we must continue to push for progress. Our intent is for this report to be the first of many; we commit to continuing to monitor uptake and advocate for change.

## Who we are

BC's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner envisions a province free from inequality, discrimination and injustice where we uphold human rights for all and fulfil our responsibilities to one another. We strive to address the root causes of these issues by shifting laws, policies, practices



and cultures. We do this work through education, research, advocacy, inquiry and monitoring.

In 2018, changes to B.C.'s [Human Rights Code](#) established B.C.'s Human Rights Commissioner as an independent officer of the Legislature. Commissioner Kasari Govender was appointed to lead the creation of the new Office of the Human Rights Commissioner and carry out its mandate. She began her first five-year term in September 2019 and was reappointed for a second term starting in September 2024.

## Mandate to make recommendations

Under B.C.'s *Human Rights Code*, the powers of the Human Rights Commissioner include:

- publishing reports, making recommendations and using other means the Commissioner considers appropriate to prevent or eliminate discriminatory practices, policies and programs
- examining the human rights implications of any policy, program or legislation and making recommendations respecting any policy, program or legislation that the Commissioner considers may be inconsistent with the Code

The Commissioner also has the power to inquire into any matter where an inquiry would promote or protect human rights. At the conclusion of an inquiry, the Commissioner may make a written report containing any recommendations the Commissioner considers appropriate. These reports may be published and provided to the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly to be tabled in the Legislature.

The Commissioner does not have the power to enforce compliance with her recommendations. However, when the Commissioner makes a recommendation to a person or organization, she may require them to notify her of steps taken, or intended to be taken, to address the recommendation. If they do not fulfil this requirement, the Commissioner may publish a report describing the failure to comply.<sup>1</sup>

Since 2019, the Commissioner has issued reports, launched inquiries and written letters to make recommendations to duty holders to advance human rights and eliminate discrimination across the province.

## Recommendation monitoring process

As described above, our Office periodically sets out to confirm which recommendations have been acted on and which have yet to be implemented. This is done to measure progress and assess our impact.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Human Rights Code*, RSBC 1996, c 210.







For this report, we reviewed the status of the recommendations issued during the Commissioner's first term, which spanned from September 2019 to August 2024. To do this, we compiled recommendations made to duty holders via 18 letters to government and three major reports:

- From hate to hope: Report of the Inquiry into hate in the COVID-19 pandemic (2023)
- Equity is safer: Human rights considerations for policing reform in British Columbia (2021)
- Disaggregated demographic data collection in British Columbia: The grandmother perspective (2020; referred to here as "the Grandmother Perspective report")

The Commissioner issued 159 recommendations to provincial public bodies over her first term; these recommendations are the focus of this report. Recommendations to local governments and private entities have also been issued through inquiry reports and letters but reporting on these will occur separately. The Commissioner made the included recommendations to government offices, ministries, special committees of the Legislature, independent officers and the provincial government as a whole.

In September 2024, BCOHRC sent letters to duty holders with a list of recommendations we issued to their offices and descriptions of the implementation status of each.

BCOHRC's assessment definitions are as follows:

-  **Fully implemented:** all activities that directly support the implementation of the recommendation are complete
-  **Partially implemented:** recommendation has been implemented to some degree but with different parameters (e.g., smaller scope, different population groups or fewer than all elements of a recommendation)
-  **In progress:** work is currently underway/in development to implement the recommendation (e.g., legislation has been drafted but has not been passed, funding has been committed but a program has not begun)
-  **Not implemented:** recommendation has not been implemented and work is not currently in progress

In the letters to duty holders, we asked them to confirm recommendations' statuses or provide updates as needed by November 2024. On receipt of their responses, BCOHRC reviewed the evidence of implementation duty holders provided and verified it by reviewing monitoring data available from other sources.

This report details the results of this monitoring process. All information is current as of November 2024.



# Implementation of recommendations

## Summary of findings

Out of 159 recommendations made between September 2019 and August 2024, 18 (11 per cent) were fully implemented, 74 (47 per cent) were partially implemented or in progress and 67 (42 per cent) were not implemented. In other words, progress was made on 58 per cent of the recommendations made by the Commissioner over her first term.

No statistically significant trends are apparent between recommendations that were fully implemented compared to those that were not implemented. However, some observations can be made based on the numbers. For example, it appears that simpler recommendations (e.g., those describing fewer population groups, those with fewer duty holders implicated and those with more direct “single action” recommendations) have better implementation outcomes. In addition, unsurprisingly, recommendations on topics that align with ongoing government priorities seem to receive more attention. For example, more action has been taken to address racism compared to encampments. Of the 13 recommendations directly related to reconciliation or decolonization, nine have seen some level of implementation.

Of the three main reports published in the Commissioner’s first term, the Grandmother Perspective report had the highest rate of implementation (85 per cent of recommendations have made progress). From Hate to Hope and Equity is Safer had similar rates of implementation, with 62 per cent and 55 per cent of recommendations making some progress, respectively. With regard to recommendations made via letters, 53 per cent saw some level of implementation. Recommendations made under non-disclosure agreements (NDA) had a higher rate of full implementation compared to public letters and reports (21 per cent compared to nine per cent), though the sample size is small (seven out of 33 recommendations made under NDA were fully implemented).

## Recommendation highlights

Many of the Commissioner’s recommendations that were implemented center on addressing hate and racism in the province.

Through the Inquiry into Hate in the COVID-19 Pandemic, the Commissioner heard about both the importance and the limitations of the criminal justice system in providing an effective response to hate incidents. Recommendation 10(a) in From Hate to Hope stated that the Attorney General should institute reforms to Crown policy directives to emphasize the strong public interest in prosecuting hate crimes and encourage a broader range of prosecutions of hate-related incidents.



This recommendation has been fully implemented through the British Columbia Prosecution Service's substantial revision to its Hate Crimes policy (HAT1), announced Feb. 16, 2024. The revisions include, for example, acknowledgement of the significant harm caused by hate crimes to victims, communities and society and a lowering of the threshold for when the public interest requires prosecution for a hate crime (revised from the old threshold of "considerable harm caused to a victim" to the new threshold of "harm caused to a victim" or "harm caused to that victim's community.") The updated policy manual for Crown prosecutors also includes specific guidance for hate crimes targeting Indigenous victims and communities and outlines the conditions that must be met for Crown to approve the use of alternative restorative justice measures.

A key recommendation from the Grandmother Perspective report was for government to introduce an Anti-Discrimination Data Act accompanied by a comprehensive training and education program. The report stated that this should include training for public sector staff administering and analyzing demographic data surveys and a broad public education campaign to increase awareness about the benefits of disaggregated data collection and the enhanced privacy protections associated with these data initiatives.

Government has fully implemented this recommendation on training (at least in regard to race-based data). In December 2023, government created an anti-racism training course that researchers are required to complete before they can access data from the BC Demographic Survey. The launch of the BC Demographic Survey also included a public awareness campaign about the purpose and benefits of collecting demographic data. Furthermore, in fall 2024, government delivered racial equity programming and service design workshops for senior leaders in the public service.

While there were significant successes and improvements, some of the Commissioner's recommendations saw limited implementation.

