

Endnotes

- 1 Mark Schaller, Damian R. Murray, and Marlise K. Hofer, “The Behavioural Immune System and Pandemic Psychology: The Evolved Psychology of Disease-Avoidance and its Implications for Attitudes, Behaviour, and Public Health during Epidemic Outbreaks,” *European Review of Social Psychology* (November 2): 2021, 1–37.
- 2 For a complete list of agencies, see Appendix A.
- 3 For a list of the Knowledge Holders, see Appendix A. In this report, “*Knowledge Holder*” refers to people who have contributed Indigenous and/or other cultural knowledge to the Inquiry.
- 4 R.A. Malatest & Associates Ltd., *Experiences of Hate in B.C. During the Pandemic: What We Heard from British Columbians*, Survey analysis (British Columbia), May 5, 2022.
- 5 For more complex information requests and orders, we met with the agencies prior to issuing the information requests and orders.
- 6 Chief Fred Robbins, Esk’etemc First Nation, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 22, 2022). All written, oral, and supplementary submissions, if consent was provided to make the submissions public, can be found at <https://hateinquiry.bchumanrights.ca/documents>.
- 7 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 10, 2022).
- 8 Police-reported hate crimes include crimes that have been confirmed to be, or are strongly suspected to be, motivated by hate. Suspected hate crimes may include criminal incidents that cannot be confirmed as hate crimes, but for which there is sufficient evidence to suspect that they are motivated by hate (for example, graffiti where no accused has been identified).
- 9 Greg Moreau, “Police-Reported Crime Statistics in Canada, 2021,” *Canadian Centre for Justice and Community Safety Statistics*, August 3, 2022, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2022001/article/00013-eng.htm>.
- 10 Moreau, 2022, p. 14–15.
- 11 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 12 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 13 Jing Hui Wang and Greg Moreau, “Police-Reported Hate Crime in Canada, 2020,” *Canadian Centre for Justice and Community Safety Statistics*, March 17, 2022, p. 3, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2022001/article/00005-eng.htm>.
- 14 Wang and Moreau, 2022.
- 15 Statistics Canada reports that census metropolitan areas were adjusted using policing boundaries rather than census boundaries; Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 37.
- 16 Moreau, 2022, p. 14.
- 17 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia).
- 18 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 25, 2021); Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 14, 2022); DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 18, 2022); Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 18, 2021); School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 21, 2022); South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, “Oral Submissions” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 30, 2021); Support Network for Indigenous Women and Women of Colour (SNIWWOC), “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 30, 2021); Unifor, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 7, 2022); Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 31, 2022); Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 24, 2022).
- 19 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request,” April 22, 2022.
- 20 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”
- 21 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”

- 22 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 23 Wang and Moreau, 2022.
- 24 Wang and Moreau, 2022, pg. 3.
- 25 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 26 Moreau, 2022, p. 14.
- 27 Statistics Canada, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 21, 2022).
- 28 Vancouver Police Department, Report to the Vancouver Police Board - Year-end 2020 Year-to-Date Key Performance Indicators Report, February 3, 2021, <https://vancouverpoliceboard.ca/police/policeboard/agenda/2021/0218/5-1-2102P01-Year-end-2020-KPI-Report.pdf>.
- 29 Brian Levin, “Report to the nation: Anti-Asian prejudice & hate crime,” *Center for the Study of Hate & Extremism*, California State University, San Bernardino, CA, 2021, <https://www.csusb.edu/sites/default/files/Report%20to%20the%20Nation%20-%20Anti-Asian%20Hate%202020%20Final%20Draft%20-%20As%20of%20Apr%2030%202021%206%20PM%20corrected.pdf>.
- 30 Dr. Chris Tenove and Dr. Heidi Tworek, “Online Hate in the Pandemic,” *British Columbia’s Office of the Human Rights Commissioner*, June 2022, p. 12, https://hateinquiry.bchumanrights.ca/wp-content/uploads/Online-hate-in-the-pandemic-by-Dr.-Tenove-Dr.-Tworek_BCOHRCs-Inquiry-into-hate-in-the-pandemic.pdf.
- 31 Canadian Race Relations Foundation, “Online Hate and Racism: Canadian Experiences and Opinion on What to Do about It,” *CRRF*, 2021, p. 9–12.
- 32 Canadian Anti-Hate Network, “Results: Poll on Online Hate - Conducted by The Canadian Anti-Hate Network and EKOS Research,” *ANTIHATE.CA*, March 22, 2021, https://www.antihate.ca/results_poll_on_online_hate.
- 33 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl’etinqox First Nation, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 10, 2022).
- 34 Indigenous respondents to BCOHRC’s public survey (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia).
- 35 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 10, 2021).
- 36 YWCA, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 30, 2022).
- 37 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 1, 2022).
- 38 Bridgette Watson, “Island Mayor Condemns Racism against First Nation Hit Hard by COVID-19,” *CBC News*, January 11, 2021, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/mayor-north-cowichan-tribes-racism-1.5868518>.
- 39 Lindsey Kines, “Cowichan Tribes Still Facing Racism in Wake of COVID-19 Outbreak,” *Victoria Times Colonist*, sec. Local News, January 23, 2021, <https://www.timescolonist.com/local-news/cowichan-tribes-still-facing-racism-in-wake-of-covid-19-outbreak-4687018>.
- 40 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 41 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl’etinqox First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 42 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 18, 2021).
- 43 SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 44 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl’etinqox First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 45 Angela Sterritt, “Rise in Anti-Indigenous Racism and Violence in Wake of Wet’suwet’en Protests,” *CBC News*, February 27, 2020, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/rise-in-anti-indigenous-racism-violence-requires-allyship-accountability-say-victims-advocates-1.5477383>.
- 46 BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 30, 2022); Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission”; Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl’etinqox First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 47 Health Justice, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 10, 2022).
- 48 School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission”; Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission.”
- 49 Sterritt, 2020.
- 50 Sterritt, 2020.

- 51 Written submission provided to the Commissioner.
- 52 School District 22 - Vernon, "Oral Submission"; See more: <https://www.vernonmorningstar.com/news/orange-shirt-day-in-vernon-trashed-by-hate-flyers/>.
- 53 School District 22 - Vernon, "Oral Submission."
- 54 Special Advisors, "Special Advisors Report School District 57," June 24, 2021, https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/kindergarten-to-grade-12/reports-and-publications/special_advisors_report_on_school_district_57.pdf.
- 55 Special Advisors, "Special Advisors Report School District 57," 2021.
- 56 Moreau, 2021, p. 14–15.
- 57 BCOHRC public poll (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 2021).
- 58 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 59 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 60 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 61 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, "Oral Submission."
- 62 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, "Oral Submission."
- 63 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 64 BC Hate Crimes, "Oral Submission."
- 65 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, "Oral Submission."
- 66 BC Federation of Labour, "Written Submission."
- 67 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 68 Dr. Bonnie Henry, "Supplementary Submission Material" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 1, 2022).
- 69 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 70 BC Hate Crimes, "Oral Submission."
- 71 project 1907, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 18, 2021); Liminal Spaces Consulting, "Oral Submission"; Eliminate Hate, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 7, 2022).
- 72 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 30, 2021); Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 30, 2021).
- 73 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 29, 2022), p. 5.
- 74 Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 13.
- 75 Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 7.
- 76 Greg Moreau, 2022. p. 14
- 77 Vancouver Police Department - Hate Crimes Unit, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 4, 2022).
- 78 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 79 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 80 Justin Kong et al., *A Year of Racist Attacks: Anti-Asian Racism Across Canada One Year into the COVID-19 Pandemic*, Ontario, Canada: Chinese Canadian National Council Toronto Chapter, 2021, https://mcusercontent.com/9fbfd2cf7b2a8256f770fc35c/files/35c9daca-3fd4-46f4-a883-c09b8c12bbca/covidracism_final_report.pdf; CCNCTO and project 1907, *Another Year: Anti-Asian Racism Across Canada Two Years into the Covid-19 Pandemic*, 2022, https://drive.google.com/file/d/1U2ki5j-h9y229pAwX-KkqjKOHmAlO9h9/view?usp=sharing&usp=embed_facebook.
- 81 project 1907, "Oral Submission."

- 82 project 1907, "Oral Submission."
- 83 "Survey of Asian British Columbians shows anti-Asian racism is believed to be a significant problem that has gotten worse (87%) since start of the pandemic," *OMNI News*, April 9, 2021, <https://www.omnitv.ca/survey-of-asian-british-columbians-shows-anti-asian-racism-is-believed-to-be-a-significant-problem-that-has-gotten-worse-87-since-start-of-the-pandemic/>.
- 84 First United Church, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 18, 2021), <https://hateinquiry.bchumanrights.ca/documents/first-united/>; Retail Council of Canada, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 18, 2022).
- 85 Loanna Heidinger and Adam Cotter, "Perceptions of Personal Safety Among Population Groups Designated as Visible Minorities in Canada During the COVID-19 Pandemic," *StatCan COVID-19: Data Insights for a Better Canada* (Statistics Canada = Statistique Canada), July, 2020, <https://youthrex.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/00046-eng.pdf>.
- 86 Counterspeech is speech that pushes back against discrimination and hate. Tenove and Tworek, "Online hate in the pandemic," 2022, p. 42.
- 87 Moonshot, "The Impact of COVID-19 on Canada Search Traffic," *Moonshot*, June 2020, https://moonshotcve.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/The-Impact-of-COVID-19-on-Canadian-Search-Traffic_Moonshot-CVE.pdf; Moonshot, "From #CoronaVirusCoverUp to #NukeChina: An Analysis of Conspiracy Theories, Hate Speech and Incitements to Violence Across Twitter Related to Covid-19," *Moonshot*, 2020, p. 3, https://149736141.v2.pressablecdn.com/wp-content/uploads/COVID-19-on-Twitter_Moonshot.pdf.
- 88 Jon Hernandez, "More Than Half of Asian Canadians Experienced Discrimination in Past Year: Survey," *CBC News*, June 8, 2021, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/anti-asian-discrimination-angus-reid-poll-1.6056740>.
- 89 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Oral Submission"; Canadian Union of Public Employees, "Written Submission"; Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 18, 2022).
- 90 Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 91 South Asian Legal Clinic of BC, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 16, 2021).
- 92 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Oral Submission."
- 93 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Oral Submission."
- 94 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Oral Submission."
- 95 Burnaby Together Roundtable - SUCCESS, "Supplementary Submission Material" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 25, 2021).
- 96 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Supplementary Submission Material" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 5, 2021).
- 97 Burnaby Together Roundtable - SUCCESS, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 98 Respondent to Commissioner's public survey (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia).
- 99 Vietnamese Professionals Association, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 28, 2022).
- 100 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 101 Respondent to the Commissioner's public survey.
- 102 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 103 Respondent to the Commissioner's public survey.
- 104 Liminal Spaces Consulting, "Oral Submission."
- 105 Interior Crisis Line Network (and BC Crisis Line Network), "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 16, 2021).
- 106 project 1907, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 107 Dr. Natasha Tusikov, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 10, 2022).
- 108 Yorktown Family Services, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 1, 2022).
- 109 Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 110 Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission."

- 111 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission”; Collingwood Neighbourhood House, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 25, 2021).
- 112 YWCA, “Written Submission”; project 1907, “Oral Submission”; Kelowna Community Resources Part 2, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 16, 2021).
- 113 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission”; Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 114 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission”; Youth Talk Nation, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 24, 2022).
- 115 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 116 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 117 project 1907, “Oral Submission.”
- 118 University of Victoria Student Society, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 31, 2022).
- 119 School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission.”
- 120 Burnaby Together Roundtable - SUCCESS, “Supplementary Submission Material.”
- 121 School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission.”
- 122 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 123 project 1907, “Oral Submission.”
- 124 United Nations Alliance of Civilizations, “Global Pledge for Action by Religious Actors and Faith-Based Organizations to Address the COVID-19 Pandemic in Collaboration with the United Nations: A Side Event in the Margins of the High-Level Political Forum,” *UNAOC*, 2021, <https://www.unaoc.org/event/hlpf-side-event-global-pledge-for-action-by-religious-actors-and-faith-based-organizations-to-address-the-covid-19-pandemic-in-collaboration-with-the-united-nations/>.
- 125 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request,” April 22, 2022.
- 126 Moreau, 2022, p. 3.
- 127 Moreau, 2022, p. 14.
- 128 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 129 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 130 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 131 “Religious Trends: Led by Quebec, Number of Canadians Holding Favourable Views of Various Religions Increases,” *Angus Reid Institute*, 2017, p. 2 and 5, http://angusreid.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/2017.04.04_Religion.pdf.
- 132 Radio-Canada, “A Majority of Canadians Express Fears about Immigration,” *Radio-Canada*, March 2017, <https://ici.radio-canada.ca/nouvelles/special/2017/03/sondage-crop/canadiens-tolerance-religion-immigrants-identite-culture/>.
- 133 National Council of Canadian Muslims, “NCCM Recommendations National Summit on Islamophobia,” *National Council of Canadian Muslims*, July 2021, p. 3, https://www.nccm.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/Policy-Recommendations_NCCM.pdf.
- 134 South Asian Legal Clinic of BC, “Oral Submission.”
- 135 Dr. Tanner Mirrlees, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 1, 2022).
- 136 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 137 Brad Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Supplementary Submission Material” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 29, 2022).
- 138 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 139 Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 3.
- 140 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”

- 141 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 142 David Korzinski, "Diversity and Racism in Canada: Competing Views Deeply Divide Country along Gender, Generational Lines," *Angus Reid Institute*, June 21, 2021, <https://angusreid.org/diversity-racism-canada/>.
- 143 Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 22.
- 144 Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 22.
- 145 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 146 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 147 B'nai Brith Canada, "Annual Audit of Antisemitic Incidents 2021," *B'nai Brith Canada*, accessed July 28, 2022, <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1X2wPDzEol3edqk1DtBuVeCvaZSM7IzM5/view>.
- 148 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 25, 2021); Dr. Bonnie Henry, "Oral Submission."
- 149 Yorktown Family Services, "Oral Submission."
- 150 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, "Oral Submission."
- 151 B'nai Brith Canada, "Annual Audit of Antisemitic Incidents 2021."
- 152 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, "Oral Submission."
- 153 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, "Oral Submission."
- 154 Moreau, "Police-Reported Crime Statistics in Canada, 2021," 2022.
- 155 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 156 Canadian Press, "Politicians, Indigenous Leaders Say Burning Churches Not the Way to Get Justice," *CFJC Today Kamloops*, 2021, <https://cfjctoday.com/2021/06/30/politicians-indigenous-leaders-say-burning-churches-not-the-way-to-get-justice/>.
- 157 Winston Szeto, "B.C. Catholic Bishop Calls for Patience Amid Waves of Church Burnings, Vandalism," *CBC News*, 2021, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/gregory-bittman-bishop-diocese-nelson-arson-church-residential-school-1.6095614>; Darren Major, "Residential School Survivors Call for an End to Arson Attacks on Churches," *CBC News*, 2021, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/residential-school-survivors-end-church-arson-1.6090511>.
- 158 Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Vancouver, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 21, 2022).
- 159 Moreau, "Police-Reported Crime Statistics in Canada, 2021," 2022.
- 160 Catholic Civil Rights League, "Database Tracks Attacks on Churches in Canada," *The Catholic Register*, December 1, 2021, <https://www.catholicregister.org/item/33777-database-tracks-attacks-on-churches-in-canada>.
- 161 Data provided to the Commissioner's office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 162 LGBTQ2SAI+: Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, 2 Spirit, Asexual or Aromantic, and Intersex.
- 163 Klautt Law, "Oral Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 10, 2022).
- 164 Brianna Jaffray, "Experiences of Violent Victimization and Unwanted Sexual Behaviours among Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual and Other Sexual Minority People, and the Transgender Population, in Canada, 2018," *Juristat* 85 (2018): 27, 2020.
- 165 Jaffrey, 2020, p. 3.
- 166 Jaffrey, 2020, p. 3.
- 167 Liminal Spaces Consulting, "Oral Submission."
- 168 School District 22 - Vernon, "Oral Submission."
- 169 YWCA, "Written Submission."

- 170 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 171 School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission.”
- 172 Klaudt Law, “Oral Submission.”
- 173 Klaudt Law, “Oral Submission.”
- 174 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 175 Moreau, 2022, p. 15.
- 176 Wang and Moreau, 2022, p. 4.
- 177 Moreau, 2022, p. 14.
- 178 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 179 Lindsay Stark et al., “The Syndemic of COVID-19 and Gender-Based Violence in Humanitarian Settings: Leveraging Lessons from Ebola in the Democratic Republic of Congo,” *BMJ Global Health* 5, no. 11, (November 2020), <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2020-004194>.
- 180 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Gender-Based Violence: Examining the Societal Consequences of the COVID-19 Pandemic,” *BC Centre for Disease Control and Office of the Provincial Health Officer*, November 2022, http://www.bccdc.ca/Health-Professionals-Site/Documents/societal_consequences/Gender-based_violence.pdf.
- 181 Women and Gender Equality Canada, “What Is Gender-Based Violence?,” *Government of Canada*, 2022, <https://women-gender-equality.canada.ca/en/gender-based-violence-knowledge-centre/about-gender-based-violence.html>.
- 182 Angela Marie MacDougall, “Angela Marie MacDougall: B.C.’s Human-Rights Inquiry into Hate Incidents Better Late Than Never,” *Georgia Straight*, September 12, 2021, <https://www.straight.com/news/angela-marie-macdougall-bcs-human-rights-inquiry-into-hate-incidents-better-late-than-never>.
- 183 UN Women, “Facts and Figures: Ending Violence Against Women,” *UN Women*, 2022, <https://www.unwomen.org/en/what-we-do/ending-violence-against-women/facts-and-figures>; UN Women, “Frequently Asked Questions: Types of Violence against Women and Girls,” *UN Women*, n.d., <https://www.unwomen.org/en/what-we-do/ending-violence-against-women/faqs/types-of-violence>; UN Women “Ending Violence Against Women: Global Norms and Standards,” *UN Women*, n.d., <https://www.unwomen.org/en/what-we-do/ending-violence-against-women/global-norms-and-standards>.
- 184 Women and Gender Equality Canada, “What Is Gender-Based Violence?” 2022; Canadian Women’s Foundation, “The Facts About Gender-Based Violence,” *Canadian Women’s Foundation*, accessed June 10, 2022, <https://canadianwomen.org/the-facts/gender-based-violence/>.
- 185 Adam Cotter and Laura Savage, “Gender-Based Violence and Unwanted Sexual Behaviour in Canada, 2018: Initial Findings from the Survey of Safety in Public and Private Spaces,” *Juristat*, December 5, 2019, p. 7.
- 186 Cotter and Savage, 2019, p. 11.
- 187 Shana Conroy, “Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile, 2019,” *Statistics Canada*, accessed November 22, 2022, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2021001/article/00001-eng.htm>.
- 188 Conroy, 2019.
- 189 Adam Cotter, “Criminal Victimization in Canada, 2019,” *Canadian Centre for Justice and Community Safety Statistics*, August 25, 2021, , p. 37, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2021001/article/00014-eng.htm>.
- 190 *Reclaiming Power and Place: the Final Report of the National Inquiry into Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls*, Web Archive, Canada, 2019, <https://www.loc.gov/item/lcwaN0028038/>. p. 55.
- 191 Cotter and Savage, 2019.
- 192 Shana Conroy, “Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile, 2019,” 2021.
- 193 *Reclaiming Power and Place*, 2019, p. 55.
- 194 Moreau, 2022, p. 26.
- 195 *Reclaiming Power and Place*, 2019, p. 55.
- 196 Battered Women’s Support Services, “Black Women in Canada and the Black Women’s Program at BWSS,” *BWSS*, 2020, <https://www.bwss.org/black-women-in-canada/>.

- 197 Women and Gender Equality Canada, "Government of Canada Takes Further Action to Advance Gender Equity for Black Women and Girls in Canada," *Government of Canada*, 2021, <https://www.canada.ca/en/women-gender-equality/news/2021/02/government-of-canada-takes-further-action-to-advance-gender-equity-for-black-women-and-girls-in-canada.html>.
- 198 Danielle Sandhu, "A Reasonable Alternative to Guilt: Flight and Anti-Black Racism," *Windsor Review of Legal and Social Issues* 42 (2021): p. 51.
- 199 Cotter and Savage, 2019, p. 11.
- 200 Cotter and Savage, 2019, p. 9.
- 201 Brianna Jaffray, "Intimate Partner Violence: Experiences of Sexual Minority Women in Canada, 2018," *Juristat*, April 26, 2021, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2021001/article/00005-eng.htm>.
- 202 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 8.
- 203 Jaffray, 2020, p. 6.
- 204 J. Veale, E. Saewyc, H. Frohard-Dourlent, S. Dobson, B. Clark, and the Canadian Trans Youth Health Survey Research Group, *Being Safe, Being Me: Results of the Canadian Trans Youth Health Survey*, Vancouver, BC: Stigma and Resilience Among Vulnerable Youth Centre, School of Nursing, University of British Columbia, 2015.
- 205 Egale, "Still In Every Class In Every School," *Egale*, n.d., <https://egale.ca/awareness/still-in-every-class/>.
- 206 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, "Gender-Based Violence," 2022, p. 5.
- 207 Cotter and Savage, 2019, p. 37.
- 208 Cotter and Savage, 2019, p. 31.
- 209 Rise Women's Legal Centre, "Written Submission" (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 3, 2022).
- 210 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, "Gender-Based Violence," 2022, p. 7.
- 211 Stark et al., 2020, p. 1.
- 212 Shalini Mittal and Tushar Singh, "Gender-Based Violence During COVID-19 Pandemic: A Mini-Review," *Frontiers in Global Women's Health* 1 (September 8, 2020), <https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fgwh.2020.00004/full>.
- 213 Mittal and Singh, 2020.
- 214 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 1.
- 215 Dr. Sarah Yercich, Dr. Margaret Jackson, and Connor MacMillan, The FREDA Centre for Research on Violence Against Women and Children, "COVID-19 and domestic violence through an intersectional lens: Safety, security, rights," *British Columbia's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner*, July 2022, p. 11, https://hateinquiry.bchumanrights.ca/wp-content/uploads/COVID-19-and-domestic-violence-through-an-intersectional-lens-by-Dr.-Yercich-Dr.-Jackson_BCOHRCs-Inquiry-into-Hate-in-the-Pandemic.pdf.
- 216 MacDougall, 2021.
- 217 UN Women, "The Shadow Pandemic: Violence Against Women During COVID-19," *UN Women*, n.d., <https://www.unwomen.org/en/news/in-focus/in-focus-gender-equality-in-covid-19-response/violence-against-women-during-covid-19>.
- 218 UN Development Programme, "Gender-Based Violence and COVID-19," *United Nations Development Programme*, 2020, <https://www.undp.org/publications/gender-based-violence-and-covid-19>.
- 219 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 2.
- 220 MacDougall, 2021.
- 221 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, "COVID-19 and domestic violence through an intersectional lens," 2022, p. 3; BCCDC and Office of the PHO, "Gender-Based Violence," 2022.
- 222 Rise Women's Legal Centre, "Written Submission," 2022.
- 223 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, "Gender-Based Violence," 2022, p. 10.
- 224 A. L. Trudell and E. Whitmore, *Pandemic Meets Pandemic: Understanding the Impacts of COVID-19 on Gender-Based Violence Services and Survivors in Canada*, Ending Violence Association of Canada, 2020, p. 9; Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 6.
- 225 DIVERSEcity, "Oral Submission."
- 226 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 6.

- 227 West Coast LEAF, “Written submission”; Native Women’s Association of Canada, “The Impacts of COVID-19 on Indigenous Women and Gender-Diverse People in Canada,” *Native Women’s Association of Canada*, 2020, https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Issues/IPeoples/SR/COVID-19/IndigenousCSOs/Canada_Native_Women_Association_of_Canada.pdf; Canadian Women’s Foundation et al., *Resetting Normal: Systemic Gender-Based Violence and the Pandemic*, Canadian Women’s Foundation, December 2020, https://canadianwomen.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/20-08-CWF-ResettingNormal-Report3_v5.pdf; Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 34.
- 228 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 7.
- 229 Femicide is defined here as an intentional killing of women or girls because of their gender.
- 230 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Gender-Based Violence,” 2022, p. 8.
- 231 Moreau, 2022, p. 11–12.
- 232 Moreau, 2022, p. 10.
- 233 Moreau, 2022, p. 10.
- 234 Moreau, 2022, p. 50.
- 235 Moreau, 2022, p. 11.
- 236 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 237 Data provided to the Commissioner’s office from all municipal police departments and RCMP detachments in B.C. through requests for information.
- 238 Kundera Provost-Yombi, Cynthia Loudon, and Susan McDonald, “Hate as an Aggravating Factor at Sentencing. A Review of the Case Law from 2007–2020,” *Department of Justice Canada*, 2020, p. 6, https://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2021/jus/J4-101-2020-eng.pdf.
- 239 West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission,” p. 7; BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Gender-Based Violence,” 2022, p. 10.
- 240 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Gender-Based Violence,” 2022, p. 7.
- 241 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 33.
- 242 Native Women’s Association of Canada, 2021, p. 6; Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 23.
- 243 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 23.
- 244 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 31.
- 245 As cited by West Coast LEAF, “Written submission,” p. 5; Trudell and Whitmore, *Pandemic Meets Pandemic*, 2020.
- 246 Katie DeRosa, “As ‘revenge porn’ spikes during pandemic, B.C. aims to crack down with legislation,” *Vancouver Sun*, May 2021, <https://vancouversun.com/news/local-news/as-revenge-porn-spikes-during-pandemic-b-c-aims-to-crack-down-with-legislation>; West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission,” p. 6.
- 247 BCOHRC Additional Public Survey Analyses (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, 2022).
- 248 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission”; Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission,” p. 3; West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission.”
- 249 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Gender-Based Violence,” 2022.
- 250 Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission,” p. 2.
- 251 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 11; Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission,” p. 3.
- 252 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 3.
- 253 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 3.
- 254 Yercich, Jackson, and MacMillan, 2022, p. 31; Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission.”
- 255 Raisa Patel, “Minister Says COVID-19 Is Empowering Domestic Violence Abusers as Rates Rise in Parts of Canada,” *CBC News*, April 27, 2020, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/domestic-violence-rates-rising-due-to-covid19-1.5545851>.
- 256 S. Bergman, M. Bjørnholt, and H. Helseth, “Norwegian shelters for victims of domestic violence in the COVID-19 pandemic: Navigating the new normal,” *Journal of Family Violence* (2021).

- 257 Women's Shelters Canada, "Special Issue: The Impact of COVID-19 on VAW Shelters and Transition Houses," *Women's Shelters Canada*, 2020, <http://endvaw.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Shelter-Voices-2020-2.pdf>.
- 258 Meera Bains, "Battered Women Support Services Asks for More Volunteers amid COVID-19 Pandemic," *CBC News*, August 29, 2020, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/battered-women-support-services-asks-for-more-volunteers-amid-covid-19-pandemic-1.5704691>.
- 259 Interior Crisis Line Network, "Supplementary Submission Material," December 16, 2021.
- 260 Rise Women's Legal Centre, "Written Submission," p. 3.
- 261 School District 22 - Vernon, "Oral Submission"; University of Victoria Student Society, "Written Submission."
- 262 University of Victoria Student Society, "Written Submission," p. 4.
- 263 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Oral Submission."
- 264 Moonshot, "Understanding and Preventing Incel Violence in Canada," *Moonshot*, 2021, p. 4, https://149736141.v2.pressablecdn.com/wp-content/uploads/Public-Report_Understanding-and-Preventing-Incel-Violence-in-Canada_Moonshot-2.pdf.
- 265 Moonshot, 2021, p. 8.
- 266 Moonshot, 2021, p. 21.
- 267 Moonshot, 2021, p. 15.
- 268 Joan Smith, "What Do Many Terrorists Have in Common? They Abuse Women," *The Guardian*, 2021, <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2021/aug/05/many-terrorists-abuse-women-research-extremist-attackers-violent-misogyny>.
- 269 Jude McCulloch and Jane Maree Maher, "The Intimate Connection between Mass Shootings and Violence against Women," *Policy Options*, 2022, <https://policyoptions.irpp.org/magazines/may-2020/the-intimate-connection-between-mass-shootings-and-violence-against-women/>.
- 270 Jade McCulloch and Jane Maree Maher, 2022.
- 271 Jade McCulloch and Jane Maree Maher, 2022.
- 272 Elizabeth Renzetti, "Opinion: Misogyny Is Often behind the Acts We Deem 'Senseless'," *The Globe and Mail*, 2020, <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/opinion/article-misogyny-is-often-behind-the-acts-we-deem-senseless/>.
- 273 Rachel Bergen, "3 First Nations Women, 1 Unidentified Woman Were Victims of Alleged Serial Killer: Winnipeg Police," *CBC News*, 2022, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/manitoba/jeremy-skibicki-winnipeg-serial-killings-1.6670849>.
- 274 Prevent is a national safeguarding program that supports people who are at risk of becoming involved with terrorism through radicalization.
- 275 Smith, 2021.
- 276 Renzetti, 2020.
- 277 Rise Women's Legal Centre, "Written Submission," p. 1.
- 278 MacDougall, "B.C.'s Human-Rights Inquiry into Hate Incidents Better Late Than Never," 2021.
- 279 MacDougall, 2021.
- 280 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 7.
- 281 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 11.
- 282 Rise Women's Legal Centre, "Written Submission," p. 1.
- 283 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 7.
- 284 F. M. Lawrence, "Prepared testimony on hate-crime legislation before the House Committee on the Judiciary," *Federal News Service of the Federal Information Systems Corp.*, 1999.
- 285 Mélissa Blais and Francis Dupuis-Déri, "The Montréal Massacre Is Finally Recognized as an Anti-Feminist Attack," *The Conversation*, December 6, 2019, <https://theconversation.com/the-montreal-massacre-is-finally-recognized-as-an-anti-feminist-attack-128450>.
- 286 *Reclaiming Power and Place*, 2019.

- 287 Shivangi Misra, Ashley Major, Pamela Palmater, and Shelagh Day, *The Toxic Culture of the RCMP: Misogyny, Racism, and Violence Against Women in Canada's National Police Force*, The Canadian Feminist Alliance for International Action, 2022, <https://fafia-afai.org/en/a-report-on-the-toxic-culture-of-misogyny-racism-and-violence-in-the-rcmp/>.
- 288 This is based on statistics compiled from annual reports on police-reported hate crimes published by Statistics Canada, 2006–2020. Statistics Canada recommends using this data with caution as the police-reported data prior to 2009 was inconsistent.
- 289 Marian Duggan, “A Socio-Legal Analysis of Gender-Based Victimization, Misogyny and the Hate Crime Paradigm in England and Wales,” in *Studies in Law, Politics, and Society*, ed. Austin Sarat (Emerald Publishing Limited, 2021), p. 101–128, <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1059-433720210000085006>; Barbara Perry and Shahid Alvi, “‘We Are All Vulnerable’: The In Terrorem Effects of Hate Crimes,” *International Review of Victimology* 18, no. 1 (2012): 57–71, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269758011422475>.
- 290 Jane Maree Maher, Judith McCulloch, and Gail Mason, “Punishing Gendered Violence as Hate Crime: Aggravated Sentences as a Means of Recognising Hate as Motivation for Violent Crimes against Women,” *The Australian Feminist Law Journal* 41, no. 1 (2015): 177–93, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13200968.2015.1040148>.
- 291 Chih Hoong Sin, “Hate Crime against People with Disabilities,” in *The Routledge International Handbook on Hate Crime* (Routledge, 2014), p. 193–206.
- 292 Sin, 2014, p. 202.
- 293 Chih Hoong Sin et al., “Disabled People’s Experiences of Targeted Violence and Hostility,” *Equality and Human Rights Commission*, Research Report 2009, https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/research_report_21_disabled_people_s_experiences_of_targeted_violence_and_hostility.pdf; see also Jane C. Healy, “‘It Spreads Like a Creeping Disease’: Experiences of Victims of Disability Hate Crimes in Austerity Britain,” *Disability & Society* 35, no. 2 (February 7, 2020): p. 176–200, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09687599.2019.1624151>.
- 294 Sin, 2014.
- 295 Sin, 2014.
- 296 Michelle McCarthy, “‘What Kind of Abuse Is Him Spitting in My Food?’: Reflections on the Similarities between Disability Hate Crime, so-Called ‘Mate’ Crime and Domestic Violence against Women with Intellectual Disabilities,” *Disability & Society* 32, no. 4 (April 21, 2017): 595–600, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09687599.2017.1301854>.
- 297 Heather Walkus, “Inquiry Submission,” 2022.
- 298 Keith D. Gordon, *A Report Card on Vision Health in Canada - The Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Canadians Who Are Blind, Deaf-Blind or Partially Sighted 2022*, Canadian Council of the Blind and Fighting Blindness Canada, October 2022, p. 44.
- 299 Sonia Alimi and Jihan Abbas, “Parliamentary Brief - The Impact of COVID-19 on Women Living with Disabilities in Canada,” *DisAbled Women’s Network of Canada*, June 22, 2020, p. 7, https://dawnncanada.net/media/uploads/page_data/page-63/parliamentary_brief_covid_19_june_22nd_2020.pdf.
- 300 Alimi and Abbas, 2020.
- 301 Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission.”
- 302 First United Church, “Oral Submission”; Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 303 First United Church, “Oral Submission.”
- 304 First United Church, “Oral Submission.”
- 305 First United Church, “Oral Submission.”
- 306 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 307 Health Justice, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 30, 2022), p. 9.
- 308 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 309 Cotter, 2021, p. 11.
- 310 Cotter, 2021, p. 11.
- 311 Cotter, 2021, p. 11.
- 312 Statistics Canada “Police-reported hate crime, by type of motivation, Canada (selected police services),” *Statistics Canada*, 2022 <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl/en/tv.action?pid=3510006601>.