For example, while there were some positive elements to the *Pay Transparency Act* passed in 2023—transparency itself is an important step towards pay equity—the Act lacked the ability to make a significant difference on pay equity in the province. The legislation failed to include a centralized public database to assess pay gaps and how they change over time, making it incredibly difficult to chart a path toward genuine equity. It also failed to include enforcement mechanisms like fines or other penalties for non-compliance. Voluntary pay transparency policies do not meaningfully reduce pay gaps, especially for those who face intersecting forms of discrimination in the workplace. Since this legislation was brought into force, there has been a lack of action on further efforts to ensure everyone in B.C. is paid equal wages for work of equal value—and no steps to move from transparency to accountability in the form of a pay equity law.

Recommendation 11 in *From Hate to Hope* was for government to draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents. Per the Commissioner's recommendation, the standard should include describing when gender-based violence is a hate crime, developing hate crime indicators, requiring police departments to appoint a hate crimes specialist, directing police to provide referrals to victim-survivors and directing police to encourage people to report and to investigate a broader range of hate incidents. No parts of this recommendation were implemented



despite government's priority to modernize the *Police Act*.

## Letters to government

Over the Commissioner's first term, BCOHRC sent 18 letters containing recommendations to six ministries and four government offices and committees<sup>2</sup> related to:

- health care access
- anti-racism
- pay transparency
- policing
- economic recovery from the pandemic
- detention
- gender-based violence
- homelessness
- mental health

Out of 80 recommendations made in these letters, 13 were fully implemented, 29 were partially implemented or in progress and 38 were not implemented. 33 of these recommendations were made under NDAs with government; while we share some observations and aggregate numbers on these recommendations in this report, we are unable to share a detailed breakdown.

## From hate to hope: Report of the Inquiry into hate in the COVID-19 pandemic

As noted earlier, the Commissioner can use an inquiry to help promote or protect human rights in B.C. An inquiry is an opportunity to delve deeply into the human rights implications of a specific incident or issue. Inquiries can include gathering factual and expert evidence, hearing directly from those impacted and making recommendations to address the human rights issues raised. Findings can be reported publicly and to the Legislature by way of the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly. Rules for inquiries are found in the *Human Rights Code* and in the [Human Rights Commissioner's Inquiry Regulation](#).

In August 2021, the Commissioner launched an inquiry into the rise of hate in B.C. during the COVID-19 pandemic. The inquiry explored why hate increased during the pandemic, where hate comes from and what action can be taken to stop hate immediately and in future times of crisis.

---

<sup>2</sup> Letters were sent to the Premier, Minister of Health, Attorney General, Minister of Education and Child Care, Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, Minister of Housing, Minister of Mental Health and Addictions, Parliamentary Secretary for Gender Equity, Select Standing Committee on Children and Youth and the Provincial Health Officer. See the Appendix for details.

The Commissioner gathered information and evidence through:

- 46 virtual oral hearings where we heard from 100 people, including 52 organizations
- 20 written submissions
- a public opinion poll of a representative sample of people living in British Columbia
- a public survey where we heard from more than 2,500 people
- information requests to 46 public bodies
- two sets of information requests to all municipal police departments in B.C. and the B.C. RCMP
- orders and information requests to seven social media companies
- five external research reports on topics relevant to the Inquiry
- cross-jurisdictional research
- an in-person Elders gathering

In March 2023, the Commissioner released her findings and recommendations through the report [From Hate to Hope: Report of the Inquiry into Hate in the COVID-19 Pandemic](#). The report covers what BCOHRC learned during this inquiry and includes:

- stories of hate and its impact on people and communities
- graphs and charts sharing numbers that help to show where, in what forms and to what extent hate is happening
- results of academic research that helps us understand where hate comes from
- recommendations about how we can work together to stop hate

After reviewing the evidence presented in this report, the Commissioner issued 12 multifaceted recommendations to four ministries<sup>3</sup> and the head of the BC Public Service with the following themes:

- understanding hate and acknowledging its harm
- building safety and belonging
- fostering accountability and repairing harm

Out of 37 recommendations and sub-recommendations made in this report, one was fully implemented, 22 were partially implemented or in progress and 14 were not implemented. While significant progress has been made to address racism, including the passing of the *Anti-Racism Act* in 2024, actions directed more broadly at hate are absent from government strategies.

More than two years after the release of the recommendations from the Inquiry into Hate in the COVID-19 Pandemic, the provincial government had not specified the steps it intends to take to address the remaining recommendations, despite the Commissioner requesting it do so. This is contrary to s. 47.20 of the *Human Rights Code*. As this was the first public inquiry since the role of Human Rights Commissioner was re-established in 2019, the government's actions set an

---

3 Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, Attorney General, Minister of Emergency Management and Climate Readiness and Minister of Education and Child Care.



unfortunate precedent that, if left unaddressed, could undermine the Commissioner's progress in protecting and promoting human rights in B.C. At a time when global politics are shifting, fueling mistrust and division, it is crucial for there to be preventative and effective measures in place to address the rise in hate.

## Equity is safer: Human rights considerations for policing reform in British Columbia

On Jul. 8, 2020, the Legislative Assembly appointed the Special Committee on Reforming the Police Act (SCORPA) to examine and make recommendations to the Legislative Assembly on:

- reforms related to the modernization and sustainability of policing under the *Police Act*
- the role of police, particularly in relation to mental health, addictions and harm reduction
- the scope of systemic racism within B.C.'s police agencies
- ensuring a modernized *Police Act* is consistent with the *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples* (UNDRIP)

The Commissioner was invited to make a submission to the committee and made oral submissions to SCORPA on Feb. 11, 2021. The Commissioner's written submission was published in a report titled [Equity is Safer: Human Rights Considerations for Policing Reform in British Columbia](#).

To prepare for these submissions, BCOHRC conducted research and multiple consultation sessions. Between fall 2020 and summer 2021, we spoke to 22 community and academic experts through both roundtables and one-on-one consultations. In April 2021, the Commissioner sent detailed data requests to five police services: the Vancouver Police Department, the Nelson Police Department and the Surrey, Duncan and Prince George RCMP detachments. The Commissioner requested demographic data for a 10-year period on mental health and well-being checks, arrests and detentions and strip searches.

BCOHRC retained criminology experts Dr. Akwasi Owusu-Bempah, Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology at the University of Toronto, and Dr. Scot Wortley, Professor at the Centre for Criminology & Sociolegal Studies at the University of Toronto, who have particular expertise in race-based policing data, to assist us in preparing the data requests and to analyze the responses.

The report findings confirmed what communities have long been saying about their experiences with police. The Commissioner found:

- Indigenous, Black, Hispanic and Arab/ West Asian people are overrepresented in police incident statistics
- a great deal of police activity involves people experiencing mental health issues
- while women are generally underrepresented in police incident statistics, Indigenous women are overrepresented

After reviewing the evidence, the Commissioner issued 29 recommendations to two ministries and

one independent office<sup>4</sup> with the following themes:

- realizing B.C.'s obligations to Indigenous peoples
- disaggregated data
- street checks
- de-tasking the police
- police accountability

Out of 29 recommendations made in *Equity is Safer*, one was fully implemented, 15 were partially implemented or in progress and 13 were not implemented by government. SCORPA released its report, *Transforming Policing and Community Safety in British Columbia*, on Apr. 28, 2022, incorporating elements of 13 of the Commissioner's recommendations. The government has indicated that much of this work is still in progress, as the review of the *Police Act* is a multi-year process. In spring 2024, government introduced amendments to the *Police Act* and government staff report that work continues to develop related policy and legislation. BCOHRC has consistently been consulted about this work and our advice, based on *Equity is Safer*, has contributed to government's approach.

Despite the fact that the B.C. government emphasized policing reform as a priority during the 42nd Parliament (December 2020 to May 2024) and that SCORPA produced their report in April 2022, there has been a slow rate of progress on these recommendations since then. This is concerning from a human rights perspective. There are important tangible and targeted steps, such as producing police practice standards on addressing systemic racism in proactive police stops, that have not yet been actioned. This lack of follow-through undermines the stated commitment of this government to ensure that systemic racism in policing is addressed.

## Disaggregated demographic data collection in British Columbia: The grandmother perspective

On Jun. 16, 2020, Premier John Horgan invited the Commissioner to inform the development of a policy approach to the collection of race-based, Indigenous and other disaggregated data to address systemic racism. The Commissioner accepted the invitation and undertook a research project that included community consultation, an extensive literature review and policy analysis.

The resulting report, [Disaggregated Demographic Data Collection in British Columbia: The Grandmother Perspective](#), presents a framework for disaggregated data collection. The report states that community-based data governance is essential to address the risks that data collection and use can reinforce stereotypes, stigma and bias. It makes the case that the process of collecting data is as important as the actual use of data in guarding against harms. Guarding against these risks requires researchers to stay consistently aligned with the purpose of data collection—for example, to measure racism, not race.

---

4 Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, Attorney General and Office of the Police Complaint Commissioner



The Grandmother Perspective report details recommendations for government in building respectful relationships where marginalized communities are meaningfully involved throughout the stages of collection, storage, use and distribution of disaggregated data.

The Commissioner issued 13 recommendations to seven ministries<sup>5</sup> along the following themes:

- creating an Anti-Discrimination Data Act
- collecting disaggregated data in relation to:
  - » COVID-19 and social determinants of health and access to care
  - » mental health detentions
  - » substance use and addiction in correctional facilities
  - » populations defined in the *Poverty Reduction Strategy Act*
  - » the Student Learning Survey
  - » children in care
  - » police services

Out of 13 recommendations made in the Grandmother Perspective report, three were fully implemented, eight were partially implemented or in progress and two were not implemented. The two unimplemented recommendations are both related to data collection within health authorities.

Importantly, the Commissioner's recommendations are focused on addressing all forms of discrimination through demographic data collection, while the government's progress on these issues was focused only on race-based data collection. This is the most significant gap between the Commissioner's recommendations and the anti-racism legislative changes that followed the release of the report. Despite this gap, the Grandmother Perspective has the highest rate of implementation of our three reports and has led to significant legislative change.

Based on the principles outlined in the report, a key recommendation was to establish a legislative structure to support the collection of disaggregated data in service of systemic equality—with the meaningful involvement of marginalized communities. We were pleased to see the Commissioner's recommendation for new legislation reflected in the fall 2020 mandate letters of the Attorney General and the new Parliamentary Secretary for Anti-Racism Initiatives. We were even more pleased to be able to work closely with the Ministry of Attorney General in its development of the legislation, largely in accordance with the recommendations.

In June 2022, government passed the [Anti-Racism Data Act](#) (ARDA), which allows government to safely collect and use information to address systemic racism. This will help the Province to identify gaps in programs and deliver stronger public services for everyone in B.C. The ARDA was largely shaped by the Grandmother Perspective report. It marked a significant milestone in our Office's ability to see the Commissioner's recommendations reflected in law and it was an important marker of our province's growth toward a more equal society. The Grandmother Perspective report now

---

5 Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, Minister of Education and Child Care, Minister of Social Development and Poverty Reduction, Minister of Children and Family Development, Minister of Citizens' Services, Attorney General and the Minister of Health

serves as an important framework in guiding the implementation of the ARDA and government continues to seek BCOHRC's advice in the implementation phase. The Commissioner applauded the introduction of the ARDA while urging the government to remember that race-based data only tells part of the story; an intersectional approach is required to actually address the impact of racism and discrimination in all its forms.

In spring 2024, the [Anti-Racism Act](#) (ARA) was passed following extensive work and consultation with BCOHRC. The ARA builds on the ARDA and ensures that disaggregated demographic and race-based data are used to identify and dismantle systemic racism in our province, ensuring data is used for the purpose for which it was collected.

# Conclusion

BCOHRC has undertaken three new inquiries since fall 2023 related to detentions under the *Adult Guardianship Act* (AGA), police use of force and the alleged use of a media exclusion zone during a decampment of people experiencing homelessness. The report [“We’re Still Here”: Report of the Inquiry into Detentions under the Adult Guardianship Act](#) was released in April 2025 and includes 10 recommendations. The remaining two inquiries will also include reports with recommendations for duty holders. Further inquiries over the Commissioner's next term are likely, and the Office continues to release recommendations in letters to government calling for action on key priorities such as encampments, involuntary care, poverty and democratic rights, among others.

In addition to measuring progress, BCOHRC also took this monitoring process as an opportunity to reflect on how recommendations are made. We were interested in understanding how the framing of a recommendation, or to whom it is directed, may impact its implementation. The Commissioner will consider this learning in tailoring future recommendations to improve implementation and impact. BCOHRC intends to undertake a recommendation monitoring process every three years.

The Commissioner works to ensure that recommendations are clearly reflective of community priorities and the experiences of those most impacted by impugned laws, policies and practices. Among our guiding principles is that we will live the value of “nothing about us without us” and that we will strive to be bold and strategic in our actions. The Commissioner's recommendations aim to embody these commitments.

The Commissioner also strives to ensure recommendations are relevant, actionable, and have the potential to make a real impact for people across the province, in part by asking government and other duty holder partners to identify obstacles to implementation before recommendations are finalized.

The Commissioner will continue to call on the provincial government and other duty holders to implement her recommendations. While the recommendations are not enforceable in law, they are required to achieve compliance with law—both domestic and international—and to build a society that is defined by substantive equality and that realizes the dignity inherent in being human.



# Appendix

## Summary of statistics

Out of 159 recommendations overall:

- 18 were fully implemented (11 per cent)
- 74 were partially implemented or are in progress (47 per cent)
- 67 were not implemented (42 per cent)

In other words, progress was made on 58 per cent of recommendations.

## From hate to hope: Report of the Inquiry into hate in the COVID-19 pandemic

Out of 37 recommendations in From Hate to Hope (published Mar. 7, 2023):

- one was fully implemented (three per cent)
- 22 were partially implemented or in progress (59 per cent)
- 14 were not implemented (38 per cent)

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
1. The head of the BC Public Service should create a role at the assistant deputy minister level or higher to coordinate and lead prevention and response to hate. This role should include the responsibility to oversee the implementation of the recommendations in this report aimed at the provincial government and related public bodies. It is essential that the mandate of this role stretch across all areas of hate, including hate on the basis of gender (including gender identity and expression), race, religion, Indigeneity, sexual orientation, disability, social condition and more. nefits	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented
2. The Premier and Cabinet should commit to producing a whole-of-government strategy and action plan on addressing hate, informed by this report and the Commissioner's recommendations, with clear timelines, deliverables and transparent reporting. The strategy and action plan must be adequately funded and include:  a. creating a community advisory group to support the development of the plan with representation from people with lived experience of hate.	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented

<p>2. The Premier and Cabinet should commit to producing a whole-of-government strategy and action plan on addressing hate, informed by this report and the Commissioner's recommendations, with clear timelines, deliverables and transparent reporting. The strategy and action plan must be adequately funded and include:</p> <p>b. committing to publishing reliable data on hate incidents, based on police databases, social media reports and the centralized community reporting mechanism.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
<p>2. The Premier and Cabinet should commit to producing a whole-of-government strategy and action plan on addressing hate, informed by this report and the Commissioner's recommendations, with clear timelines, deliverables and transparent reporting. The strategy and action plan must be adequately funded and include:</p> <p>c. publishing an annual public report on progress made under the plan, using key performance indicators to measure change over time.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
<p>2. The Premier and Cabinet should commit to producing a whole-of-government strategy and action plan on addressing hate, informed by this report and the Commissioner's recommendations, with clear timelines, deliverables and transparent reporting. The strategy and action plan must be adequately funded and include:</p> <p>d. introducing, for consideration by the Legislative Assembly, an amendment to B.C.'s <i>Human Rights Code</i> (s. 47.12) to provide the Human Rights Commissioner with the legislative mandate to provide independent oversight on the implementation of this strategy.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented
<p>4. The Minister of Education and Child Care should significantly expand anti-hate curriculum throughout the K–12 system so that all students develop the knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to identify and combat hate and extremism. The Ministry should:</p> <p>a. directly include anti-hate education in the curriculum in at least one "big idea" and support it through specific curricular competencies, content and supporting materials.</p>	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Partially implemented
<p>4. The Minister of Education and Child Care should significantly expand anti-hate curriculum throughout the K–12 system so that all students develop the knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to identify and combat hate and extremism. The Ministry should:</p> <p>b. add hate, misinformation and disinformation to the Ministry's Digital Literacy Framework.</p>	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Not implemented



<p>4. The Minister of Education and Child Care should significantly expand anti-hate curriculum throughout the K–12 system so that all students develop the knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to identify and combat hate and extremism. The Ministry should:</p> <p>c. include in the curriculum the history and contributions of Indigenous, Black and other racialized people, women, LGBTQ2SAI+ people, people with disabilities and other marginalized communities.</p>	<p>Ministry of Education and Child Care</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>
<p>5. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, with support from the Attorney General, should develop, adequately fund and promote a civilian- or community-led province-wide centralized reporting system for hate incidents, which should be designed to:</p> <p>a. provide psycho-social support to victim-survivors. This reporting system must include funding for a robust and accessible advocate and counsellor network to immediately connect people who are reporting hate incidents with the help that they need, including mental health supports.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>5. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, with support from the Attorney General, should develop, adequately fund and promote a civilian- or community-led province-wide centralized reporting system for hate incidents, which should be designed to:</p> <p>b. support victim-survivors to navigate the legal system, including human rights complaints, police reports and restorative justice processes.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>5. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, with support from the Attorney General, should develop, adequately fund and promote a civilian- or community-led province-wide centralized reporting system for hate incidents, which should be designed to:</p> <p>c. collect reliable and accessible disaggregated data, analyze the data for trends and recommend to the Ministry steps that should be taken to address these trends.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>5. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, with support from the Attorney General, should develop, adequately fund and promote a civilian- or community-led province-wide centralized reporting system for hate incidents, which should be designed to:</p> <p>d. take into account the needs of young people and their experiences of hate in schools and other youth-oriented institutions.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>

5. continued: This reporting system should be multilingual, accessible to people with disabilities and utilize a variety of reporting platforms such as online and by phone, text and email. Supports available through the reporting system must be accessible across urban, rural and remote communities. Frontline service organizations in the public and private sector must post information on how to access the reporting system and supports for victim-survivors in ways that are visible to all employees and those they serve.	Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
6. All police services in B.C., including both municipal departments and the RCMP (as it operates under contract with the Province), should redirect internal funds to add additional and mandatory training for new police officers and for ongoing professional development on hate crimes response, investigation and recommending charges. Training should follow standardized benchmarks to be established by the Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General and should aim to increase non-specialized officer training in this area, including training on how to recognize hate incidents and when gender-based violence should be pursued as a hate-related charge.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
7. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General, with support from the Attorney General, should support and fund community development of restorative and healing programs to deal with hate. Restorative justice programs should be developed both to prevent hate and to address hate once it has occurred and must include robust mental health supports delivered by those with expertise in addressing hate.	Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
7. continued: Restorative justice approaches should be informed by Indigenous peoples and Indigenous legal traditions.	Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
7. continued: Restorative justice could also involve multifaith and multicultural communities and leaders as appropriate.	Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
7. continued: Services must be accessible across urban, rural and remote communities.	Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented

<p>7. Given the potential risks to the restorative approach (as detailed in the report), regular program evaluation and public reporting on efficacy must be included. Programs should be geared toward:</p> <p>a. leading perpetrators of hate and people at risk of perpetrating hate away from hateful ideologies and groups, with a focus on building a sense of belonging and community. Former perpetrators of hate should assist with developing restorative justice programs directed at perpetrators of hate or potential perpetrators and these programs should be available to people who are investigated, prosecuted and/or sentenced for hate-related criminal offences under the <i>Criminal Code</i> as well as to those who are at risk of offending.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>
<p>7. Given the potential risks to the restorative approach (as detailed in the report), regular program evaluation and public reporting on efficacy must be included. Programs should be geared toward:</p> <p>b. providing support to victim-survivors of hate incidents. Restorative justice processes must centre the perspective, needs and consent of victim-survivors of hate incidents and should also focus on the importance of community connection and community-based supports.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>
<p>8. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should work with the Minister of Emergency Management and Climate Readiness to incorporate a human rights-based approach to existing emergency response procedures. In particular:</p> <p>a. Emergency planning for major crises must include planning to address a rise in hate speech and hate-fueled violence, including gender-based violence. Particular attention should be paid to the safety of frontline workers.</p>	<p>Ministry of Emergency Management &amp; Climate Readiness; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>8. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should work with the Minister of Emergency Management and Climate Readiness to incorporate a human rights-based approach to existing emergency response procedures. In particular:</p> <p>b. A communication strategy should be developed for times of crisis to ensure multilingual and accessible, accurate, evidence-based and transparent communication. Communication must promote inclusion and cohesion and swiftly denounce hate in all its forms.</p>	<p>Ministry of Emergency Management &amp; Climate Readiness; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>In progress</p>



<p>8. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should work with the Minister of Emergency Management and Climate Readiness to incorporate a human rights-based approach to existing emergency response procedures. In particular:</p> <p>c. A broad network of well-funded community organizations working against hate, including gender-based violence, should be maintained. Community organizations involved in victim-survivor and offender support should be surveyed to evaluate the impact of government emergency response during the pandemic in order to incorporate those learnings into future emergency response procedures.</p>	<p>Ministry of Emergency Management &amp; Climate Readiness; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>8. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should work with the Minister of Emergency Management and Climate Readiness to incorporate a human rights-based approach to existing emergency response procedures. In particular:</p> <p>d. Anti-violence emergency planning must include increased and targeted services for women, young people and gender-diverse people seeking safe refuge and support, such as increased shelter and transition house spaces with room for social distancing and public communication plans to ensure that victim-survivors know where to seek help. Mental health and addiction supports should also be provided for abusers.</p>	<p>Ministry of Emergency Management &amp; Climate Readiness; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>
<p>8. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should work with the Minister of Emergency Management and Climate Readiness to incorporate a human rights-based approach to existing emergency response procedures. In particular:</p> <p>e. Low barrier mental health supports should be widely available to help people with the potential anxiety, fear, uncertainty and isolation associated with emergencies.</p>	<p>Ministry of Emergency Management &amp; Climate Readiness</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>10. The Attorney General should institute reforms to Crown policy directives to emphasize the strong public interest in prosecuting hate crimes by:</p> <p>a. encouraging a broader range of prosecutions of hate-related incidents. Restorative justice measures should be considered as appropriate.</p>	<p>Ministry of Attorney General</p>	<p>Fully implemented</p>