- 313 First United Church, “Oral Submission”; Health Justice, “Oral Submission”; Health Justice, “Written Submission”; Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 314 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 315 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 316 Health Justice, “Written Submission.”
- 317 Health Justice, “Written Submission.”
- 318 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 319 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 320 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 321 Amy Judd, “3 Dead Including Suspect in String of Shootings in Langley, B.C.: Shooter’s Identity Released,” *Global News*, July 25, 2022, <https://globalnews.ca/news/9013252/multiple-shootings-langley-civil-emergency-alert-text/>.
- 322 The Canadian Press, “Vancouver Police Say Woman Deliberately Burned Monday in Attack,” *The Record*, July 27, 2022, <https://www.therecord.com/ts/news/canada/2022/07/27/vancouver-police-say-woman-deliberately-burned-monday-in-attack.html>.
- 323 Liam Britten, “Flyers Threatening Arson against Homeless People and Drug Users Being Investigated by Vancouver Police,” *CBC News*, August 15, 2022, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/dtes-threat-letters-1.6552158>.
- 324 The motivations in the police-reported hate incident data the Commissioner received include age, disability, language, race or ethnicity, religion, gender, sexual orientation, or another similar factor.
- 325 Martine Lagacé et al. for the Federal, Provincial and Territorial Forum of Ministers Responsible for Seniors, “A case study on ageism during the COVID-19 pandemic,” *Government of Canada*, February 2022, <https://statics.teams.cdn.office.net/evergreen-assets/safelinks/1/atp-safelinks.html>.
- 326 Lindsay Maughan, “Younger People and Ageism During Covid-19,” *Ageing Equal*, September 14, 2020, <https://ageing-equal.org/younger-people-and-ageism-during-covid-19ageism-is-not-ok-except-when-it-is/>.
- 327 Lagacé et al., 2022, p. 4.
- 328 Lagacé et al., 2022, p. 4.
- 329 Office of the Seniors Advocate, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 28, 2022).
- 330 Office of the Seniors Advocate, “Oral Submission.”
- 331 Liat Ayalon et al., “Aging in Times of the COVID-19 Pandemic: Avoiding Ageism and Fostering Intergenerational Solidarity,” *The Journals of Gerontology: Series B* 76, no. 2 (January 18, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.1093/geronb/gbaa051>; Sarah Fraser et al., “Ageism and COVID-19: What Does Our Society’s Response Say about Us?,” *Age and Ageing* 49, no. 5 (August 24, 2020): 692–95, <https://doi.org/10.1093/ageing/afaa097>.
- 332 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 333 Society for Children and Youth of BC, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 29, 2022), p. 2.
- 334 Office of the Seniors Advocate, *Hidden and Invisible: Seniors Abuse and Neglect in British Columbia*, Office of the Seniors Advocate, December 2021, <https://www.seniorsadvocatebc.ca/osa-reports/hidden-and-invisible-report/>.
- 335 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 336 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 337 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 338 Radical Action with Migrants in Agriculture and Sanctuary Health, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 9, 2021).
- 339 Radical Action with Migrants in Agriculture and Sanctuary Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 340 Radical Action with Migrants in Agriculture and Sanctuary Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 341 Radical Action with Migrants in Agriculture and Sanctuary Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 342 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”

- 343 Ipsos, *Online Harm in Journalism*, Ipsos, Research Report, November 8, 2021, p. 5, <https://site-cbc.radio-canada.ca/documents/media-centre/lpsos-Online-Harm-in-Journalism-Report.pdf>.
- 344 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 345 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 346 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 347 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 348 Tusikov, “Oral Submission.”
- 349 BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission.”
- 350 Retail Council of Canada, “Oral Submission.”
- 351 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission”; BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission.”
- 352 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission”; Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission.”
- 353 Unifor, “Oral Submission”; Retail Council of Canada, “Oral Submission”; Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission”; BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission.”
- 354 Retail Council of Canada, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 31, 2022), p. 2.
- 355 Retail Council of Canada, “Written Submission,” p. 2.
- 356 Retail Council of Canada, “Written Submission,” p. 1.
- 357 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 358 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 359 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 360 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 27.
- 361 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 27.
- 362 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 32.
- 363 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission.”
- 364 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission.”
- 365 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 33.
- 366 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 10, 2022).
- 367 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 368 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 369 West Coast Prison Justice Society, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 3, 2022).
- 370 West Coast Prison Justice Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 371 Due to the subjectivity inherent in the methodology, the different definition of “hate incident” used to categorize this data, and differences in the format of data provided across health authorities, the results can only be used to identify broad trends.
- 372 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 373 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, “Oral Submissions.”
- 374 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 375 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 376 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission”; School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission.”
- 377 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 378 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission”; Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 379 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 380 University of Victoria Student Society, “Written Submission”; Klautt Law, “Oral Submission”; Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission.”

- 381 BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission”; Society for Children and Youth of BC, “Written Submission”; Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 382 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission.”
- 383 Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission,” p. 4.
- 384 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 385 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 386 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission.”
- 387 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 388 Emily K. Jenkins et al., “A Portrait of the Early and Differential Mental Health Impacts of the COVID-19 Pandemic in Canada: Findings from the First Wave of a Nationally Representative Cross-Sectional Survey,” *Preventive Medicine* 145 (2021): 106333; BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Mental Health: Examining the Societal Consequences of the COVID-19 Pandemic” *BC Centre for Disease Control and Office of the Provincial Health Officer*, 2021, http://www.bccdc.ca/Health-Professionals-Site/Documents/societal_consequences/Mental_Health.pdf; Canadian Mental Health Association et al., *Summary of Findings: Mental Health Impacts of COVID-19 - Wave 2*, Canadian Mental Health Association, August 2021, <https://cmha.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CMHA-UBC-wave-2-Summary-of-Findings-FINAL-EN.pdf>; Conducted by Leger for the Canadian Centre on Substance Use and Addiction, Mental Health Commission of Canada, “Mental Health and Substance Use During COVID-19 Final Summary Report: Regional Spotlight and Key Characteristics,” 2022, <https://mentalhealthcommission.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/Leger-poll-Regional-Spotlight-and-Key-Factors.pdf>.
- 389 SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission”; Klautt Law, “Oral Submission”; Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, “Supplementary Submission Material”; Unifor, “Oral Submission”; Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission.”
- 390 Michelle Guerrero and Joel Barnes, “Profiles of Mental Health and Their Association with Negative Impacts and Suicidal Ideation during the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Canadian Perspective” *Statistics Canada*, 2022, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/82-003-x/2022008/article/00002-eng.htm>.
- 391 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission”; Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, “Supplementary Submission Material”; DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission”; Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission”; Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 392 Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 18, 2022).
- 393 Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission.”
- 394 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 395 BCCDC and Office of the PHO, “Mental Health,” 2021. This report was conducted late April to early May 2020. Fifty-three per cent of respondents living in B.C. aged 15 and over reported worse mental health compared to before COVID-19 physical distancing measures began. Similarly, in BCCDC’s COVID-19 SPEAK Survey, conducted in May 2020, 47% of B.C. residents aged 18 and older reported worse mental health since the beginning of the pandemic.
- 396 Interior Crisis Line Network, “Supplementary Submission Material” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 16, 2021).
- 397 Statistics Canada, “Survey on COVID-19 and Mental Health, February to May 2021,” *The Daily*, September 27, 2021, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/daily-quotidien/210927/dq210927a-eng.pdf?st=kXOUxdtY>.
- 398 BCCDC Foundation for Public Health and BC Centre for Disease Control, “Summary: BC COVID-19 SPEAK Round 2 Data Provides Insight into How People in B.C. Are Coping with Pandemic,” *BCCDC*, December 6, 2021, http://www.bccdc.ca/Health-Info-Site/Documents/SPEAK/SPEAK_Round2_Summary.pdf.
- 399 Conducted by Leger for the Canadian Centre on Substance Use and Addiction, Mental Health Commission of Canada, “Mental Health and Substance Use During COVID-19 Final Summary Report,” 2022; see survey data from the Angus Reid Institute for similar results over the course of the pandemic, with one-third of respondents self-reporting mental health difficulties in March 2022: Angus Reid Institute, “Two Years of COVID-19: Half of Canadians Say Their Mental Health Has Worsened; Women under 55 Hit Hardest,” *Angus Reid Institute*, March 11, 2022, https://angusreid.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/2022.03.11_COVID_Anniversary_Mental_Health.pdf.
- 400 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 401 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”

- 402 Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission,” p. 4.
- 403 Society for Children and Youth of BC, “Written Submission,” p. 4.
- 404 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, “Supplementary Submission Material,” p. 4.
- 405 West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission.”
- 406 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission”; Youth Talk Nation, “Oral Submission”; Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 407 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 408 BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission,” p. 2–3.
- 409 Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission,” p. 4.
- 410 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 411 Collingwood Neighbourhood House, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, November 25, 2021).
- 412 Kelowna Community Resources Part 2, “Oral Submission.”
- 413 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 414 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission”; SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 415 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 416 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl’etinqox First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 417 “In Plain Sight: Addressing Indigenous-Specific Racism and Discrimination in B.C. Health Care,” November 2020, <https://engage.gov.bc.ca/app/uploads/sites/613/2020/11/In-Plain-Sight-Summary-Report.pdf>.
- 418 SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 419 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 420 Chief Fred Robbins, Esk’etemc First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 421 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 422 Canadian Union of Public Employees, “Written Submission.”
- 423 Chief Fred Robbins, Esk’etemc First Nation, “Oral Submission”; Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission.”
- 424 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 425 EliminateHate, “Oral Submission.”
- 426 Klauert Law, “Oral Submission.”
- 427 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 428 project 1907, “Oral Submission.”
- 429 project 1907, “Oral Submission.”
- 430 Kelowna Community Resources Part 2, “Oral Submission.”
- 431 Tusikov, “Oral Submission.”
- 432 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 433 BC Teachers’ Federation, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 29, 2022), p. 23.
- 434 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 23.
- 435 Public Policy Forum, *Harms Reduction: A Six-Step Program to Protect Democratic Expression Online* (Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Commission on Democratic Expression, January 2021), p. 22.
- 436 Jonathon Penney, “Online Abuse, Chilling Effects, and Human Rights,” in *Citizenship in a Connected Canada: A Research and Policy Agenda, Law, Technology, and Media*, ed. Elizabeth Dubois and Florian Martin-Bariteau (Ottawa, Ontario: University of Ottawa Press, 2020), <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3620520>.
- 437 Penney, “Online Abuse, Chilling Effects, and Human Rights,” , 2020, p. 211–212.
- 438 Maria Ressa quoted by Steven Colbert, Twitter Post, November 29, 2022, <https://twitter.com/colbertlateshow/status/1597825250028306433>.

- 439 Mark Lamoreux, “Here Are the Far-Right Conspiracists the Quebec City Mosque Shooter Followed,” *Vice*, April 16, 2018, <https://www.vice.com/en/article/ywxeyg/here-are-the-far-right-conspiracists-the-quebec-city-mosque-shooter-followed>.
- 440 Public Policy Forum, *Harms Reduction*, 2021, p. 11.
- 441 Dr. Chris Tenove and Dr. Heidi Tworek, “Online Hate in the Pandemic,” June 2022, p. 10; see also Suzie Dunn, *Technology-Facilitated Gender-Based Violence: An Overview, Supporting a Safer Internet* (Waterloo: Centre for International Governance Innovation, 2020).
- 442 Tenove and Tworek, “Online Hate in the Pandemic,” 2022, p. 8–9.
- 443 Howard Bioldeau, Abby Kehler, and Nicole Minnema, “Internet Use and COVID-19: How the Pandemic Increased the Amount of Time Canadians Spend Online,” *Statistics Canada*, June 24, 2021, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/45-28-0001/2021001/article/00027-eng.htm>.
- 444 Philip Mai and Anatoliy Gruz, “The State of Social Media in Canada 2022,” *Social Media Lab Toronto Metropolitan University*, 2022, <https://doi.org/10.6084/M9.FIGSHARE.21002848>.
- 445 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request,” April 22, 2022.
- 446 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission” (\ BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 14, 2022).
- 447 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 448 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 449 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 450 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 451 Media Smarts, “Deconstructing Online Hate,” *Media Smarts*, n.d., <https://mediasmarts.ca/online-hate/deconstructing-online-hate>.
- 452 Media Smarts, “Deconstructing Online Hate.”
- 453 Media Smarts, “Deconstructing Online Hate.”
- 454 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 16.
- 455 Global BC, “About Global BC,” *Global News*, n.d., <https://globalnews.ca/pages/about-global-bc/>.
- 456 Global News, “Global News Commenting Policy,” *Global News*, n.d., <https://globalnews.ca/pages/global-news-commenting-policy/>.
- 457 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 9.
- 458 Public Policy Forum, “How to Make Online Platforms More Transparent and Accountable to Canadian Users,” *Canadian Commission on Democratic Expression*, May 2022, p. 19, <https://ppforum.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/DemX-2-English-May-4.pdf>.
- 459 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission,” , p. 4.
- 460 Statistics Canada, “Police-reported crime statistics in Canada, 2020,” *Statistics Canada*, July 27, 2021, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2021001/article/00013-eng.htm>.
- 461 Meta responded to a variation of this question.
- 462 Meta Platforms, Inc., “Response to Information Request,” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, July 29, 2022).
- 463 These numbers represent initial removals. Some content was restored after appeal.
- 464 Meta Transparency Center, “Community Standards Enforcement Report,” *Meta*, <https://transparency.fb.com/data/community-standards-enforcement/>.
- 465 Meta Transparency Center, “Community Standards Enforcement Report, August 2020,” *Meta*, 2020, <https://about.fb.com/news/2020/08/community-standards-enforcement-report-aug-2020/>. “Despite the impact of COVID-19, improvements to our technology enabled us to take action on more content in some areas and increase our proactive detection rate in others. Our proactive detection rate for hate speech on Facebook increased 6 points from 89% to 95%. In turn, the amount of content we took action on increased from 9.6 million in Q1 to 22.5 million in Q2. This is because we expanded some of our automation technology in Spanish, Arabic and Indonesian and made improvements to our English detection technology in Q1. In Q2, improvements to our automation capabilities helped us take action on more content in English, Spanish and Burmese. On Instagram, our proactive detection rate for hate speech increased 39 points from 45% to 84% and the amount of content we took action on increased from 808,900 in Q1 2020 to 3.3 million in Q2. These increases were driven by expanding our proactive detection technologies in English and Spanish.”

- 466 Google LLC, "Response to Order to Produce Records," (BCOHR Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, August 19, 2022).
- 467 Twitter Transparency Center, "Rules Enforcement," *Twitter*, July–December 2021, <https://transparency.twitter.com/en/reports/rules-enforcement.html>.
- 468 TikTok Transparency Center, "Reports," *TikTok*, n.d., <https://www.tiktok.com/transparency/en-us/reports/>.
- 469 Reddit, "Transparency Report 2021," *Reddit*, 2021, <https://www.redditinc.com/policies/transparency-report-2021-2/>.
- 470 Mackenzie Hart et al., "An Online Environmental Scan of Right-Wing Extremism in Canada," *Institute for Strategic Dialogue*, 2021, p. 6, <https://www.isdglobal.org/isd-publications/canada-online/>.
- 471 Center for Countering Digital Hate, "Fact Check: Musk's Claim about a Fall in Hate Speech Doesn't Stand up to Scrutiny," *CCDH*, November 10, 2022, <https://counterhate.com/blog/fact-check-musks-claim-about-a-fall-in-hate-speech-doesnt-stand-up-to-scrutiny/>.
- 472 Center on Extremism, "Extremists, Far Right Figures Exploit Recent Changes to Twitter," *Anti-Defamation League (ADL)*, December 2, 2022, <https://www.adl.org/resources/blog/extremists-far-right-figures-exploit-recent-changes-twitter>.
- 473 Dean Obeidallah, "Opinion: Elon Musk's Twitter Is Helping to Normalize a Neo-Nazi," *CNN*, December 5, 2022, <https://www.cnn.com/2022/12/05/opinions/elon-musk-twitter-obeidallah/index.html>.
- 474 "Stop Hate for Profit," *Stop Hate for Profit*, n.d., <https://www.stophateforprofit.org/>.
- 475 Heidi Tworek, "Social Media Platforms and the Upside of Ignorance," *Centre for International Governance Innovation*, September 9, 2019, <https://www.cigionline.org/articles/social-media-platforms-and-upside-ignorance/>.
- 476 Lee Rainie, Janna Anderson, and Jonathan Albright, "The Future of Free Speech, Trolls, Anonymity and Fake News Online," *Pew Research Center*, March 29, 2017, <https://www.pewresearch.org/internet/2017/03/29/the-future-of-free-speech-trolls-anonymity-and-fake-news-online/>.
- 477 Tusikov, "Oral Submission," p. 3.
- 478 Tusikov, "Oral Submission," p. 3.
- 479 As of December 8, 2022, the case is pending adjudication by the US Supreme Court.
- 480 As of December 8, 2022, the case is pending adjudication by the US Supreme Court.
- 481 Digivizer, "Your Guide to Social Media Ad Algorithms," *Digivizer*, May 27, 2020, <https://digivizer.com/blog/your-guide-to-social-media-ad-algorithms/>.
- 482 Public Policy Forum, *Harms Reduction*, 2021, p. 44.
- 483 Scott Pelley, "Facebook Whistleblower Frances Haugen Details Company's Misleading Efforts on 60 Minutes – CBS News," October 4, 2021, <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/facebook-whistleblower-frances-haugen-misinformation-public-60-minutes-2021-10-03/>.
- 484 Amanda Connolly, "Incels are targeting 'next generation of extremists' online. Could algorithm reform help?" *Global News*, January 19, 2022, <https://globalnews.ca/news/8508795/canada-social-media-algorithm-reform/>.
- 485 Kevin Roose, "The Making of a YouTube Radical," *The New York Times*, June 8, 2019, <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2019/06/08/technology/youtube-radical.html?mtrref=undefined&gwh=3532DA89955CE206F35DA4DB2C5D41AD&gwt=pay&assetType=PAYWALL>.
- 486 Kevin Roose, 2019.
- 487 Kalev Leetaru, "What Does It Mean For Social Media Platforms to 'Sell' Our Data?" *Forbes*, December 15, 2018, <https://www.forbes.com/sites/kalevleetaru/2018/12/15/what-does-it-mean-for-social-media-platforms-to-sell-our-data/?sh=214ae4662d6c>.
- 488 Digivizer, "Your Guide to Social Media Ad Algorithms," *Digivizer*, 2020.
- 489 Google LLC, "Response to Order to Produce Records."
- 490 TikTok, "Response to Order to Produce Records" (BCOHR Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, September 12, 2022).
- 491 TikTok, "Response to Order to Produce Records."
- 492 Scott Pelley, 2021.
- 493 Tusikov, "Oral Submission," p. 3.