<p>10. The Attorney General should institute reforms to Crown policy directives to emphasize the strong public interest in prosecuting hate crimes by:</p> <p>b. issuing guidance on when gender-based violence should be approached as a hate crime, including where gender-based violence may be considered a hate-related aggravating factor in sentencing.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
<p>10. The Attorney General should institute reforms to Crown policy directives to emphasize the strong public interest in prosecuting hate crimes by:</p> <p>c. collecting and publishing data on hate incidents including charge approvals, prosecution outcomes and sentencing and cases involving hate as an aggravating factor in sentencing. This data should include disaggregated demographic data. Data should be analyzed to determine whether further reforms are necessary to improve the effectiveness of criminal justice responses to hate and ensure that prosecutions do not further embed inequities.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
<p>11. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents, which must include:</p> <p>a. an emphasis on when gender-based violence should be approached as a hate crime, including guidance on gathering evidence to support cases where gender-based violence may be considered a hate-related aggravating factor in sentencing.</p>	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
<p>11. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents, which must include:</p> <p>b. hate crime indicators to assist with investigations and charge recommendations.</p>	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
<p>11. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents, which must include:</p> <p>c. a requirement that all police departments appoint and train at least one existing position as a designated hate crime specialist who is responsible for consulting with specialized Crown Counsel and BC Hate Crimes.</p>	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented

<p>11. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents, which must include:</p> <p>d. direction to police to provide referrals to victim-survivors for support to the province-wide reporting system.</p>	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
<p>11. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents, which must include:</p> <p>e. direction to ensure uniform data collection and reporting, including a consistent definition of hate incident/crime and a requirement to record multiple hate motivations where evident as well as disaggregated demographic data on victim-survivors and offenders.</p>	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
<p>11. The Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General should draft a policing standard on responding to police-reported hate incidents, which must include:</p> <p>f. direction to police to encourage people to report and to investigate a broader range of hate incidents.</p>	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
<p>12. The Attorney General should take steps to enable the BC Human Rights Tribunal to be more responsive to hate, including by:</p> <p>a. ensuring adequate funding to the Tribunal to effectively process complaints.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
<p>12. The Attorney General should take steps to enable the BC Human Rights Tribunal to be more responsive to hate, including by:</p> <p>b. introducing legislation for consideration by the Legislative Assembly to amend s. 7 of B.C.'s <i>Human Rights Code</i> to clarify that it applies regardless of whether publications are online or offline.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
<p>12. The Attorney General should take steps to enable the BC Human Rights Tribunal to be more responsive to hate, including by:</p> <p>c. introducing legislation for consideration by the Legislative Assembly to amend s. 7, along with other substantive sections of the Code containing prohibited grounds of discrimination, to include social condition as a prohibited ground of discrimination for the purposes of hateful publications.</p>	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented



## Equity is safer: Human rights considerations for policing reform in British Columbia

Out of 29 recommendations in *Equity is Safer* (published Nov. 1, 2021):

- one was fully implemented (three per cent)
- 15 were partially implemented or in progress (52 per cent)
- 13 were not implemented (45 per cent)

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
1. The B.C. government should work with Indigenous peoples on a government-to-government basis on legislative amendments to the <i>Police Act</i> .	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
2. The B.C. government should provide funding to enable Indigenous peoples to be partners in <i>Police Act</i> reform.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Fully implemented
3. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should take steps to amend the <i>Police Act</i> to expressly authorize the police to collect race-based and other demographic data for the purpose of addressing systemic discrimination in policing.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
4. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should require the Director of Police Services to use the Indigenous data governance model and work with the Community Governance Board established under the data legislation to develop and oversee the disaggregated policing data standards.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
5. Pending the establishment of a Community Governance Board, the Director of Police Services should engage with community and utilize an Indigenous data governance model to develop standards under s. 40(1) (a.1)(vii) of the <i>Police Act</i> specific to the collection, use and disclosure of disaggregated police data.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
6. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should establish provincial data retention schedules in consultation with a Community Governance Board (or via community engagement prior to the establishment of a Community Governance Board) and require all police services to maintain disaggregated and de-identified data in data warehouses for research and other legitimate purposes.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented

7. The capacity of the Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner for B.C. should be expanded to enable the investigation of complaints or concerns about the collection, use or disclosure of data covered by the provincial policing data standard.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
8. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should amend Provincial Policing Standard, 6.2 Police Stops (or subsequent standards that relate to police stops) to reduce the exercise of discretion, ensure accountability for police actions and ensure that information is collected only for the purposes of accountability, as detailed on page 47 of these submissions.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
9. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should implement an Unbiased Policing Standard specific to traffic stops. This standard should expressly address conducting traffic stops without bias by requiring all police services to have a policy that minimizes officer discretion in proactive policing practices like sobriety checkpoints.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
10. The B.C. government should work with all levels of government including Indigenous, federal, provincial and municipal governments to establish a framework to redirect funding from police budgets and to invest in civilian-led services for people experiencing mental health and substance use crises, homelessness and other challenges that could be satisfied through increased social service provision rather than a criminal justice response.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
11. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should adapt 9-1-1 services to ensure police are only involved in responding to people experiencing a mental health crisis as a last resort and not as the default first-responders. More details are set out on page 58 of these submissions.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
<p>12. The B.C. government should make significant investments in civilian-led (i.e., led by community-based agencies rather than by police or health authorities) mental health and substance use services including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• establishing urgent response centres staffed by multidisciplinary teams that include mental health clinicians, nurses, social workers and peer workers who can provide wraparound support that extends beyond the medical model of diagnosis and treatment; and</li> <li>• increasing investments in complex care housing and substance use treatment for people with severe mental health and substance use needs. More details are set out on page 58 of these submissions.</li> </ul>	Ministry of Health; Ministry of Housing	Partially implemented

13. The B.C. government should address the intersection of policing, homelessness, mental health and substance use when developing the provincial homelessness strategy.	Ministry of Housing	In progress
14. School boards should end school liaison officer (SLO) programs unless they can demonstrate an evidence-based need for them that cannot be met through other means. In making this assessment, school boards must centre the impact of continuing SLO programs on Indigenous, Black and other student populations.	Ministry of Education and Child Care; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
15. The psychosocial and educational roles of SLOs should be re-assigned to civilians with experience in coaching and leading other extracurricular activities, child and youth counselling, trauma-informed practice, sexual assault prevention, substance use education and bullying prevention. The funds and resources which would otherwise go to SLO programs should be redirected to civilians to fulfil these roles.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Not implemented
16. The Ministry of Attorney General should provide funding for legal advocacy programs, including legal aid, to provide advice and representation to people involved in complaints or investigations by the Civilian Review and Complaints Commission for the RCMP (CRCC), Independent Investigations Office (IIO), Office of Police Complaints Commissioner of British Columbia (OPCC) and the BC Human Rights Tribunal.	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented
17. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should develop a plan and timeline to achieve the goal of complete civilianization of the IIO as soon as possible.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
18. The OPCC should develop a plan and timeline to achieve the goal of complete civilianization of the OPCC as soon as possible.	Office of the Police Complaint Commissioner	Not implemented
19. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should develop a plan and timeline to require the CRCC (when responding to B.C. complaints) to move toward the goal of complete civilianization as soon as possible.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
20. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should ensure that either the RCMP are brought under the jurisdiction of the OPCC, as recommended by the Commission of Inquiry into Policing in B.C., or that the law and complaint processes for the OPCC and the CRCC are harmonized.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress



21. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should expand the mandate of the OPCC to enable the OPCC to investigate complaints itself, assume the responsibility for any investigation or refer complaints to the IIO for investigation. If the OPCC's authority is expanded, OPCC staff must be provided with necessary training.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
22. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should use its regulation making authority in s. 74(2)(t.4) of the <i>Police Act</i> to immediately expand the IIO's mandate to include sexual assault investigations. If the IIO's authority is expanded, IIO investigators must build expertise on the dynamics of gender-based violence.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
23. The recommendations made by Battered Women's Support Services to SCORPA for government to undertake a comprehensive evaluation of police responses to domestic violence and sexual assault should be adopted.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
24. The Attorney General should take steps to amend B.C.'s <i>Human Rights Code</i> to include social condition and Indigenous identity as protected grounds.	Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
25. The <i>Police Act</i> should be amended to ensure that police boards are representative of the communities they serve and specifically of communities who are disproportionately impacted by policing, including by requiring every police board to have Indigenous representation.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
26. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should work with the RCMP in B.C. to establish local civilian police boards or councils for different areas of the province.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
27. The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General should develop additional public reporting requirements for police boards to improve police board transparency and accountability.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress
28. The B.C. government should establish a robust and well-funded Indigenous civilian police oversight body (or branches within established reputable civilian oversight bodies within a jurisdiction), which must include representation of Indigenous women, girls and LGBTQ2SAI+ people, inclusive of diverse Indigenous cultural backgrounds, as called for in the final report of the Inquiry into Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls. The Indigenous civilian oversight body should have the powers set out in more detail on page 71 of these submissions.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	In progress

29. Until the provincial government establishes Indigenous civilian oversight bodies, a civilian monitor should be appointed for every investigation into an incident that results in death or serious harm to an Indigenous person. The government should remove any barriers to their effective participation.

Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General

In progress

## Disaggregated demographic data collection in British Columbia: The grandmother perspective

Out of 13 recommendations in the Grandmother Perspective report:

- three were fully implemented (23 per cent)
- eight were partially implemented or are in progress (62 per cent)
- two were not implemented (15 per cent)

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
We recommend that the government draft the Anti-Discrimination Data Act (ADDA), which would legislate the collection, use and disclosure of demographic data for social change.	Ministry of Citizens' Services; Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
The purpose of the ADDA would be to support the B.C. <i>Human Rights Code</i> , which was established for structural change, including "to identify and eliminate persistent patterns of inequality associated with discrimination prohibited by this Code."	Ministry of Citizens' Services; Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
In addition, the ADDA must also serve the purposes of the <i>Poverty Reduction Strategy Act</i> and the <i>Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Act</i> (DRIPA).	Ministry of Citizens' Services; Ministry of Attorney General	Partially implemented
We also recommend that the government develop the ADDA in consultation with BC's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner and the Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner for British Columbia.	Ministry of Citizens' Services; Ministry of Attorney General	Fully implemented

The ADDA should set out a framework for the collection, use and disclosure of disaggregated demographic data and should include provisions that outline:

- privacy protections in line with principles of B.C.'s Data Innovation Program, including the FiveSafes model, the protection of de-identified data and personal identifiable data and the completion of privacy impact assessments with full consideration of potential individual and community harms
- the development of a data governance model with Indigenous institutions and governments (based on nation-to-nation relationships) in support of self-determination and sovereignty.
  - » the establishment of a Community Governance Board to make collaborative decisions with government whose membership shall include members of systemically oppressed communities for which data—such as race-based, Indigenous, gender and disability data—will be collected. This approach supports the intersectionality of our identities and lives. This Board will be engaged in development of a data governance model, including agreements on sharing information ongoing public deliberations, at least annually, designed and hosted by the Community Governance Board to provide check-in points for their data governance decisions
- a Community Data Secretariat to provide backbone support to this Board, including additional individual supports where necessary for meaningful participation to address financial, logistical and technological barriers
- the establishment of data standards as decided by the Community Governance Board and broad engagement with communities
  - » a framework for these data standards, which includes an equity impact assessment process that a data project should comply with in order to be approved. This framework includes three components: defining the purpose of the project, setting up a respectful process and defining the scope and limitations of the tool (data collection, use and disclosure) with community
- the extension of the mandate of the Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner to include the evaluation of complaints or concerns about the collection, use or disclosure of data covered by this legislation

Ministry of Citizens' Services; Ministry of Attorney General

Partially implemented



<p>The introduction of the ADDA should be accompanied by the implementation of a comprehensive training and education program, including training for public sector staff and a broad public education campaign. This will include providing training for public sector staff administering and analyzing demographic data surveys and a broad public education campaign to increase awareness about the benefits of disaggregated data collection and the enhanced privacy protections associated with these data initiatives.</p>	<p>Ministry of Citizens' Services; Ministry of Attorney General</p>	<p>Fully implemented</p>
<p>We recommend the Ministry of Health direct health authorities across B.C.:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• to collect race-based, Indigenous and other disaggregated demographic data in relation to COVID-19 to reveal and address systemic inequalities in social determinants of health and access to care.</li> </ul>	<p>Ministry of Health</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>
<p>We recommend the Ministry of Health direct health authorities across B.C.:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• to collect disaggregated demographic data, particularly race-based data, Indigenous and non-binary gender data for adults and children/youth (including children in government care), in relation to mental health detentions, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>» number of involuntary admissions under s. 22 of the <i>Mental Health Act</i></li> <li>» admissions as an involuntary patient via police (s. 28), jails(s. 29(1)(a)), youth detention (s. 29(1)(b)), corrections (s. 29(1)(a)), and from another province (s. 42)</li> <li>» length of involuntary detention periods including renewals (ss. 22–24)</li> <li>» number of people on extended leave (s. 37)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Ministry of Health</p>	<p>Not implemented</p>
<p>We recommend the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General draft a provincial policing standard requiring all police forces in B.C. to collect and analyze race-based data across the full spectrum of police services, including both victims and offenders of gender-based violence on arrest and cleared by charge rates. As far as possible we recommend disaggregated data collection of victims as well as accused persons and offenders.</p>	<p>Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>In progress</p>

<p>We recommend the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General direct BC Corrections to collect race-based, Indigenous and other disaggregated demographic data, including data on inmates' histories of substance use and addiction, in correctional facilities in relations to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ use of force, including total uses of force, Emergency Response Team interventions, people who have had more than one use of force against them, pepper spray deployments</li> <li>▪ segregation placements</li> <li>▪ separate confinement placements</li> </ul>	<p>Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>
<p>We recommend the Ministry of Social Development and Poverty Reduction and the Ministry of Housing collect disaggregated demographic data of users of the following programs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Income and Disability Assistance</li> <li>▪ Rental Assistance Program</li> <li>▪ temporary COVID-19 supplements</li> </ul> <p>Disaggregated data should focus on the target populations defined within the <i>Poverty Reduction Strategy Act</i>.</p>	<p>Ministry of Social Development and Poverty Reduction; Ministry of Housing</p>	<p>Fully implemented</p>
<p>We recommend the Ministry of Education expand the collection of disaggregated demographic data to include race, gender identity and expression, and other relevant categories in the annual Student Learning Survey to address systemic oppression within education and provide additional supports for marginalized students.</p>	<p>Ministry of Education and Child Care</p>	<p>In progress</p>
<p>We recommend the Ministry of Children and Family Development record the self-identified ethnicity, sexual orientation and gender identity of children in care in the Ministry's case management system and direct staff to speak with children in care about their desired supports and connections in relation to these identities.</p>	<p>Ministry of Children and Family Development</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p>