- 494 Dr. Tanner Mirrlees, “Supplementary Submission Material” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 10, 2022); #RemoveKebab is an example of far-right actors using code words to evade content moderation which is very difficult for social media companies to keep up with.
- 495 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission.”
- 496 Heidi Beirish, Ph.D. and Wendy Via, “The Landscape of Cross-Border Ideologically Motivated Extremist Movements in Canada and the United States: How to Counter This Burgeoning Threat to Inclusive Democracy,” *Global Project Against Hate and Extremism*, Written Testimony Before the House of Commons’ Standing Committee on Public Safety and National Security, April 2022, p. 5, <https://globalextrmism.org/post/the-landscape-of-cross-border-ideologically-motivated-extremist-movements-in-canada-and-the-united-states/>.
- 497 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 24, 2022).
- 498 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission”; Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 499 In the case study “Hate and the COVID-19 pandemic – An analysis of B.C. Twitter discourse” in Tenove and Tworek (2022), counterspeech is defined as “speech that seeks to oppose, refute or undermine hateful speech.”
- 500 Tenove and Tworek, 2022, p. 21.
- 501 Tusikov, “Oral Submission,” p. 2.
- 502 TikTok, “Response to Order to Produce Records.”
- 503 Google LLC, “Response to Order to Produce Records.”
- 504 TikTok, “Response to Order to Produce Records.”
- 505 Andrew Pel, “Harmful Narratives as a Catalyst for IMVE - Prevention Approaches,” Conference Presentation, December 2022.
- 506 “Facebook Profits from White Supremacist Groups,” *Tech Transparency Project*, 2022, <https://www.techtransparencyproject.org/articles/facebook-profits-white-supremacist-groups>.
- 507 “About Us,” *Tech Transparency Project*, n.d., <https://www.techtransparencyproject.org/about-us>.
- 508 Suchetha Siddagangappa, “Facebook’s Unofficial, Unauthorized, and Unwanted Business Pages Are Weird and Annoying,” *OneZero*, November 14, 2019, <https://onezero.medium.com/facebooks-unofficial-pages-unofficial-unauthorized-and-unwanted-85ac73e09c2>; Facebook auto-generates pages for businesses and organizations that don’t have an official presence on its platform.
- 509 Laura Murphy and Megan Cacace, *Facebook’s Civil Rights Audit - Final Report*, Meta, July 8, 2020, <https://about.fb.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Civil-Rights-Audit-Final-Report.pdf>.
- 510 Tech Transparency Project, “Facebook Profits from White Supremacist Groups,” 2022.
- 511 *Libman v. The Queen* [1985] 2 SCR 178.
- 512 *The Constitution Act, 1867*, 30 & 31 Vict, c 3, <https://canlii.ca/t/ldsw>.
- 513 House of Commons of Canada, *Bill C-36, An Act to amend the Criminal Code and the Canadian Human Rights Act and to make related amendments to another Act (hate propaganda, hate crimes and hate speech)*, Parliament of Canada, 43rd Parliament, 2nd session, 2021 (as first read by the House of Commons 23 June 2021), <https://parl.ca/DocumentViewer/en/43-2/bill/C-36/first-reading>.
- 514 Government of Canada, “What We Heard: The Government’s proposed approach to address harmful content online,” *Government of Canada*, January 21, 2022, <https://www.canada.ca/en/canadian-heritage/campaigns/harmful-online-content/what-we-heard.html>.
- 515 *Oger v. Whatcott* (No. 7), 2019 BCHRT 58, at para. 215; *Saskatchewan (Human Rights Comm.) v. Whatcott*, 2013 SCC 11, at paras. 70-77.
- 516 MGLP Rechtsanwälte Attorneys-at-Law, “The New Legislation Against Online Hate Speech – A Brief Overview,” MGLP, 2021, <https://www.mglp.eu/en/the-new-legislation-against-online-hate-speech-a-brief-overview/>.
- 517 The Act does not specifically mention hate speech, but contains provisions on how online services should deal with illegal content.
- 518 “About Christchurch Call,” *Christchurch Call*, n.d., <https://www.christchurchcall.com/about/>.

- 519 Privacy Commissioner of Canada (OPC), the Commission d'accès à l'information du Québec (CAI), the Information and Privacy Commissioner for British Columbia (OIPC BC), and the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Alberta (OIPC AB), *Report of Findings – Joint Investigation of Clearview AI, Inc.*, OIPC, 2021, p. 13, <https://www.oipc.bc.ca/investigation-reports/3505>.
- 520 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 521 Barbara Perry, “A Crime by Any Other Name: The Semantics of ‘Hate,’” *Journal of Hate Studies* 4 (2005): 125.
- 522 This excerpt from Barbara Perry’s “The Roots of Hate” draws on a theoretical framework developed by Iris Marion Young, an American feminist political scientist.
- 523 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 524 Hon. John McKay, Chair, “Systemic Racism in Policing in Canada: Report of the Standing Committee on Public Safety and National Security,” *House of Commons Canada*, 43rd Parliament, 2nd session, 2021, p. 34–38, <https://www.ourcommons.ca/Content/Committee/432/SECU/Reports/RP11434998/securep06/securep06-e.pdf>; Special Committee on Reforming the Police Act, “Committee Meeting Details: Friday, February 26, 2021,” *Legislative Assembly of British Columbia*, Minutes of Proceeding, 42nd Parliament, 1st session, Issue No. 12, 2021, p. 186, <https://www.leg.bc.ca/parliamentary-business/committees-calendar/20210226-rpa-0900>.
- 525 UBC First Nations and Indigenous Studies, “Indigenous Foundations - Reserves,” *indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca*, 2009, <https://indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca/reserves/>.
- 526 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 527 Interior Crisis Line Network (and BC Crisis Line Network), “Oral Submission.”
- 528 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General Policing and Community Safety Branch, “Referral Policy for Victims of Power-Based Crimes: Family Violence, Sexual Assault and Criminal Harassment,” *Government of British Columbia*, January 2007, <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/law-crime-and-justice/criminal-justice/victims-of-crime/vs-info-for-professionals/info-resources/power-based-crimes-referral-policy.pdf>.
- 529 West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission.”
- 530 Margaret Mitchell, *No Laughing Matter: Adventure, Activism & Politics* (Vancouver: Granville Island Publishing Ltd, 2008), p. xii.
- 531 Stephen M. Croucher, “Integrated Threat Theory and Acceptance of Immigrant Assimilation: An Analysis of Muslim Immigration in Western Europe,” *Communication Monographs* 80, no. 1 (2013): 46–62; Stephen M. Croucher, Thao Nguyen, and Diyako Rahmani, “Prejudice Toward Asian Americans in the Covid-19 Pandemic: The Effects of Social Media Use in the United States,” *Frontiers in Communication* 5 (June 12, 2020): 39, <https://doi.org/10.3389/fcomm.2020.00039>.
- 532 Donald P. Green, Dara Z. Strolovitch, and Janelle S. Wong, “Defended Neighborhoods, Integration, and Racially Motivated Crime,” *American Journal of Sociology* 104, no. 2 (1998): 372–403; Horst Entorf and Martin Lange, “Refugees Welcome? Understanding the Regional Heterogeneity of Anti-Foreigner Hate Crimes in Germany,” Scholarly Paper, Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network, January 30, 2019, <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3343191>.
- 533 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission”; Tusikov, “Oral Submission.”
- 534 Emma Hanes and Stephen Machin, “Hate Crime in the Wake of Terror Attacks: Evidence from 7/7 and 9/11,” *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice* 30, no. 3 (2014): 247–67; Daniel Devine, “Discrete Events and Hate Crimes: The Causal Role of the Brexit Referendum,” *Social Science Quarterly* 102, no. 1 (2021): 374–86, <https://doi.org/10.1111/ssqu.12896>; Sylwia J. Piatkowska and Brendan Lantz, “Temporal Clustering of Hate Crimes in the Aftermath of the Brexit Vote and Terrorist Attacks: A Comparison of Scotland and England and Wales,” *The British Journal of Criminology* 61, no. 3 (May 1, 2021): 648–69, <https://doi.org/10.1093/bjc/azaa090>; Sylwia J. Piatkowska and Brian J. Stults, “Brexit, Terrorist Attacks, and Hate Crime: A Longitudinal Analysis,” *Social Problems* 69, no. 4 (2022): 968–996.
- 535 Ria Ivandic, Tom Kirchmaier, and Stephen Machin, *Jihadi Attacks, Media and Local Hate Crime*, IZA Discussion Papers, Bonn: Institute of Labor Economics (IZA), 2019, <https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/202698/1/dp12352.pdf>.
- 536 Erin M. Kearns, Allison E. Betus, and Anthony F. Lemieux, “Why Do Some Terrorist Attacks Receive More Media Attention than Others?” *Justice Quarterly* 36, no. 6 (2019): 985–1022.
- 537 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 538 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 539 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”

- 540 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl'etinqox First Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 541 Health Justice, "Oral Submission."
- 542 project 1907, "Oral Submission."
- 543 Mirrlees, "Oral Submission."
- 544 Health Justice, "Oral Submission."
- 545 ADL, "Pyramid of Hate," ADL, 2018, <https://www.adl.org/sites/default/files/documents/pyramid-of-hate.pdf>.
- 546 Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 547 DIVERSEcity, "Oral Submission."
- 548 Barbara Perry and Stanislav Vysotsky, "The roots of hate in British Columbia: Past and present," *British Columbia's Office of the Human Rights Commissioner*, 2022, p. 16, https://hateinquiry.bchumanrights.ca/wp-content/uploads/The-roots-of-hate-in-British-Columbia-by-Dr.-Perry-Dr.-Vysotsky_BCOHRCs-Inquiry-into-hate-in-the-pandemic.pdf.
- 549 Perry and Vysotsky, "The roots of hate in British Columbia," 2022, p. 9.
- 550 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 551 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, "Oral Submission"; Eliminate Hate, "Oral Submission"; project 1907, "Oral Submission"; Youth Talk Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 552 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, "Oral Submission"; project 1907, "Oral Submission."
- 553 Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 554 Perry and Vysotsky, "The Roots of Hate in British Columbia," 2022, p. 19.
- 555 Hua Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 556 Barbara Perry, *In the Name of Hate: Understanding Hate Crime* (Routledge, 2001), p. 244.
- 557 Canadian Union of Public Employees, "Oral Submission".
- 558 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl'etinqox First Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 559 Chief Fred Robbins, Esk'etemc First Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 560 SNIWWOC, "Oral Submission."
- 561 Chief Fred Robbins, Esk'etemc First Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 562 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl'etinqox First Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 563 Mirrlees, "Oral Submission."
- 564 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, "Oral Submission."
- 565 Health Justice, "Written Submission."
- 566 Health Justice, "Written Submission."
- 567 Health Justice, "Written Submission."
- 568 Health Justice, "Written Submission."
- 569 Health Justice, "Written Submission."
- 570 Perry and Vysotsky, 2022, p. 14.
- 571 Health Justice, "Written Submission," p. 10.
- 572 Health Justice, "Oral Submission."
- 573 Health Justice, "Oral Submission."
- 574 Office of the Seniors Advocate, "Oral Submission."
- 575 Office of the Seniors Advocate, "Oral Submission."
- 576 Society for Children and Youth of BC, "Written Submission."
- 577 Society for Children and Youth of BC, "Written Submission," p. 5.

- 578 First United Church, “Oral Submission”; Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission”; Elim8Hate, “Oral Submission”; Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission”; Canadian Human Rights Commission, “Oral Submission” (BCOHR Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 7, 2022).
- 579 Canadian Human Rights Commission, “Oral Submission.”
- 580 For example, in the 1890s the Bubonic plague outbreak led to rioting in India when the populace feared that the British were responsible for spreading the disease; see: Steven Taylor, *The Psychology of Pandemics: Preparing for the Next Global Outbreak of Infectious Disease* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publisher, 2019). Other examples include the massacre of Jews who were believed to have poisoned wells leading to the spread of the Black Death as well as the arrest of lepers and poor persons who were tortured into giving confessions accepting responsibility for the spread of the plague, and consequently subjected to severe punishments in 14th century Europe; see: Albert Winkler, “The Medieval Holocaust: The Approach of the Plague and the Destruction of Jews in Germany, 1348–1349,” *Federation of East European Family History Societies vol. XIII*, 2005, p. 6–24. Also, in the 1980s, Haitians were accused of spreading Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS) in the United States see: Paul Farmer, “AIDS and Accusation: Haiti and the Geography of Blame,” *Comparative Studies of Health Systems and Medical Care* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006). For a more detailed historical account of the link between blame and pandemics, see the “Anxiety and fear as drivers of hate in the pandemic” section.
- 581 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission.”
- 582 Steven Taylor, “The Psychology of Pandemics,” *Annual Review of Clinical Psychology* 18, no. 1 (May 9, 2022): 581–609.
- 583 Taylor, “The Psychology of Pandemics,” 2022.
- 584 Dorothy Nelkin and Sander L. Gilman, “Placing Blame for Devastating Disease,” *Social Research* (1988): 361–78.
- 585 Robert Crawford, “The Boundaries of the Self and the Unhealthy Other: Reflections on Health, Culture and AIDS,” *Social Science & Medicine* 38, no. 10 (1994): 1347–1365 and 1284–1295; Hélène Joffe, *Risk and the Other* (Cambridge, UK and New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 1999).
- 586 Aryati Yashadhana et al., “Pandemic-Related Racial Discrimination and Its Health Impact among Non-Indigenous Racially Minoritized Peoples in High-Income Contexts: A Systematic Review,” *Health Promotion International* (October 1, 2021); Kim Yi Dionne and Fulya Felicity Turkmen, “The Politics of Pandemic Othering: Putting COVID-19 in Global and Historical Context,” *International Organization* 74, no. S1 (December 2020): E213–30.
- 587 Stephen M. Croucher, Thao Nguyen, and Diyako Rahmani, “Prejudice Toward Asian Americans in the Covid-19 Pandemic: The Effects of Social Media Use in the United States,” *Frontiers in Communication* 5 (June 12, 2020): 39, <https://doi.org/10.3389/fcomm.2020.00039>.
- 588 Mark Schaller, Damian R. Murray, and Marlise K. Hofer, “The Behavioural Immune System and Pandemic Psychology: The Evolved Psychology of Disease-Avoidance and its Implications for Attitudes, Behaviour, and Public Health during Epidemic Outbreaks,” *European Review of Social Psychology* (November 2, 2021): 1–37.
- 589 Rowan Savage, “‘Disease Incarnate’: Biopolitical Discourse and Genocidal Dehumanisation in the Age of Modernity,” *Journal of Historical Sociology* 20, no. 3 (September 2007): 404–440.
- 590 Thomas F. Pettigrew and Linda R. Tropp, “A Meta-Analytic Test of Intergroup Contact Theory,” *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 90, no. 5 (2006): 751–783.
- 591 Sam McFarland, “Authoritarianism, Social Dominance, and Other Roots of Generalized Prejudice: Psychological Roots of Generalized Prejudice,” *Political Psychology* 31, no. 3 (June 2010): 453–477.
- 592 Joshua L. Kalla and David E. Broockman, “Which Narrative Strategies Durably Reduce Prejudice? Evidence from Field and Survey Experiments Supporting the Efficacy of Perspective-Getting,” *American Journal of Political Science* (2021).
- 593 Birte Siem, Lisa Neymeyer, and Anette Rohmann, “Entertainment Education as a Means to Reduce Anti-Muslim Prejudice — For Whom Does It Work Best? An Extended Replication of Murrar and Brauer (2018),” *Social Psychology* 52, no. 1 (2020): 51.
- 594 Jack McDevitt, Jack Levin, and Susan Bennett, “Hate Crime Offenders: An Expanded Typology,” *Journal of Social Issues* 58, no. 2 (2002): 303–317.
- 595 McDevitt, Levin, and Bennett, “Hate Crime Offenders,” 2002, p. 306.
- 596 Mark Walters, Rupert Brown, and Wiedlitzka, “Causes and Motivations of Hate Crime,” *Equality and Human Rights Commission*, 2016, p. 35; Jessica Penrose, “Understanding Who Commits Hate Crime and Why They Do It,” Welsh Government Social Research, *Welsh Government*, 2013, p. 33.