## Letters to government

Out of 47 recommendations in letters to government, excluding recommendations made under NDA:

- six were fully implemented (13 per cent)
- 21 were partially implemented or are in progress (45 per cent)
- 20 were not implemented (42 per cent)

## Social condition

Brief distributed May 1, 2020

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
B.C.'s Human Rights Commissioner urges the provincial government to consider strengthening human rights protections through the addition of social condition as a protected ground to ss. 7(1), 8(1), 9, 10(1), 11, 13(1) and 14 of the B.C. <i>Human Rights Code</i> .	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented

## Representative for Children and Youth Act (RCY) changes

Letter to the Select Standing Committee on Children and Youth (SSCCY) sent Jul. 25, 2022

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
That the <i>RCY Act</i> be amended to require the Representative to take into account the <i>United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child</i> in carrying out her functions in relation to children and youth.	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented
That the <i>RCY Act</i> be amended to require the Representative to take into account the <i>United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</i> in carrying out her functions under the Act.	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented
That the <i>RCY Act</i> be amended to require the Representative to take into account the <i>United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities</i> in carrying out her functions in relation to young adults who are eligible for CLBC services.	Ministry of Attorney General	Not implemented

## Immigration detention

Submission to Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General sent Mar. 25, 2022

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
1. Terminate any formal or informal agreement with the federal government to hold immigration detainees in provincial correctional centres and end this practice.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Fully implemented
2. Lead the way among Canadian jurisdictions by publicly encouraging other provinces to stop holding immigration detainees in provincial correctional centres.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented

3. Call on the federal government to gradually abolish immigration detention and expand the use of community-based alternatives that support individuals.	Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Partially implemented
---	---	-----------------------

## Human rights in economic recovery

Letter to the Premier sent Jul. 23, 2020

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
1. Extend rental supports beyond September to avoid dramatically increasing homelessness in the fall.	Ministry of Housing	Not implemented
2. Review the current Temporary Rental Supplement application process for accessibility and apply unallocated funding to support renters with reduced income in paying current rent and accumulated rent debt.	Ministry of Housing	Not implemented
3. Continue to purchase existing assets and build housing, including safe and accessible units for people with disabilities, Indigenous people, racialized people, women and gender diverse people and seniors.	Ministry of Housing	In progress
3a. Ensure housing provided is no or low barrier, including the prohibition of “no- guest” policies in SROs (Single Room Occupancy) and other multiple unit housing types.	Ministry of Housing	Partially implemented
3b. Support people to stay in place when housing is unavailable by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Ensuring encampments meet the basic needs of residents, including access to water, hygiene, harm reduction and other services</li> <li>ii. Urging municipalities to rescind bylaws that criminalize and displace unhoused people.</li> </ul>	Ministry of Housing	In progress
4. Target recent federal funding and matching provincial funding to support TransLink and BC Transit in providing increased transit service in low-income neighbourhoods	Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure	Partially implemented
5. Maintain the increase of \$300/month to income and disability assistance rates on a permanent basis.	Ministry of Social Development and Poverty Reduction	Fully implemented
6. Support and fund community-led food hubs and emergency home food delivery systems in collaboration with municipalities, with no barriers such as income or address verification.	Ministry of Social Development and Poverty Reduction	Fully implemented



7. Include the provision of paid sick leave within B.C.'s employment standard laws.	Ministry of Labour	Fully implemented
8. Enhance sick leave provisions within the Public Service Agency from 75 per cent of pay (or less in some circumstances) to 100 per cent to support workers in staying home when they are sick.	Public Service Agency	Partially implemented
9. Re-invest in the provincial government's universal childcare commitments as a critical measure because women continue to bear the burden of unequal childcare responsibilities.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Partially implemented
10. Target recovery measures to support workers in populations overrepresented in job losses.	Ministry of Jobs, Economic Development and Innovation	Fully implemented
12. Investigate the intersection of the COVID-19 and the opioid public health crises to ensure safe supply is accessible in practice and to enhance targeted support measures.	Ministry of Health	Not implemented
13. Continue enhancing and increasing funding for community-based mental health services for children, youth and adults.	Ministry of Mental Health and Addictions	Partially implemented
14. Ensure the provision of internet access through advocacy for increased federal support and funding, as well as targeted provincial action, which could include a technology benefit for people in poverty.	Ministry of Citizens' Services	Partially implemented

## Homelessness strategy

Letter to the Minister of Housing sent Apr. 25, 2022

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
<p><b>Addressing discrimination on the basis of social condition</b></p> <p>In our brief on adding social condition as a protected ground, we recommend adopting a definition of social condition as social or economic disadvantage on the basis of level or source of income, occupation or lack of employment, housing status including homelessness, level of education or literacy or any other similar circumstance. As long as discrimination on the basis of social condition is permitted, stigma and ill treatment aimed at people experiencing homelessness and poverty will continue. Without further clarity on when and how your government will address discrimination based on social condition, I will be unable to offer my public support for the Homelessness Strategy.</p>	Ministry of Housing	Not implemented

<p><b>The right to housing – targets and public reporting</b></p> <p>I call on you to explicitly affirm the human right to adequate housing within the provincial Homelessness Strategy. A practical demonstration of this commitment, which would improve transparency and accountability, is the inclusion of homelessness reduction targets and public annual reporting within the Homelessness Strategy. While you have identified homelessness counts as an overall indicator of progress, you have not set any concrete targets in relation to those figures. I recognize that your work to enhance homelessness counts (including capturing ‘invisible’ homeless groups, such as women and youth) may increase those numbers in the immediate future. Therefore, instead of setting a target to reduce the number of people who are homeless, you could set a target to increase the number of people housed from homelessness and the length/security of their housing.</p>	Ministry of Housing	In progress
<p><b>Disaggregated data collection</b></p> <p>I would like to take this opportunity to reiterate my recommendation that the collection, use and disclosure of that disaggregated data is conducted in alignment with the approach outlined in Disaggregated Demographic Data Collection in British Columbia: The Grandmother Perspective, which offers a “blueprint for using disaggregated data to leverage systemic change while minimizing risks to community.”</p>	Ministry of Housing	In progress
<p><b>Preventing the loss of affordable housing</b></p> <p>I recommend that the provincial government implement a temporary province-wide policy of vacancy control until longer-term solutions are in place to address the fundamental problems in the private rental housing market such that rent is sustainable and affordable for people with low- to middle-incomes, units are well maintained, and new affordable, non-profit or publicly owned, and low-income rental housing stock is readily available.</p>	Ministry of Housing	Not implemented
<p><b>A broader rental supplement</b></p> <p>I encourage your ministry to further expand B.C.’s rental supplement program to include a broader rental subsidy in alignment with the recommendations made by the Basic Income Panel, ensuring that all those who require this support can access it.</p>	Ministry of Housing	Partially implemented

## Bill 45

### Correspondence with the Ministry of Housing on May 3, 2024

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
As it currently stands, the provisions passed through Bill 45 erode the rights of people living in encampments. Until a legislative standard can be put forward that will improve human rights protections (and at the very least, respect the existing legal protections for unhoused people), I strongly recommend that government not bring those sections into force and instead defer to the existing legal standard established in the case law and expanded under international law.	Ministry of Housing	Fully implemented