- 597 McDevitt, Levin, and Bennett, "Hate Crime Offenders," 2022, p. 308.
- 598 Jeffrey Kaplan, "Islamophobia in America?: September 11 and Islamophobic Hate Crime," *Terrorism and Political Violence* 18, no. 1 (2006): 1–33.
- 599 Yorktown Family Services, "Oral Submission."
- 600 Paul Iganski, *"Hate Crime" and the City* (Bristol: Policy Press, 2008).
- 601 Walters, Brown, and Wiedlitzka, "Causes and Motivations of Hate Crime," 2016, p. 37.
- 602 April Celeste Gould, "Hate Exhaustion, Emotional Support, and Desistance from White Supremacist Groups," *Journal of Qualitative Criminal Justice & Criminology* 10, no. 3 (May 24, 2021); see also Mehr Latif et al., "How Emotional Dynamics Maintain and Destroy White Supremacist Groups," *Humanity & Society* 42, no. 4 (November 2018): 480–501 at 492 where a member of a white supremacist group shared that being part of the group "felt just like baseline acceptance."
- 603 In supplemental submissions, Brad Galloway defines "former perpetrators of hate" and "former extremists" as individuals who subscribed to and/or perpetuated violence in the name of a particular extremist ideology and have since publicly and/or privately denounced extremist violence. In short, they no longer identify themselves as adherents of a specific extremist ideology or are affiliated with an extremist group or movement.
- 604 Gould, "Hate Exhaustion, Emotional Support, and Desistance From White Supremacist Groups"; see also: Jane Prince, "The Psychology of Hate Crime Offenders Who Target Muslims: Who Could Be a Hate Crime Offender?," in *The Routledge International Handbook of Islamophobia* (Routledge, 2019).
- 605 William B. Swann et al., "When Group Membership Gets Personal: A Theory of Identity Fusion.," *Psychological Review* 119, no. 3 (July 2012): 441–456, <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0028589>.
- 606 Klautt Law, "Oral Submission"; SNIWWOC, "Oral Submission"; Yorktown Family Services, "Oral Submission."
- 607 Yorktown Family Services, "Oral Submission."
- 608 Perry, "In the Name of Hate: Understanding Hate Crime," 2001, p. 75.
- 609 EliminateHate, "Oral Submission"; Dr. Vincent Yang, "Oral Submission," (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 7, 2021).
- 610 project 1907, "Oral Submission."
- 611 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, "Oral Submission."
- 612 Stewart Emory Tolnay and Elwood M. Beck, *A Festival of Violence: An Analysis of Southern Lynchings, 1882–1930* (University of Illinois Press, 1995); Colleen E. Mills, "Gay Visibility and Disorganized and Strained Communities: A Community-Level Analysis of Anti-Gay Hate Crime in New York City," *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 36, no. 17–18 (2021): 8070–8091; Larry Ray, David Smith, and Liz Wastell, "Shame, Rage and Racist Violence," *British Journal of Criminology* 44, no. 3 (2004): 350–368.
- 613 John Van Kesteren, "Assessing the Risk and Prevalence of Hate Crime Victimization in Western Europe," *International Review of Victimology* 22, no. 2 (May 2016) 139–160, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269758015627046>; Sylwia J. Piatkowska and Andreas Hövermann, "A Culture of Hostility and Crime Motivated by Bias: A Cross-National Multilevel Analysis of Structural Influences," *International Criminal Justice Review* 29, no. 2 (2019): 141–167.
- 614 Matti Näsi, Mikko Aaltonen, and Janne Kivivuori, "Youth Hate Crime Offending: The Role of Strain, Social Control and Self-Control Theories," *Journal of Scandinavian Studies in Criminology and Crime Prevention* 17, no. 2 (July 2, 2016) 177–184, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14043858.2016.1260332>.
- 615 Occupations are categorized as routine if they are highly repetitive with limited autonomy for the worker to decide how and when to do the work.
- 616 Thomas Kurer, "The Declining Middle: Occupational Change, Social Status, and the Populist Right," *Comparative Political Studies* 53, no. 10–11 (September 2020): 1798–1835, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414020912283>.
- 617 White working class was defined as non-Hispanic whites with no college degree and an annual household income below the median.
- 618 Nicholas Carnes and Noam Lupu, "The White Working Class and the 2016 Election," *Perspectives on Politics* 19, no. 1 (March 2021): 55–72, <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537592720001267>.
- 619 Nate Silver, "The Mythology of Trump's 'Working Class' Support," *FiveThirtyEight*, May 2016, <https://fivethirtyeight.com/features/the-mythology-of-trumps-working-class-support/>.
- 620 Rennie Lee, Yue Qian, and Cary Wu, "Coethnic Concentration and Asians' Perceived Discrimination across U.S. Counties during COVID-19," *Socius* 8 (September 26, 2020), <https://doi.org/10.1177/23780231221124580>.
- 621 Keith Neuman, *Canadian Public Opinion About Immigration and Refugees* (Toronto, Ontario: Environics Institute and Century Initiative, October 25, 2022), <https://www.environicsinstitute.org/projects/project-details/canadian-public-opinion-about-immigration-and-refugees---fall-2022>.

- 622 Neuman, *Canadian Public Opinion About Immigration and Refugees*. It is useful to also note that Environics Institute has conducted surveys on public opinion about Indigenous Peoples and reconciliation. However, the reports do not mention differences in attitudes based on income or education.
- 623 Donald P. Green, Jack Glaser, and Andrew Rich, "From Lynching to Gay Bashing: The Elusive Connection between Economic Conditions and Hate Crime," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 75, no. 1 (1998): 82; Julia C. Becker, Ulrich Wagner, and Oliver Christ, "Consequences of the 2008 Financial Crisis for Intergroup Relations: The Role of Perceived Threat and Causal Attributions," *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations* 14, no. 6 (November 2011): 871–885, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1368430211407643>; Jane C. Healy, "It Spreads like a Creeping Disease: Experiences of Victims of Disability Hate Crimes in Austerity Britain," *Disability & Society* 35, no. 2 (February 7, 2020): 176–200, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09687599.2019.1624151>.
- 624 Amber Peterman et al., "Pandemics and Violence against Women and Children," *Center for Global Development*, Washington, D.C., 2020.
- 625 Louis-Philippe Beland et al., "Covid-19, Family Stress and Domestic Violence: Remote Work, Isolation and Bargaining Power," *IZA Institute of Labor Economics*, Discussion Paper No. 13332, June 2020, <https://www.iza.org/publications/dp/13332/covid-19-family-stress-and-domestic-violence-remote-work-isolation-and-bargaining-power>.
- 626 Van Kesteren, "Assessing the Risk and Prevalence of Hate Crime Victimization in Western Europe," *International Review of Victimology* 22, no. 2 (2016): 139–160, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269758015627046>.
- 627 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 628 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 629 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 630 Health Justice, "Oral Submission."
- 631 Sylwia J. Piatkowska and Andreas Hövermann, "A Culture of Hostility and Crime Motivated by Bias: A Cross-National Multilevel Analysis of Structural Influences," *International Criminal Justice Review* 29, no. 2 (April 29, 2018): 141–167, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1057567718772332>.
- 632 Susan McNeeley and Suzanne Overstreet, "Lifestyle-Routine Activities, Neighborhood Context, and Ethnic Hate Crime Victimization," *Violence and Victims* 33 (October 1, 2018): 941, <https://doi.org/10.1891/0886-6708.VV-D-17-00136>.
- 633 Yorktown Family Services, "Oral Submission."
- 634 Rae Sibbitt, *The Perpetrators of Racial Harassment and Racial Violence* (London: Great Britain Home Office Research Development and Statistics Directorate, 1997).
- 635 Perry and Vysotsky, 2022, p. 53.
- 636 West Coast LEAF, "Written Submission," p. 9.
- 637 Dr. Bonnie Henry, "Oral Submission."
- 638 SNIWWOC, "Oral Submission."
- 639 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, "Oral Submission."
- 640 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, "Oral Submission."
- 641 Chief Fred Robbins of Esk'etemc First Nation, "Oral Submission."
- 642 Vietnamese Professionals Association, "Written Submission," p. 11.
- 643 M. B. Marron, *Misogyny and Media in the Age of Trump* (Lexington Books, 2020).
- 644 BBC News, "Donald Trump under Fire for Mocking Disabled Reporter," *BBC News*, November 26, 2015, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-34930042>.
- 645 Ayal Feinberg, Regina Branton, and Valerie Martinez-Ebers, "The Trump Effect: How 2016 Campaign Rallies Explain Spikes in Hate," *PS: Political Science & Politics* 55, no. 2 (April 2022): 257–265, <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1049096521001621>.
- 646 Devine, "Discrete Events and Hate Crimes," 2020.
- 647 Alessio Romarri, "Do Far-Right Mayors Increase the Probability of Hate Crimes? Evidence From Italy," *Social Science Research Network*, Scholarly Paper, University of Barcelona - Barcelona Institute of Economics (IEB), December 6, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3506811>.
- 648 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, "Oral Submission."
- 649 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, "Oral Submission."

- 650 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 651 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 652 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission.”
- 653 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 654 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 655 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 656 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission”; Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission”; Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 657 Interior Crisis Line Network (and BC Crisis Line Network), “Oral Submission.”
- 658 Chief Joe Alphonse of Tl’etinqox First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 659 Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission.”
- 660 Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, “Supplementary Submission Material.”
- 661 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 662 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission.”
- 663 Canadian Human Rights Commission, “Oral Submission.”
- 664 Yashadhana, Derbas, Biles, Grant, “Pandemic-Related Racial Discrimination and Its Health Impact among Non-Indigenous Racially Minoritized Peoples in High-Income Contexts,” *Health promotion international* 37, no. 2 (2022); Dionne and Turkmen, “The Politics of Pandemic Othering,” 2020.
- 665 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 666 Nelkin and Gilman, “Placing Blame for Devastating Disease,” 1988; Wim Van Damme and Wim Van Lerberghe, “Editorial: Epidemics and fear,” *Tropical Medicine & International Health* 5, no. 8 (August 2000): 511–514, <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-3156.2000.00599.x>.
- 667 Crawford, “The Boundaries of the Self and the Unhealthy Other: Reflections on Health, Culture and AIDS,” 1994; Eichelberger, “SARS and New York’s Chinatown,” 2007; Joffé, *Risk and ‘the Other’* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999).
- 668 Nelkin and Gilman, “Placing Blame for Devastating Disease,” 1988, p. 362.
- 669 Sylvia Reitmanova, “‘Disease-Breeders’ Among Us: Deconstructing Race and Ethnicity as Risk Factors of Immigrant Ill Health,” *Journal of Medical Humanities* 30, no. 3 (September 1, 2009) 183–190, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10912-009-9084-6>; Heide Castañeda, “Im/Migration and Health: Conceptual, Methodological, and Theoretical Propositions for Applied Anthropology,” *Napa Bulletin* 34, no. 1 (2010): 6–27; Kim Yi Dionne and Laura Seay, “American Perceptions of Africa during an Ebola Outbreak,” in *Ebola’s Message*, ed. N. G. Evans, T. C. Smith, and M. S. Majumder (2020), <https://covid-19.mitpress.mit.edu/pub/ialzqbqpw>; Mary-Ellen Kelm, *Colonizing Bodies: Aboriginal Health and Healing in British Columbia, 1900–50* (Vancouver, B.C.: UBC Press, 1998).
- 670 Schaller, Murray, and Hofer, “The Behavioural Immune System and Pandemic Psychology,” 2016.
- 671 Nico Voigtländer and Hans-Joachim Voth, “Persecution Perpetuated: The Medieval Origins of Anti-Semitic Violence in Nazi Germany,” *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 127, no. 3 (August 1, 2012): 1339–1392, <https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjs019>.
- 672 Kelm, “Colonizing Bodies: Aboriginal Health and Healing in British Columbia, 1900–50,” 1998.
- 673 Kiran Van Rijn, “‘Lo! The Poor Indian!’ Colonial Responses to the 1862–63 Smallpox Epidemic in British Columbia and Vancouver Island,” *Canadian Bulletin of Medical History* 23, no. 2 (October 2006): 541–560, <https://doi.org/10.3138/cbmh.23.2.541>.
- 674 desLibris, *Challenging Racist ‘British Columbia’: 150 Years and Counting*, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, 2021, <https://www.deslibris.ca/ID/10106333>.
- 675 Rijn, “‘Lo! The Poor Indian!’ Colonial Responses to the 1862–63 Smallpox Epidemic in British Columbia and Vancouver Island,” 2006, p. 548–549.

- 676 Esvyllt W. Jones, “Co-Operation in All Human Endeavour’: Quarantine and Immigrant Disease Vectors in the 1918–1919 Influenza Pandemic in Winnipeg,” *Canadian Bulletin of Medical History* 22, no. 1 (April 2005): 57–82, <https://doi.org/10.3138/cbmh.22.1.57>; Alan M. Kraut, “Immigration, Ethnicity, and the Pandemic,” *Public Health Reports* 125, no. 3 suppl. (April 1, 2010): 123–133, <https://doi.org/10.1177/00333549101250S315>; Howard Markel and Alexandra Minna Stern, “The Foreignness of Germs: The Persistent Association of Immigrants and Disease in American Society,” *The Milbank Quarterly* 80, no. 4 (December 2002): 757–788, <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-0009.00030>; Reitmanova, “Disease-Breeders’ Among Us,” 2009.
- 677 Markel and Stern, “The Foreignness of Germs,” 2002.
- 678 Renisa Mawani, “A Historical Account of the Pandemic: Health, Colonialism, and Racism in Canada – The Impact of COVID-19 in Racialized Communities,” *Royal Society of Canada*, May 2021.
- 679 Dennis Zhang, “Sinophobic Epidemics in America: Historical Discontinuity in Disease-Related Yellow Peril Imaginaries of the Past and Present,” *Journal of Medical Humanities* 42, no. 1 (March 1, 2021): 63–80, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10912-020-09675-x>; Susan Craddock, “Sewers and Scapegoats: Spatial Metaphors of Smallpox in Nineteenth Century San Francisco,” *Social Science & Medicine* (1982) 41, no. 7 (November 1, 1995): 957–968, [https://doi.org/10.1016/0277-9536\(94\)00409-M](https://doi.org/10.1016/0277-9536(94)00409-M).
- 680 Sylvia Reitmanova, “Disease-Breeders Among Us,” 2009; Kristin Burnett, “Race, Disease, and Public Violence: Smallpox and the (Un) Making of Calgary’s Chinatown, 1892,” *Social History of Medicine* 25, no. 2 (2012): 362–379.
- 681 Zhang, “Sinophobic Epidemics in America,” 2021; Oger Keil and Harris Ali, “Multiculturalism, Racism and Infectious Disease in the Global City: The Experience of the 2003 SARS Outbreak in Toronto,” *Topia: Canadian Journal of Cultural Studies* 16 (2006): 23–49; Eichelberger, “SARS and New York’s Chinatown,” 2007.
- 682 Remi Jedwab et al., “Epidemics, Pandemics, and Social Conflict: Lessons from the Past and Possible Scenarios for COVID-19,” *World Development* 147 (November 2021), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2021.105629>; Sander L. Gilman, “AIDS and Syphilis: The Iconography of Disease,” *October* 43 (1987): 87–107, <https://doi.org/10.2307/3397566>.
- 683 Trevor Hoppe, “Spanish Flu’: When Infectious Disease Names Blur Origins and Stigmatize Those Infected,” *American Journal of Public Health* 108, no. 11 (2018): 1462–1464.
- 684 World Health Organization, “WHO Issues Best Practices for Naming New Human Infectious Diseases,” *World Health Organization*, May 2015, <https://www.who.int/news/item/08-05-2015-who-issues-best-practices-for-naming-new-human-infectious-diseases>.
- 685 Angela R. Gover, Shannon B. Harper, and Lynn Langton, “Anti-Asian Hate Crime During the COVID-19 Pandemic: Exploring the Reproduction of Inequality,” *American Journal of Criminal Justice* 45, no. 4 (August 2020): 647–667, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12103-020-09545-1>.
- 686 Runjing Lu and Sophie Yanying Sheng, “From Fear to Hate: How the COVID-19 Pandemic Sparks Racial Animus in the United States,” *arXiv*, Electronic Article, 2020, <https://arxiv.org/ftp/arxiv/papers/2007/2007.01448.pdf>.
- 687 Kunal Relia et al., “Race, Ethnicity and National Origin-Based Discrimination in Social Media and Hate Crimes Across 100 U.S. Cities,” *Cornell University*, 2019, p. 11.; Karsten Müller and Carlo Schwarz, “From Hashtag to Hate Crime: Twitter and Anti-Minority Sentiment,” *Social Science Research Network*, 2020, https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3149103.
- 688 Eichelberger, “SARS and New York’s Chinatown,” 2007; Fatemeh Tahmasbi et al., “Go Eat a Bat, Chang!’: On the Emergence of Sinophobic Behavior on Web Communities in the Face of COVID-19,” *Proceedings of the Web Conference 2021, WWW ’21: The Web Conference 2021, Ljubljana Slovenia: ACM*, 2021, p. 1122–1133, <https://doi.org/10.1145/3442381.3450024>; Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 689 Paul Flowers et al., “Gay Men and HIV/AIDS Risk Management,” *Health* (2001): 50–75.
- 690 Joffé, *Risk and ‘the Other,’* 1999.
- 691 Dionne and Turkmen, “The Politics of Pandemic Othering,” 2020; Jedwab et al., “Epidemics, Pandemics, and Social Conflict,” 2021.
- 692 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 693 Liminal Spaces Consulting, “Oral Submission”; Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission”; Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission”; Mirrlees, “Oral Submission”; SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 694 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 695 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”

- 696 R.A. Malatest & Associates Ltd., “Experiences of Hate in B.C. During the Pandemic,” 2022.
- 697 Mackenzie Hart et al., “An Online Environmental Scan of Right-Wing Extremism in Canada,” *Institute for Strategic Dialogue*, 2021.
- 698 Hart et al., “An Online Environmental Scan of Right-Wing Extremism in Canada,” 2021, p. 18.
- 699 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 700 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 701 School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission.”
- 702 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 703 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism. “Oral Submission.”
- 704 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 705 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission.”
- 706 Orders in Council, “OIC P.C. 2022-0392,” *Government of Canada*, 2022, <https://orders-in-council.canada.ca/attachment.php?attach=41898&lang=en>.
- 707 Orders in Council, “OIC P.C. 2022-0392”, 2022.
- 708 “Public Order Emergency Commission,” *Public Order Emergency Commission*, n.d., <https://publicorderemergencycommission.ca/>.
- 709 “Public Order Emergency Commission,” n.d.
- 710 “Public Order Emergency Commission,” n.d.
- 711 Bioldeau et al., “Internet Use and COVID-19: How the Pandemic Increased the Amount of Time Canadians Spend Online,” 2021.
- 712 School District 22 - Vernon, “Oral Submission.”
- 713 Retail Council of Canada, “Oral Submission.”
- 714 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 715 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission”; Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 716 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 717 Chief Fred Robbins, Esk’etemc First Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 718 SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 719 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission”; SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 720 Karen Franklin, “Antigay Behaviors among Young Adults: Prevalence, Patterns, and Motivators in a Noncriminal Population,” *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 15, no. 4 (2000): 339–362; Matthew Leighton Williams and Jasmin Tregidga, *All Wales Hate Crime Research Project* (Cardiff, U.K.: Race Equality First and Cardiff University, 2013); Dominic J. Parrott et al., “The Link between Alcohol Use and Aggression toward Sexual Minorities: An Event-Based Analysis,” *Psychology of Addictive Behaviors* 24, no. 3 (2010): 516.
- 721 Steven F. Messner, Suzanne Mchugh, and Richard B. Felson, “Distinctive Characteristics of Assaults Motivated by Bias,” *Criminology* 42, no. 3 (August 2004): 585–618, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-9125.2004.tb00530.x>.
- 722 Mark Austin Walters and Carolyn Hoyle, “Exploring the Everyday World of Hate Victimization through Community Mediation,” *International Review of Victimology* 18, no. 1 (January 2012) 7–24, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269758011422472>.
- 723 West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission,” p. 9.
- 724 West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission,” p. 9.
- 725 First United Church, “Oral Submission”; Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 726 Timothy Snyder, *On Tyranny: Twenty Lessons from the Twentieth Century* (New York: Tim Duggan Books, 2017), p. 65.
- 727 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 728 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”

- 729 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 730 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 731 Public Policy Forum, *Harms Reduction*, 2021, p. 6.
- 732 Canadian Citizens’ Assembly on Democratic Expression, “Canadian Citizens’ Assembly on Democratic Expression: Recommendations to Strengthen Canada’s Response to the Spread of Disinformation Online,” Ottawa, *Public Policy Forum*, January 2022, <https://ppforum.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/DemX-RecommendationsToStrengthenCanadasResponseToDisinformationOnline-PPF-Jan2022-EN.pdf>.
- 733 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 734 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 735 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 736 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 737 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 738 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 739 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 740 Global Project Against Hate and Extremism, “The Landscape of Cross-Border Ideologically Motivated Extremist Movements in Canada and the United States,” 2022.
- 741 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 742 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 743 Standing Committee on Public Safety and National Security, “The Rise of Ideologically Motivated Violent Extremism in Canada,” *House of Commons*, June 2022, <https://www.ourcommons.ca/Content/Committee/441/SECU/Reports/RP11868343/ securp06/ securp06-e.pdf>.
- 744 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 745 Bethan Johnson and Mathew Feldman, *Siege Culture After Siege: Anatomy of a Neo-Nazi Terrorist Doctrine* (The Hague, Netherlands: International Centre for Counter-Terrorism, July 2021), <https://icct.nl/app/uploads/2021/07/siege-culture-neo-nazi-terrorist-doctrine.pdf>.
- 746 Michele St-Amant et al., “Hate, Extremism and Terrorism in Alberta, Canada, and Beyond: The Shift from 2019 to 2022,” *OPV*, 2022, p. 9, <https://preventviolence.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/08/Hate-Extremism-and-Terrorism-in-Alberta-Canada-and-Beyond.pdf>.
- 747 Barbara Perry and Jennifer Schweppe, “A continuum of hate: delimiting the field of hate studies,” *Crime, Law and Social Change* 77 (2022): 503–528, <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10611-021-09978-7>.
- 748 Tenove and Tworek, “Online Hate in the Pandemic,” 2022, p. 16.
- 749 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission”; Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 750 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 751 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 752 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 753 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 754 Dr. Caroline Orr Bueno, “Oral Submission.”
- 755 SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission”; Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 756 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission.”
- 757 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission.”
- 758 Lynn Stuart Parramore, “Like QAnon’s Capitol Rioters, the Nashville Bomber’s Lizard People Theory Is Deadly Serious,” *NBC News*, January 12, 2021, <https://www.nbcnews.com/think/opinion/qanon-s-capitol-rioters-nashville-bomber-s-lizard-people-theory-ncna1253819>.
- 759 ADL, “Backgrounder - QAnon,” *ADL*, May 4, 2020, <https://www.adl.org/resources/backgrounder/qanon>.

- 760 Mack Lamoureux, “The ‘QAnon Queen’ Told Her Followers to Arrest Cops. It Didn’t Go Well” *Vice*, August 15, 2022, <https://www.vice.com/en/article/m7gb5y/queen-romana-didulo-citizen-arrest-qanon>.
- 761 Lamoureux, “The ‘QAnon Queen’ Told Her Followers to Arrest Cops,” 2022.
- 762 Tommy Beer, “Majority Of Republicans Believe The QAnon Conspiracy Theory Is Partly or Mostly True, Survey Finds,” *Forbes*, 2021, <https://www.forbes.com/sites/tommybeer/2020/09/02/majority-of-republicans-believe-the-qanon-conspiracy-theory-is-partly-or-mostly-true-survey-finds/?sh=306db45231dd>.
- 763 The New York Times, “QAnon Now as Popular in U.S. as Some Major Religions, Poll Suggests,” *The New York Times*, accessed December 19, 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/05/27/us/politics/qanon-republicans-trump.html>.
- 764 Michele St-Amant et al., “Hate, Extremism and Terrorism in Alberta, Canada, and Beyond,” 2022.
- 765 Eradicate Hate, “Media Backgrounder, Eradicate Hate Global Summit 2022,” *Eradicate Hate*, 2022, <https://eradicatehatesummit.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/08/2022-EHGS-Media-Backgrounder-082522-1.pdf>.
- 766 “Moonshot - Our Story,” *Moonshot*, n.d., <https://moonshotteam.com/about-us/>.
- 767 “Canada Network for Research on Terrorism, Security and Society (TSAS),” *TSAS*, n.d., <https://www.tsas.ca/>.
- 768 Moonshot, “The Impact of COVID-19 on Canada Search Traffic,” *Moonshot*, June 2020, https://moonshotcve.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/The-Impact-of-COVID-19-on-Canadian-Search-Traffic_Moonshot-CVE.pdf.
- 769 Moonshot, “From #CoronaVirusCoverUp to #NukeChina: An Analysis of Conspiracy Theories, Hate Speech and Incitements to Violence Across Twitter Related to Covid-19,” *Moonshot*, 2020, p. 10, https://149736141.v2.pressablecdn.com/wp-content/uploads/COVID-19-on-Twitter_Moonshot.pdf.
- 770 Canadian Race Relations Foundation, “Online Hate and Racism,” 2021.
- 771 Hart et al., “An Online Environmental Scan of Right-Wing Extremism in Canada,” 2021.
- 772 Brad Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Supplementary Submission Material.”
- 773 Luc Cousineau, “Social Media Misogyny: The New Way Andrew Tate Brought Us the Same Old Hate,” *National Post*, 2022, <https://nationalpost.com/pmn/news-pmn/social-media-misogyny-the-new-way-andrew-tate-brought-us-the-same-old-hate>.
- 774 Cecilia D’Anatasio and Davey Alba, “YouTube Bans Influencer Andrew Tate After Sexist Remarks,” *Bloomberg*, 2022, <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2022-08-22/youtube-bans-andrew-tate-over-sexist-remarks-still-on-twitch>.
- 775 Mason Regan, “Andrew Tate Is Back on Twitter. Here’s Why It’s Banned Almost Everywhere Else,” *Canada Today*, 2022, <https://canadatoday.news/ca/andrew-tate-is-back-on-twitter-heres-why-its-banned-almost-everywhere-else-156173/>.
- 776 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 777 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 778 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 779 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 780 Adverse childhood experiences (ACEs) are potentially traumatic events that occur in childhood and are linked to chronic health problems, mental illness, and substance use problems in adolescence and adulthood. ACEs can also negatively impact education, job opportunities, and earning potential. Steven Windisch et al., “Measuring the Extent and Nature of Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) among Former White Supremacists,” *Terrorism and Political Violence* (June 9, 2020): 1–22, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2020.1767604>.
- 781 Melissa T. Merrick et al., “Prevalence of Adverse Childhood Experiences from the 2011–2014 Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System in 23 States,” *JAMA Pediatrics* 172, no. 11 (2018): 1038–1044.
- 782 Daniel C. Gallant Law, “Oral Submission.”
- 783 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 784 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 785 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 786 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”

- 787 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 788 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 28, 2022).
- 789 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 790 Estimated Time of Arrival (ETA) is a rapid access service through Yorktown Community Services that supports people to reconnect with their communities in a pro-social and positive way through engagement, connection to basic needs and social/emotional supports while bridging to a wide variety of services that help people feel validated and more connected to their communities.
- 791 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 792 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 793 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 794 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Supplementary Submission Materials” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 29, 2022).
- 795 Mirrlees, “Oral Submission.”
- 796 Ryan Broderick, “How Facebook Twisted Canada’s Trucker Convoy into an International Movement,” *The Verge*, February 19, 2022, <https://www.theverge.com/2022/2/19/22941291/facebook-canada-trucker-convoy-gofundme-groups-viral-sharing>; Heidi Tworek, “Authorities Were Warned about Extremist Fundraising Online but Did Not Seem to Hear,” *Centre for International Governance Innovation*, 2022, <https://www.cigionline.org/articles/authorities-were-warned-about-extremist-fundraising-online-but-did-not-seem-to-hear/>; Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 797 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 798 Global Project Against Hate and Extremism, “The Landscape of Cross-Border Ideologically Motivated Extremist Movements in Canada and the United States,” 2022, p. 4.
- 799 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 800 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 801 Bob de Faye, Dan Perrin, and Chris Trumpy, *COVID-19 Lessons Learned Review - Final Report*, Government of British Columbia, September 23, 2022, https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/public-safety-and-emergency-services/emergency-preparedness-response-recovery/embc/reports/covid-19_lessons_learned_report.pdf.
- 802 de Faye, Perrin, and Trumpy, *COVID-19 Lessons Learned Review - Final Report*, 2022.
- 803 BC’s Office of the Human Rights Commissioner, *Reimagining Human Rights in B.C.: Strategic Plan 2020/21–2024/26*, British Columbia’s Office of the Human Rights Commissioner, December 2020, https://bchumanrights.ca/wp-content/uploads/BCOHRC_Dec2020_Strategic-Plan_FINAL.pdf.
- 804 Megan Krolik, “Exploring a Rights Based Approach to Disaster Management,” *Australian Journal of Emergency Management* 28, no. 4 (October 2013), <https://knowledge.aidr.org.au/resources/ajem-oct-2013-exploring-a-rights-based-approach-to-disaster-management/>.
- 805 Krolik, “Exploring a Rights Based Approach to Disaster Management,” 2013.
- 806 ActionAid, “The Rights-Based Approach to Emergencies: A Beginner’s Guide,” *ActionAid*, January 1, 2002, <https://actionaid.org/publications/2002/rights-based-approach-emergencies-beginners-guide>.
- 807 Ontario Human Rights Commission, “Policy Statement on a Human Rights-Based Approach to Managing the COVID-19 Pandemic,” *OHRC*, n.d., <https://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/policy-statement-human-rights-based-approach-managing-covid-19-pandemic>.
- 808 Ontario Human Rights Commission, “Policy Statement on a Human Rights-Based Approach to Managing the COVID-19 Pandemic,” n.d.
- 809 Premier John Horgan, “Mandate Letter Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General,” *Government of British Columbia*, February 25, 2022, https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/government/ministries-organizations/premier-cabinet-mlas/minister-letter/pssg-farnworth-mandate_2022_-_secured.pdf.
- 810 Retail Council of Canada, “Oral Submission.”
- 811 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 812 Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission,” p. 3.
- 813 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”

- 814 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 815 Conducted by Leger for the Canadian Centre on Substance Use and Addiction, Mental Health Commission of Canada, “Mental Health and Substance Use During COVID-19, Summary Report 5: Spotlight on Suicidal Ideation and Substance Use,” 2022, <https://mentalhealthcommission.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/leger-poll-spotlight-on-Suicidal-Ideation-and-Substance-Use.pdf>.
- 816 Statistics Canada, “Health Fact Sheets: Mental Health Care Needs, 2018,” *Statistics Canada*, October 7, 2019, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/82-625-x/2019001/article/00011-eng.htm>.
- 817 Conducted by Leger for the Canadian Centre on Substance Use and Addiction, Mental Health Commission of Canada, “Mental Health and Substance Use During COVID-19, Final Summary Report,” 2022.; Canadian Mental Health Association et al., *Summary of Findings: Mental Health Impacts of COVID-19 - Wave 4*, Canadian Mental Health Association, February 2022, <https://cmha.ca/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/Key-findings-summary-UBC-round-4-Final.pdf>.
- 818 Canadian Psychological Association, “Strong Majority of Canadians Want Improved Access to Psychologists,” *CPA*, January 5, 2021, <https://cpa.ca/strong-majority-of-canadians-want-improved-access-to-psychologists/>.
- 819 BC Federation of Labour, “Written Submission.”
- 820 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission.”
- 821 Community Alliance of Racialized & Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health “Oral Submission”; DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.” Kelowna Community Resources Part 2, “Oral Submission.”
- 822 Mental Health Commission of Canada, “COVID-19 and Mental Health: Policy Responses and Emerging Issues - Preliminary Scan,” *Mental Health Commission of Canada*, 2020, https://mentalhealthcommission.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/COVID_19_policy_responses_emerging_issues_eng.pdf.
- 823 Mental Health Commission of Canada, “The Impact of COVID-19 on Rural and Remote Mental Health and Substance Use,” *Mental Health Commission of Canada*, 2021, <https://mentalhealthcommission.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/The-Impact-of-COVID-19-on-Rural-and-Remote-Mental-Health-and-Substance-Use.pdf.pdf>.
- 824 Statistics Canada, “The Vulnerability of Canadians with Disabilities during the COVID-19 Pandemic,” *The Daily*, July 6, 2020, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/daily-quotidien/200706/dq200706a-eng.htm>.
- 825 United Nations Human Rights Office of the Commissioner, “11. United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (2011),” *OHCHR*, 2011, <https://www.ohchr.org/en/resources/educators/human-rights-education-training/11-united-nations-declaration-human-rights-education-and-training-2011>.
- 826 UNESCO and the UN Office on the Prevention of Genocide and the Responsibility to Protect, *Addressing Hate Speech Through Education, Multi-stakeholder Online Forum: meeting report*, UNESCO Digital Library, 2021, <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000380290>.
- 827 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 828 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission.”
- 829 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission.”
- 830 Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission,” p. 5.
- 831 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission.”
- 832 Klautt Law, “Oral Submission.”
- 833 Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission” p. 5.
- 834 Rise Women’s Legal Centre, “Written Submission,” p. 5.
- 835 United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner and Equitas, *Bridging Our Diversities: A Compendium of Good Practices in Human Rights Education*, United Nations, 2022, <https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/2022-02/OHCHR-Publication-Equitas-Compendium-of-Good-Practices-in-Human-Rights-Education-EN.pdf>.
- 836 SNIWWOC, “Oral Submission.”
- 837 BC Teachers’ Federation, “Written Submission,” p. 21.
- 838 “CTRL-F - Find the Facts,” *CTRL-F*, n.d., <https://ctrl-f.ca/en/>.

- 839 Canadian Intergovernmental Conference Secretariat, *Principles and Guidelines for Restorative Justice Practice in Criminal Matters*, Federal-Provincial-Territorial Meeting of Ministers Responsible for Justice and Public Safety, 2018, <https://scics.ca/en/product-produit/principles-and-guidelines-for-restorative-justice-practice-in-criminal-matters-2018/>.
- 840 Office of the Federal Ombudsman for Victims of Crime, *Restorative Justice: Getting Fair Outcomes for Victims in Canada's Criminal Justice System*, Office of the Federal Ombudsman for Victims of Crime, 2017; Katherine Beckett and Steve Herbert, *Developing Restorative Justice as a Response to Hate Crime in Washington: A Proposal*, Center for Human Rights, Henry M. Jackson School of International Studies, University of Washington, December 1, 2021, p. 25, https://apps.leg.wa.gov/ReportsToTheLegislature/Home/GetPDF?fileName=Restorative%20Justice%20as%20a%20Response%20to%20Hate%20Crime_FINAL_bc70a4d9-b405-4ec2-a1a0-b7ea1d2307bd.pdf.
- 841 Canadian Intergovernmental Conference Secretariat, *Principles and Guidelines for Restorative Justice Practice in Criminal Matters*, 2018.
- 842 United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, Vienna, *Handbook on Restorative Justice Programs* (New York: United Nations, 2006), https://www.unodc.org/pdf/criminal_justice/Handbook_on_Restorative_Justice_Programmes.pdf.
- 843 Dr. Morales' summary of her report is reproduced with her consent.
- 844 Translations provided by Florence James via email on August 7, 2010.
- 845 See Crisca Bierwert, *Brushed by Cedar, Living by the River: Coast Salish Figures of Power* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1999), p. 183-185.
- 846 Beckett and Herbert, *Developing Restorative Justice as a Response to Hate Crime in Washington*, 2021, p. 24.
- 847 Beckett and Herbert, 2021.
- 848 "RJ Information for Victims," *Restorative Justice Victoria*, n.d., <http://www.rjvictoria.com/rj-for-victims/>.
- 849 Theo Gavrielides, *Restorative Justice: Ideals and Realities, First edition* (London: Taylor and Francis, 2017).
- 850 Canadian Intergovernmental Conference Secretariat, *Principles and Guidelines for Restorative Justice Practice in Criminal Matters*, 2018.
- 851 Government of Canada, "Restorative Justice," *Government of Canada*, 2021, <https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/cj-jp/rj-jr/index.html>.
- 852 Government of Canada, "Restorative Justice - Legislation and Policy," *Government of Canada*, 2021, <https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/cj-jp/rj-jr/lp.html>.
- 853 The survey captured information on restorative justice referrals, processes, and participants. Survey respondents included ministries and departments who were members of the working group. See Public Safety Canada, "Increasing the Use of Restorative Justice in Criminal Matters in Canada - Baseline Report," *Public Safety Canada*, November 24, 2020, <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/2020-resjus-jusrep/index-en.aspx>.
- 854 Government of British Columbia, "Restorative Justice: An Overview," *Government of British Columbia*, n.d., <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/justice/criminal-justice/bcs-criminal-justice-system/understanding-criminal-justice/restorative-justice>.
- 855 BC Human Rights Tribunal, "British Columbia Human Rights Tribunal Mediation Policy," *British Columbia Human Rights Tribunal*, March 2022, <http://www.bchrt.bc.ca/shareddocs/policies/mediation-policy.pdf>.
- 856 BC Human Rights Tribunal, "British Columbia Human Rights Tribunal Mediation Policy," 2022.
- 857 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Written Submission" (BCOHR Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 24, 2022), p. 6.
- 858 Ardit Walpetko We'dalx Walkem, QC Cear and Sage Law, *Expanding Our Vision: Cultural Equality & Indigenous Peoples' Human Rights*, British Columbia Human Rights Tribunal, January 15, 2020, <http://www.bchrt.gov.bc.ca/shareddocs/indigenous/expanding-our-vision.pdf>.
- 859 BC Human Rights Tribunal, "British Columbia Human Rights Tribunal Mediation Policy," 2022.
- 860 Canadian Intergovernmental Conference Secretariat, *Principles and Guidelines for Restorative Justice Practice in Criminal Matters*, 2018.
- 861 Government of British Columbia, "Restorative Justice: An Overview," n.d.
- 862 Mark Austin Walters, *Hate Crime and Restorative Justice: Exploring Causes, Repairing Harms* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199684496.001.0001>.
- 863 Walters, *Hate Crime and Restorative Justice: Exploring Causes, Repairing Harms*, 2014.