## Encampment response partner resource

### Letter to the Ministry of Housing sent Jun. 24, 2024

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
Recommendations focus on how the document could be strengthened through an explicit human-rights approach that upholds the rights and dignity of all people who experience homelessness across the province. (This document has not been broken down into individual recommendations as the final version is not yet public.)	Ministry of Housing	Not implemented

## School police liaison officers (SPLOs): June 2022

### Letter to the Minister of Education and Child Care and Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General sent Jun. 14, 2022

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
I ask that you delay the release until your ministries or the report authors have engaged with Indigenous, Black and other marginalized students and their communities so that this important perspective is included.	Ministry of Education and Child Care; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
I recommend accelerating the collection and use of disaggregated demographic data to understand if marginalized students are subject to higher rates of disciplinary measures such as suspensions and expulsions, regardless of SLO involvement.	Ministry of Education and Child Care; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented

I recommend that you guarantee funding for civilian alternatives so that no school district feels it is forced to rely on uniformed officers to provide services that should be delivered through the education system.	Ministry of Education and Child Care; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented
---	---	-----------------

## School police liaison officers (SPLOs): July 2023

Letter to the Minister of Education and Child Care and Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General sent Jul. 24, 2023.

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
“This limited data further underscores the need to proceed promptly together on a comprehensive study of the impact of SLOs on marginalized students, staff, and community members...I first recommended this research in November 2021, and I believe it is past time that funding is formally set aside for it.”	Ministry of Education and Child Care; Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General	Not implemented

## K–12 anti-racism action plan

Letter to the Minister of Education and Child Care sent Oct. 4, 2022

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
<b>Expand those included in “Community Voice”</b>  It is important that the [K–12 Anti Racism Action] plan recognize the diversity within “community organizations” and “the IBPOC (Indigenous, Black or people of colour) community” by committing to engaging with individual marginalized groups whose experiences of racism in education may be quite different. For example, immigrant and refugee families, and multicultural and multilingual organizations. I also urge you to add further dialogue mechanisms for direct engagement with school staff who have lived experience of racism.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Partially implemented
<b>Robust accountability at the district level</b>  Equipping all education leaders with the skills, capacity, and incentives to identify and eliminate discriminatory practices is integral to combatting systemic racism in our education system. I urge you to take bolder action, following the lead of Ontario on this point. I believe having dedicated staff positions in each district is an important step towards real change in this area.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Not implemented



<b>A strong incident response system</b>  I understand your ministry is still in the early stages of scoping its incident response guides and resource guide, but I urge you to provide greater clarity and a stronger commitment to addressing such incidents.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	In progress
<b>A broader vision for curriculum and training</b>  I recommend that the specific actions under the areas of “Raising Awareness” and “Capacity Building” be expanded so that they are likely to achieve this goal.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Not implemented
<b>A broader vision for curriculum and training</b>  The plan should address how learning outcomes related to racism, equity and inclusion (established as targeted, achievable and transformative goals) will be woven across the existing curriculum, and what training teachers will receive to implement curriculum improvements.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Not implemented
<b>A broader vision for curriculum and training</b>  I urge you to add additional actions that will truly embed education about racism, equity, and inclusion into our schools and make our classrooms and our curriculum culturally reflective of, and responsive to, the lived experiences of every student in the room.	Ministry of Education and Child Care	Not implemented

## Bill 22

Letter to the Minister of Health and Minister of Mental Health and Addictions sent Jul. 24, 2020

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
I urge you to hold off on the introduction of stabilization care until you have properly consulted with Indigenous communities and leadership, as well as child and youth mental health and addiction specialists, human rights experts and youth with lived expertise.	Ministry of Health; Ministry of Mental Health and Addictions	Partially implemented
I urge you to hold off on the introduction of stabilization care until you have developed a robust and accessible community-based system of wrap-around, voluntary, culturally safe, trauma-informed and evidence-based harm reduction and treatment services.	Ministry of Health; Ministry of Mental Health and Addictions	Partially implemented

I urge you to hold off on the introduction of stabilization care until you have established and funded an independent legal advice service for young people detained under the *Mental Health Act* (MHA) and implemented other important access to justice safeguards as described above.

Ministry of Health;  
Ministry of Mental Health  
and Addictions

Partially  
implemented

## MSP wait period

Letter to the Minister of Health sent Oct. 24, 2023

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
End the Medical Services Plan (MSP) wait period for all new and returning residents who arrive to B.C. from outside Canada.	Ministry of Health	Partially implemented

## Vaccine passport issues

Letter to Provincial Health Officer (PHO) Bonnie Henry sent Aug. 26, 2021

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
<p><b>Lack of accommodations for Code-protected grounds</b></p> <p>Pursuant to human rights law, people who cannot be vaccinated because of a Code-protected ground should be accommodated to the point of undue hardship—if, for example, the accommodation would be inordinately expensive or would pose a significant public health risk... I want to emphasize that an exemption or accommodation process need only apply in limited circumstances where a Code-protected ground is involved. Further, I want to be clear that I am not suggesting that front line staff of discretionary service providers should bear the burden of determining whether someone has a valid exemption or not. Instead, exemptions should be built into the vaccine card itself.</p>	Office of the Provincial Health Officer	Not implemented
<p><b>Barriers to vaccination persist</b></p> <p>I recommend coupling the introduction of vaccine mandates with a significant expansion of outreach and support efforts of all kinds, particularly culturally appropriate outreach that is targeted at those ethno-cultural communities with lower vaccination rates.</p>	Office of the Provincial Health Officer	Partially implemented

### Ensuring equitable access to the vaccine card

In addition to addressing barriers for those in need of a vaccine, care must be taken to ensure all vaccinated individuals can access proof of their vaccination status, particularly those without internet service, telephone service, a mailing address, a PHN, or photo identification.

Office of the Provincial  
Health Officer

Partially  
implemented

## COVID-19 mask mandates

Letter to Provincial Health Officer (PHO) Bonnie Henry sent Mar. 16, 2022

RECOMMENDATION	DUTY HOLDER	IMPLEMENTATION STATUS
Those who have benefited most from this public health intervention have been those at greatest risk from the virus. I am concerned, therefore, that the hasty end to the provincial mask mandate will have profoundly unequal effects across society.... It is understandable that after two years of the global pandemic, many people are tired of wearing masks. But the requirement to wear a mask in indoor public spaces is a comparatively minor infringement on an individual's autonomy and an inconvenience in exercising one's rights.... When rights conflict, human rights approaches seek a balance where the rights of one group are only curtailed as much as is required to protect the rights of others.... Given the benefits of the mask mandate for thousands of marginalized people and the minimal impact on those being asked to wear one, the balance at this time favours continuing the mask mandate.	Office of the Provincial Health Officer	Not implemented

## Recommendations under non-disclosure agreements

Out of 33 recommendations under non-disclosure agreements:

- seven were fully implemented (21 per cent)
- eight were partially implemented or are in progress (24 per cent)
- 18 were not implemented (55 per cent)







British Columbia's  
**Office of the Human Rights  
Commissioner**

536 – 999 Canada Place  
Vancouver, BC V6C 3E1  
1-844-922-6472 | [info@bchumanrights.ca](mailto:info@bchumanrights.ca)

 [bchumanrights.ca](http://bchumanrights.ca)

  [@humanrights4bc](https://www.instagram.com/humanrights4bc)

 [humanrights4bc](https://www.facebook.com/humanrights4bc)