- 864 Beckett and Herbert, *Developing Restorative Justice as a Response to Hate Crime in Washington*, 2021, p. 35.
- 865 Restorative Justice Victoria, "Collaborative and Capacity Building in Restorative Justice and Victim Services," *Restorative Justice Victoria*, 2018, https://rjvictoria.thinkific.com/users/sign_in.
- 866 Justine Hunter, "How a Hate Crime Opened a Road to Redemption for a Vulnerable Teenager in B.C.," *The Globe and Mail*, October 5, 2021, <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/canada/british-columbia/article-a-hate-crime-that-opened-a-path-to-redemption/>.
- 867 Hunter, 2021.
- 868 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Written Submission," p. 6.
- 869 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Oral Submission."
- 870 Community Legal Assistance Society, "Oral Submission."
- 871 Vancouver Police Department - Hate Crimes Unit, "Oral Submission."
- 872 "Transformative Justice Project," WAWAW Rape Crisis Centre, n.d., <https://www.wavaw.ca/transformative-justice-project/>.
- 873 Restorative Justice Victoria, "RJ Information for Victims," n.d.
- 874 "All About CDRJS," *Cranbrook and District Restorative Justice Society*, n.d., <https://cdrjsociety.ca/all-about-cdrjs>.
- 875 CDRJS, "Annual General Meeting 2020," *Cranbrook and District Restorative Justice Society*, 2020, <https://cdrjsociety.ca/annual-general-meeting>.
- 876 "Frequently Asked Questions," *Cranbrook and District Restorative Justice Society*, n.d., <https://cdrjsociety.ca/frequently-asked-questions>.
- 877 CDRJS, "Annual General Meeting 2020," 2020.
- 878 "Who We Are," *Coalition of Muslim Women of Kitchener-Waterloo*, n.d., <https://cmw-kw.org/>.
- 879 "Collaborative Justice Program," *CJP*, n.d., <https://www.collaborativejustice.ca/en/home>.
- 880 Why me?, "About Us," *Why me?*, n.d., <https://why-me.org/about/>. Why me? was set up by Will Riley (a burglary victim) with the help of Peter Woolf (an offender who burgled Will's home and assaulted him). Following their transformative experience with the restorative justice process, they both decided to create a platform to encourage more people to explore restorative justice.
- 881 "Every Victim Deserves a Voice," *Victims' Voices Heard*, n.d., <https://www.victimsvoicesheard.org/>.
- 882 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, "Oral Submission."
- 883 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 884 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, "Oral Submission."
- 885 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, "Oral Submission."
- 886 Daniel C. Gallant, "Oral Submission."
- 887 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, "Oral Submission."
- 888 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, "Oral Submission."
- 889 Pettigrew and Tropp, "A Meta-Analytic Test of Intergroup Contact Theory," *Journal of personality and social psychology* vol. 90, no. 5 (2006): 751–783.
- 890 Kristof Dhont and Alain Van Hiel, "We Must Not Be Enemies: Interracial Contact and the Reduction of Prejudice among Authoritarians," *Personality and Individual Differences* 46 (January 31, 2009): 172–177, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.paid.2008.09.022>; Frank Asbrock et al., "Differential Effects of Intergroup Contact for Authoritarians and Social Dominators: A Dual Process Model Perspective," *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 38, no. 4 (2012): 477–490; Gordon Hodson, "Interracial Prison Contact: The Pros for (Socially Dominant) Cons," *British Journal of Social Psychology* 47, no. 2 (2008): 325–351.
- 891 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, "Supplementary Submission Material."
- 892 Tony McAleer, "Oral Submission."

- 893 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 894 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Supplementary Submission Material.”
- 895 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission”; Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 896 Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 897 “Shift BC,” *Shift*, n.d., <https://shift.gov.bc.ca/about/>.
- 898 “Organization for the Prevention of Violence,” *OPV*, n.d., <https://preventviolence.ca/>.
- 899 St-Amant et al., “Hate, Extremism and Terrorism In Alberta, Canada, and Beyond,” 2022; Navaid Aziz and Stephanie Carvin, “Hate in Canada: A Short Guide to Far-Right Extremist Movements,” *The Organization for the Prevention of Violence*, January 2022, <https://preventviolence.ca/publication/hate-in-canada-a-short-guide-to-far-right-extremist-movements/>.
- 900 “Evolve Program,” *OPV*, n.d., <https://preventviolence.ca/evolve-program/>; Galloway, Organization for the Prevention of Violence (Evolve Program), and Centre on Hate, Bias and Extremism, “Oral Submission.”
- 901 “CPN-PREV,” *Canadian Practitioners Network for Prevention of Radicalization and Extremist Violence*, n.d., <https://cpnprev.ca/>.
- 902 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 903 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 904 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 905 Yorktown Family Services, “Oral Submission.”
- 906 Beckett and Herbert, *Developing Restorative Justice as a Response to Hate Crime in Washington*, 2021, p. 8.
- 907 Beckett and Herbert, 2021, p. 10.
- 908 It is, however, important to note that in 2015, the federal government passed the *Canadian Victims Bill of Rights* which gives victims a number of rights including identity protection, testimonial aides, the option of providing a victim impact statement, and more.
- 909 P. Dunn, “Crime and Prejudice: Needs and Support of Hate Crime Victims” in *Hate Crimes, Volume Two*, ed. P. Iganski (London: Praeger, 2009).
- 910 Section 718 of the *Criminal Code* of Canada stipulates that the role of sentencing in criminal proceedings is to denounce the unlawful conduct and harm done to the victim, deter and rehabilitate offenders, provide reparations for harm done to victims or to the community; and to promote a sense of responsibility in offenders, and acknowledgment of the harm done to victims or to the community amongst other things. See *Criminal Code of Canada*, [R.S.C., 1985], c. C-46.
- 911 Walters, *Hate Crime and Restorative Justice*, 2014.
- 912 Walters, 2014. See also Heather Strang and John Braithwaite, *Restorative Justice and Family Violence* (Cambridge University Press, 2002).
- 913 Walters, 2014.
- 914 Walters, 2014.
- 915 *R. v. Corbett*, 2017 BCPC 314 (CanLII), <https://canlii.ca/t/hmtcx>.
- 916 *R. v. Corbett*, 2017 BCPC 314 (CanLII), <https://canlii.ca/t/hmtcx>.
- 917 Beckett and Herbert, 2021, p. 31–37.
- 918 Beckett and Herbert, 2021, p. 37–38.
- 919 Walters, 2014.
- 920 Beckett and Herbert, 2021, p. 37–38.
- 921 Walters, 2014.
- 922 Collingwood Neighbourhood House, “Oral Submission.”
- 923 West Coast LEAF, “Written Submission,” p.7.
- 924 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission”; Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission.”

- 925 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 926 Wavefront Centre for Communication Accessibility, “Oral Submission.”
- 927 BC Hate Crimes is an integrated unit in the RCMP E Division Major Crimes Section that serves as a provincial resource to RCMP detachments and municipal police departments.
- 928 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ,” *BC Hate Crimes*, document provided to BCOHRC.
- 929 Hate Crimes Community Working Group, *Addressing Hate Crime in Ontario: Final Report of the Hate Crimes Community Working Group to the Attorney General and the Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services. Strategy, Recommendations, Priorities for Action*, Ministry of the Attorney General and the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services, 2006, https://www.attorneygeneral.jus.gov.on.ca/english/about/pubs/hatecrimes/HCCWG_full.pdf.
- 930 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 931 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 932 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 31, 2022), p. 13.
- 933 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 934 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 935 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 936 Kelowna Community Resources, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 16, 2021); Greater Vancouver Japanese Canadian Citizens Association, “Oral Submission”; Dr. Vincent Yang, “Oral Submission.”
- 937 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 938 project 1907, “Oral Submission.”
- 939 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 940 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 941 project 1907, “Oral Submission,” p. 190.
- 942 “歧視報案 Report Racism,” *Chinese Canadian National Council Toronto Chapter*, n.d., <https://www.ccntoronto.ca/demands>.
- 943 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, “Oral Submissions.”
- 944 Centre for Israel and Jewish Affairs, Vancouver Holocaust Education Centre, and Jewish Federation of Greater Vancouver, “Oral Submission.”
- 945 Kelowna Community Resources, “Oral Submission.”
- 946 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 947 BC Public Service Agency, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 30, 2022).
- 948 Society for Children and Youth of BC, “Written Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 29, 2022), p. 5.
- 949 Youth Talk Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 950 Society for Children and Youth of BC, “Written Submission,” p. 5.
- 951 Youth Talk Nation, “Oral Submission.”
- 952 University of Victoria Student Society, “Written Submission,” p. 1.
- 953 “About Our 24-Hour Reporting Services,” *Stop Hate UK*, n.d., <https://634d4f8793.nxcli.net/about-us/about-stop-hate-helplines/>.
- 954 “About Us,” *Tell MAMA*, n.d., <https://tellmamauk.org/about-us/>.
- 955 “Hate Crime,” *Galop*, n.d., <https://galop.org.uk/types-of-abuse/hate-crime/>.
- 956 “Our Mission and History,” *ADL*, n.d., <https://www.adl.org/about/mission-and-history>.
- 957 “About,” *Netsafe*, n.d., <https://www.netsafe.org.nz/aboutnetsafe/>.
- 958 “About,” *STOP AAPI HATE*, n.d., <https://stopaaphate.org/about/>.
- 959 “Report a Hate Crime,” *OC Human Relations*, n.d., <https://www.ochumanrelations.org/hatecrime/report/>.

- 960 Eliminate Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 961 Kelowna Community Resources, “Oral Submission.”
- 962 Eliminate Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 963 Government of Canada, *Constitution Act, 1982*, Being Schedule B to the *Canada Act 1982 (UK)*, c.11., Part 1 *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* s.2(b).
- 964 UN General Assembly, *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, 217 A (III), December 10, 1948, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3712c.html>.
- 965 UN General Assembly, *Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly*, A/RES/61/106, January 24, 2007, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/45f973632.html>.
- 966 UN General Assembly, *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly*, A/RES/61/295, October 2, 2007, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/471355a82.html>.
- 967 UN General Assembly, *Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court* (last amended 2010), July 17, 1998, ISBN No. 92-9227-227-6, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3a84.html>.
- 968 OHCHR, “OHCHR and Freedom of Expression vs Incitement to Hatred: The Rabat Plan of Action,” *OHCHR*, n.d., <https://www.ohchr.org/en/freedom-of-expression>.
- 969 United Nations, *Plan of Action for Religious Leaders and Actors to Prevent Incitement to Violence That Could Lead to Atrocity Crimes*, UN, July 2017, https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/publications-and-resources/Plan_of_Action_Religious-rev5.pdf.
- 970 United Nations, “Engaging Religious Actors to Counter Hate Speech, Prevent Incitement to Violence, and Build Peaceful and Inclusive Societies,” *United Nations Office of the High Commissioner*, 2021, <https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/OHCHR-Notebook-Side-Binding.pdf>.
- 971 UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), “General Recommendation No. 35: Combating Racist Hate Speech,” September 26, 2013, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/53f457db4.html>.
- 972 United Nations, “The UN Strategy and Plan of Action,” *United Nations*, 2019, <https://www.un.org/en/hate-speech/un-strategy-and-plan-of-action-on-hate-speech>.
- 973 United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner, *United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training*, UNHCR, 2011.
- 974 United Nations, “United Nations Guidance Note on Addressing and Countering COVID-19 Related Hate Speech,” *UN*, May 11, 2020, <https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/3863213>.
- 975 United Nations, “United Nations Guidance Note on Addressing and Countering COVID-19 Related Hate Speech,” 2020.
- 976 Province of British Columbia, “Principles and Sources of Criminal Law,” *Province of British Columbia*, n.d., <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/justice/criminal-justice/bcs-criminal-justice-system/understanding-criminal-justice/principles-and-sources-of-criminal-law>.
- 977 “Promotes” means actively supports or instigates. More than mere encouragement is required. The guilty mind required by s. 319(1) is something less than intentional promotion of hatred. On the other hand, the use of the word “wilfully” in s. 319(2) suggests that the offence is made out only if the accused had as a conscious purpose the promotion of hatred against the identifiable group, or if they foresaw that the promotion of hatred against that group was certain to result and nevertheless communicated the statements. Although the causal connection need not be proven, the speaker must desire that the message stir up hatred: *Mugesera v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)*, 2005 SCC 40 at paras. 101 and 104.
- 978 As noted in *Mugesera v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)*, 2005 SCC 40 at para. 88, “The guilty mind required for the crime of incitement to genocide is an ‘intent to directly prompt or provoke another to commit genocide’ ... It implies a desire on the part of the perpetrator to cause another to have the state of mind necessary to commit the acts enumerated in s. 318(2) of the *Criminal Code*. The person who incites must also have the specific intent to commit genocide: an intent to destroy in whole or in part any identifiable group, namely, any section of the public distinguished by colour, race, religion, or ethnic origin (s. 318(2) and (4) of the *Criminal Code*).”
- 979 *Saskatchewan (Human Rights Comm.) v. Whatcott*, 2013 SCC 11.; *R. v. Keegstra*, 1990 CanLII 24 (SCC).
- 980 Under the *Human Rights Code* many acts of discrimination involve offensive speech. Whenever people use words in a way that attacks and undermines a person’s dignity in connection with their work, housing or access to public services because of personal characteristics protected by the Code, the Human Rights Tribunal could find that they have discriminated under the Code. However, in order for offensive speech to become hate speech, it must include detestation and vilification, as well as meet the other requirements of section 7.

- 981 Provost-Yombi et al., “Hate as an Aggravating Factor at Sentencing,” 2020.
- 982 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission.”
- 983 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 984 Dr. Bonnie Henry, “Oral Submission”; Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission”; Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 985 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 986 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 987 Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 988 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 989 Jason Proctor, “The Difficult History of Prosecuting Hate in Canada,” *CBC News*, June 13, 2020, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/racists-attacks-court-hate-crimes-1.5604912>.
- 990 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission”; Dr. Vincent Yang, “Oral Submission.”
- 991 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 992 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 993 BC Hate Crimes, “Oral Submission.”
- 994 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission.”
- 995 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission.”
- 996 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission”; Vietnamese Professionals Association, “Oral Submission.”
- 997 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission.”
- 998 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission.”
- 999 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 1000 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission.”
- 1001 Vancouver Police Department – Hate Crimes Unit, “Oral Submission”; *R. v. Castonguay*, 2021 BCPC 315.
- 1002 BC Prosecution Service, “Crown Counsel Policy Manual – Hate Crimes Policy,” *Province of British Columbia*, January 15, 2021.
- 1003 Province of British Columbia, “The Trial,” *Province of British Columbia*, n.d., <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/justice/criminal-justice/bcs-criminal-justice-system/understanding-criminal-justice/how-works/court-hearings/trial>.
- 1004 For more information about hate speech under the *Criminal Code*, see Resilience BC: Anti-Racism Network, “Hate Crimes in BC,” *Resilience BC*, n.d., <https://www.resiliencebc.ca/report-support/hate-crimes-in-bc/>; and BC Prosecution Service, “Hate Crimes Policy, Crown Counsel Policy Manual,” 2021. The obligation for Attorney General consents flows from s. 319(6) of the *Criminal Code*.
- 1005 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1006 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1007 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission.”
- 1008 BC Teachers’ Federation, “Written Submission,” p. 4.
- 1009 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 1010 BC Prosecution Service, “Crown Counsel Policy Manual – Hate Crimes Policy,” 2021.
- 1011 Jason Proctor, “Vancouver Man Charged with Promoting Hate in Relation to Racist Graffiti in Richmond,” *CBC News*, April 20, 2022, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/promoting-hate-richmond-graffiti-1.6423588>.
- 1012 CBC News, “Kelowna Man Pleads Guilty to Wilfully Promoting Hatred Against Ethnic Congolese Group,” *CBC News*, December 17, 2021, <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/kibwe-ngoie-ntombe-guilty-1.6291253>.
- 1013 Proctor, “Vancouver Man Charged with Promoting Hate in Relation to Racist Graffiti in Richmond,” 2022.
- 1014 *R. v. Castonguay*, 2021 BCPC 315.
- 1015 Beckett and Herbert, *Developing Restorative Justice as a Response to Hate Crime in Washington*, 2021.

- 1016 The Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, “Revising the Classification of Founded and Unfounded Criminal Incidents in the Uniform Crime Reporting Survey,” *Statistics Canada*, July 12, 2018, <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/85-002-x/2018001/article/54973-eng.htm>.
- 1017 The Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, 2018.
- 1018 Willful promotion of antisemitism (s. 319(2.1)) was only recently added to the *Criminal Code* on February 9, 2022.
- 1019 Some incidents had more than one motivation.
- 1020 This is different than the number of cases in which police recommended hate charges because the Prosecution Service provided the Commissioner with 10 years of data and the police provided the Commissioner with six years of data.
- 1021 The eight charges relate to six outcomes because four charges refer to the same two offences that were initiated in Provincial Court and then transferred to Supreme Court.
- 1022 Provost-Yombi et al., “Hate as an Aggravating Factor at Sentencing,” 2020.
- 1023 Researchers searched CanLII, WestlawNext Canada, Lexis Advance Quicklaw, and La Référence using an extensive set of search terms.
- 1024 Provost-Yombi et al., 2020.
- 1025 *Human Rights Code*, R.S.B.C. 1996, c210, s 7(1)(b).
- 1026 *Criminal Code*, R.S.C. 1985, c. C-46.
- 1027 The term “hate speech” isn’t used in either the *Criminal Code* or the *Human Rights Code*. Canadian law uses terms to refer to hate speech that are different from the words we use every day.
- 1028 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1029 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1030 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1031 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1032 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1033 Klaudt Law, “Oral Submission.”
- 1034 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1035 Daniel C. Gallant, “Oral Submission”; Klaudt Law, “Oral Submission”; Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1036 Community Legal Assistance Society, “Oral Submission.”
- 1037 Klaudt Law, “Oral Submission”; *Oger v. Whatcott*, (No 7).
- 1038 Tony McAleer, Cure for Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 1039 *Multiculturalism Act*, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 321, section 3(e).
- 1040 *Corrections Act Regulation*, B.C. Reg. 58/2005, section 21(1)(h).
- 1041 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHR Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 8, 2022); see more in Appendix H.
- 1042 *Youth Custody Regulation*, B.C. Reg. 137/2005, section 10(i)(ii); the Commissioner did not request data on these infractions.
- 1043 *Security Services Regulation*, B.C. Reg. 207/2008, section 9(1)(c); the Commissioner did not request data regarding prohibited advertising.
- 1044 *Civil Rights Protection Act*, R.S.B.C. 1996, c.49 s. 1
- 1045 *Maughan v. British Columbia*, 2008 BCSC 14, at para. 346.
- 1046 *Canadian Jewish Congress v. North Shore Free Press Ltd.*, 1997 BCHRT 35, para. 208.
- 1047 *Canadian Jewish Congress* para. 208.
- 1048 There are other laws that apply to terrorism and ideologically motivated violent extremism, including the *Proceeds of Crime (Money Laundering) and Terrorist Financing Act*, S.C. 2000, c. 17; *Justice for Victims of Terrorism Act*, 2012, S.C. 2012, c. 1; *National Security Act*, 2017, S.C. 2019, c. 13; and others.
- 1049 *Criminal Code*, R.S.C. 1985, c. C-46, s. 83.01.
- 1050 *R. v. Khawaja*, 2012 SCC 69 (n.d.).

- 1051 Section 83.03 makes it an offence to make available property or financial or other related services for the purpose of facilitating or carrying out a terrorist activity. Section 83.19(1) stipulates that anyone who knowingly facilitates a terrorist activity is liable to 14 years imprisonment while s. 83.18 states that anyone who knowingly contributes to the carrying out or facilitation of a terrorist activity is liable to 10 years imprisonment. Also, by virtue of ss. 83.21(1) and 83.22(1) anyone who knowingly instructs any person to facilitate or carry out a terrorist activity, is liable to imprisonment for life.
- 1052 *Regulations Establishing a List of Entities* SOR/2002-284 and *Regulations Amending the Regulations Establishing a List of Entities*, SOR/2021-169. There are about 77 terrorist entities on the list, including nine IMVE groups, namely: Combat 18, Blood and Honour, the Proud Boys, Atomwaffen Division, the Base, Russian Imperial Movement, Three Percenters, Aryan Strikeforce and American neo-Nazi James Mason. See Financial Transaction and Reports Analysis Centre of Canada, “Special Bulletin on Ideologically Motivated Violent Extremism: A Terrorist Activity Financing Profile,” *Financial Transaction and Reports Analysis Centre of Canada*, July 2021, <https://www.fintrac-canafe.gc.ca/intel/bulletins/imve-eng.pdf>.
- 1053 *Canadian Security Intelligence Service Act*, RSC 1985, c. C-23.
- 1054 Government of Canada, “Protecting National Security in Partnership with All Canadians,” *Canadian Security Intelligence Service*, June 28, 2022, p. 6, <https://www.canada.ca/en/security-intelligence-service/corporate/publications/pnspac-en/protecting-national-security-in-partnership-with-all-canadians.html>.
- 1055 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 1056 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 1057 BC Hate Crimes, “Hate Crimes FAQ.”
- 1058 Susan McDonald and Andrea Hogue, “An Exploration of the Needs of Victims of Hate Crimes Department of Justice Canada,” *Department of Justice Canada*, November 15, 2007, p. 28, https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/cj-jp/victim/rr07_vic1/rr07_vic1.pdf.
- 1059 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1060 Global Access and Inclusion Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1061 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1062 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1063 BC Association of Aboriginal Friendship Centres, “Oral Submission.”
- 1064 Community Alliance of Racialized Ethnocultural Services for Equitable Health, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 14, 2022).
- 1065 Collingwood Neighbourhood House, “Oral Submission.”
- 1066 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 1067 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission”; Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1068 Collingwood Neighbourhood House, “Oral Submission.”
- 1069 Radical Action with Migrants in Agriculture and Sanctuary Health, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 9, 2021).
- 1070 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1071 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 1072 Kelowna Community Resources, “Oral Submission.”
- 1073 DIVERSEcity, “Oral Submission.”
- 1074 Unifor, “Oral Submission.”
- 1075 McDonald and Hogue, 2007, p. 29.
- 1076 PwC and Canadian Race Relations Foundation, “Reimagining a Path to Support All Canadians: A Review of Services for Victims of Hate in Canada,” *Canadian Race Relations Foundation*, 2022, https://www.crrf-fcrr.ca/images/CRRF_-_A_review_of_services_for_victims_of_hate_in_Canada__Full_report.pdf. Reference to Hate crime in the CRRF report also includes hate incidents.
- 1077 Hate Crime Victim Support, *Policy Brief - Specialist Support for Hate Crimes Victims*, published with the support of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), funded by the European Union’s Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (2014–2020), n.d., <https://www.osce.org/files/f/documents/2/4/513127.pdf>.

- 1077 Mark Schaller, Damian R. Murray, and Marlise K. Hofer, “The Behavioural Immune System and Pandemic Psychology: The Evolved Psychology of Disease-Avoidance and its Implications for Attitudes, Behaviour, and Public Health during Epidemic Outbreaks,” *European Review of Social Psychology* (November 2): 2021, 1–37.
- 1079 Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, *Honouring the Truth, Reconciling for the Future: Summary of the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada*, Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 2015, p. 12, https://irsi.ubc.ca/sites/default/files/inline-files/Executive_Summary_English_Web.pdf.
- 1080 Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 2015, p. 13.
- 1081 Desmond Tutu in Helena Cobban, *The Moral Architecture of World Peace: Nobel Laureates Discuss our Global Future* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 2000), p. 136–137.
- 1082 See the section “Hate results in embarrassment and shame.”
- 1083 Albie Sachs, *The Strange Alchemy of Life and Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 79.
- 1084 “Statement on Anti-Black Racism from DIVERSEcity’s Leadership Team,” *DIVERSEcity*, June 3, 2020, <https://www.dcrs.ca/statement-on-anti-black-racism-from-diversecitys-leadership-team/>.
- 1085 Health Justice, “Oral Submission.”
- 1086 Kevin Roose, “The Making of a YouTube Radical,” *The New York Times*, 2019.
- 1087 David Becker et al., “Therapy with Victims of Political Repression in Chile: The Challenge of Social Reparation,” *Journal of Social Issues* 46, No.3 (1990): 133–149 at 147.
- 1088 Martha Minow, *When Should Law Forgive?* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company Ltd, 2019), p. 2–3.
- 1089 Some participants have not consented to their organizations being listed.
- 1090 The Commissioner would like to thank Tara Haarhoff, Manager, Data Analysis Unit, RCMP for her leadership in coordinating and preparing responses to the Commissioner’s information requests on behalf of many police services.
- 1091 MGLP, “The New Legislation Against Online Hate Speech - A Brief Overview,” *MGLP*, 2021, <https://www.mglp.eu/en/the-new-legislation-against-online-hate-speech-a-brief-overview/>.
- 1092 The Act does not specifically mention hate speech, but contains provisions on how online services should deal with illegal content.
- 1093 European Commission, “Digital Services Act: Commission Welcomes Political Agreement on Rules Ensuring a Safe and Accountable Online Environment,” *European Commission*, April 23, 2022, https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_22_2545.
- 1094 Dan Milmo, “Digital Services Act: Inside the EU’s Ambitious Bid to Clean up Social Media,” *The Guardian*, December 17, 2022, <https://www.theguardian.com/media/2022/dec/17/digital-services-act-inside-the-eus-ambitious-bid-to-clean-up-social-media>.
- 1095 European Parliament, “EU Digital Markets Act and Digital Services Act Explained,” *European Parliament*, July 5, 2022, <https://www.europarl.europa.eu/news/en/headlines/society/20211209STO19124/eu-digital-markets-act-and-digital-services-act-explained>.
- 1096 “Germany: Network Enforcement Act Amended to Better Fight Online Hate Speech,” *Library of Congress*, Washington, D.C., USA, 2021, <https://www.loc.gov/item/global-legal-monitor/2021-07-06/germany-network-enforcement-act-amended-to-better-fight-online-hate-speech/>.
- 1097 Meri Baghdasaryan and Karen Gullo, “UN Human Rights Committee Criticizes Germany’s NetzDG for Letting Social Media Platforms Police Online Speech,” *Electronic Frontier Foundation*, November 23, 2021, <https://www.eff.org/deeplinks/2021/11/un-human-rights-committee-criticizes-germanys-netzdg-letting-social-media>.
- 1098 “Online Harms White Paper - Initial Consultation Response,” *GOV.UK*, 2020, <https://www.gov.uk/government/consultations/online-harms-white-paper/public-feedback/online-harms-white-paper-initial-consultation-response>. It is important to note that the White Paper has also been subject to a lot of criticism from digital rights organizations.
- 1099 “Disinformation Code,” *DIGI*, n.d., <https://digi.org.au/disinformation-code/>.
- 1100 Government of New Zealand, Ministry of Justice *Harmful Digital Communications Act 2015*, Parliamentary Counsel Office, 2015, version as at 9 March 2022, <https://www.legislation.govt.nz/act/public/2015/0063/latest/whole.html>.
- 1101 Government of New Zealand, Ministry of Justice, *Harmful Digital Communications Act 2015*, 2015.

- 1102 Australian Government, *Online Safety Act 2021*, Federal Register of Legislation, accessed June 22, 2022, <https://www.legislation.gov.au/Details/C2021A00076>.
- 1103 eSafety Commissioner, "Safety by Design," *Australian Government*, n.d., <https://www.esafety.gov.au/industry/safety-by-design>.
- 1104 "About Christchurch Call," *Christchurch Call*, n.d.
- 1105 Priyal Pandey, "One Year Since the Christchurch Call to Action: A Review," *Observer Research Foundation*, August 3, 2020, <https://www.orfonline.org/research/one-year-since-the-christchurch-call-to-action-a-review/>. See also David Bromell, *Regulating Free Speech in a Digital Age: Hate, Harm and the Limits of Censorship* (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2022), <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-95550-2>.
- 1106 Pandey, "One Year since the Christchurch Call to Action," 2020.
- 1107 "Christchurch Call Community Consultation: Final Report," *ChristchurchCall.com*, 2021, <https://www.christchurchcall.com/assets/Documents/Chch-Call-Community-Consultation-Report-2021.pdf>.
- 1108 "Facing Online Hate: Portal Page," *Media Smarts – Canada's Centre for Digital and Media Literacy*, n.d., <https://mediasmarts.ca/teacher-resources/facing-online-hate-portal-page>.
- 1109 ADL, "ADL's Echoes & Reflections Program Trains Teachers in Holocaust Education," *ADL*, July 14, 2015, <https://dc.adl.org/adls-echoes-reflections-program-trains-teachers-in-holocaust-education/>.
- 1110 "SSPI Launches 'Education to End Hate' Initiative to Combat Bias, Bigotry, and Racism," *California Department of Education*, September 21, 2020, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/nr/ne/yr20/yr20rel77.asp>.
- 1111 "No Place for Hate," *ADL*, n.d., <https://dc.adl.org/npfh/>.
- 1112 ADL, "School Spotlight: Minnieville Elementary School," *ADL*, November 15, 2018, <https://dc.adl.org/school-spotlight-minnieville-elementary-school/>.
- 1113 WeTeachNYC, "#USvsHate: Anti-Hate, Bias, and Inequality Resources," *WeTeachNYC*, n.d., <https://www.weteachnyc.org/resources/resource/usvshate-anti-hate-bias-and-inequality-resources/>.
- 1114 The project involved Italy, Greece, Denmark and the United Kingdom and was funded by the Erasmus+ Youth program of the European Union.
- 1115 *A Manual of Good Practices Against Hate*, NEw Chapter: Network of Cooperation against Hate, 2018, <https://danilodolci.org/media/NEw-Chapter-Good-practices-against-hate.pdf>.
- 1116 eSafety Commissioner, "Safety by Design," n.d.
- 1117 "Collaborative Justice Program," *CJP*, n.d.1110
- 1118 "Sulah," *Community Justice Initiatives*, n.d., <https://cjiwr.com/sulah/>.
- 1119 CJI describes itself as "a non-profit organization known world-wide for starting the first modern Restorative Justice program." The organization is funded by a number of government agencies and community organizations including United Way, City of Guelph, Abundance Canada, Ontario's Ministry of the Attorney General, Public Safety Canada, the Provincial Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services of Ontario. "Sulah," n.d.
- 1120 CJI, "Sulah Program 2021-2022 Report," *Community Justice Initiatives*, March 2022, <https://cjiwr.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/Sulah-2022-Report.pdf>.
- 1121 "Every Victim Deserves a Voice," *Victims' Voices Heard*, n.d., <https://www.victimsvoicesheard.org/>.
- 1122 "Victim Impact Listen and Learn: An Evaluation of the Effects of the Victim Impact: Listen and Learn Program on Prisoner Recidivism and Prisoner Behavior," *Victims' Voices Heard*, October 2015, <https://www.victimsvoicesheard.org/images/pdf/delaware-evaluation-report-2015.pdf>.
- 1123 "Victim Impact Listen and Learn," 2015.
- 1124 "About Us," *Why me?*, n.d.
- 1125 "Evidence," *Why me?*, n.d., <https://why-me.org/library/>.
- 1126 Lisa Rea, "Applying Restorative Justice to the Genocide in Rwanda: A JRP Interview with Dan Van Ness," *Freedom from Fear Magazine*, March 2010, <https://f3magazine.unicri.it/?p=396>.
- 1127 Rea, "Applying Restorative Justice to the Genocide in Rwanda," 2010.
- 1128 "CPN-PREV," *CPN-PREV*, n.d.
- 1129 "Introducing CPN-PREV," *CPN-PREV*, n.d., <https://cpnprev.ca/about-us/>.
- 1130 "Introducing CPN-PREV," *CPN-PREV*, n.d.

- 1131 “Tools,” CPN-PREV, n.d., <https://cpnprev.ca/tools/>.
- 1132 “Evolve Program,” *Organization for the Prevention of Violence*, n.d., <https://preventviolence.ca/evolve-program/>.
- 1133 OPV, “Evolve Program: The First Two Years,” *Organization for the Prevention of Violence*, September 22, 2021, <https://preventviolence.ca/publication/evolve-program-the-first-two-years/>.
- 1134 “Evolve Program,” *Organization for the Prevention of Violence*, n.d.
- 1135 “Polarization Clinic,” *CIUSSS du Centre-Ouest de l’Île de Montréal*, 2022, <https://www.ciusswestcentral.ca/programs-and-services/critical-incidents-and-crises/polarization-clinic/>.
- 1136 “Estimated Time of Arrival,” *ETA*, n.d., <https://etatoronto.ca/>.
- 1137 “Who We Are,” *Life After Hate*, n.d., <https://www.lifeafterhate.org/>.
- 1138 “Impact Report,” *Life After Hate*, 2021, accessed July 16, 2022.
- 1139 “Thuringian Advisory Service: Exit from Right-Wing Extremism and Violence,” *DRUDEL 11*, accessed July 16, 2022.
- 1140 Tore Bjørgo and Yngve Carlsson, “Early Intervention with Violent and Racist Youth Groups,” *Norwegian Institute of International Affairs*, 2005.
- 1141 “We Provide Ways Out of Extremism,” *EXIT Germany*, n.d., <https://www.exit-deutschland.de/english/>.
- 1142 “EXIT Sweden,” *European Commission*, 2022, https://home-affairs.ec.europa.eu/networks/radicalisation-awareness-network-ran/collection-inspiring-practices/ran-practices/exit-sweden_en.
- 1143 Kate Ritchie, “STOP (Sacro Tackling Offending Prejudices),” *Centre for Youth and Criminal Justice*, 2019.
- 1144 “Vision,” *Violence Prevention Network*, May 15, 2018, <https://violence-prevention-network.de/ueber-uns/vision/?lang=en>.
- 1145 “Vision,” *Violence Prevention Network*, 2018.
- 1146 “Mission Statement,” *Violence Prevention Network*, May 15, 2018, <https://violence-prevention-network.de/ueber-uns/leitbild/?lang=en>.
- 1147 “Taking Responsibility,” *Violence Prevention Network*, May 15, 2018, <https://violence-prevention-network.de/ueber-uns/verantwortung-uebernehmen/?lang=en>.
- 1148 “Projects,” *Violence Prevention Network*, May 15, 2018, <https://violence-prevention-network.de/angebote/projektuebersicht/?lang=en>.
- 1149 *Violence Prevention Network, Annual Report 2020*, Violence Prevention Network, 2021, <https://violence-prevention-network.de/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Annual-Report-2020.pdf>.
- 1150 “Preventing Youth Hate Crimes & Bullying Initiative,” *Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention*, n.d., <https://ojjdp.ojp.gov/programs/preventing-youth-hate-crimes-bullying-initiative>.
- 1151 The Prevent Programme is one of the four strands of CONTEST, the UK’s counter-terrorism strategy. See UK Home Office, “Counter-Terrorism Strategy (CONTEST) 2018,” *GOV.UK*, 2018, <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/counter-terrorism-strategy-contest-2018>. The Prevent Multiagency Panel (PMAP) is Scotland’s equivalent of Channel. See UK Home Office, “Channel and Prevent Multi-Agency Panel (PMAP) Guidance,” *GOV.UK*, 2021, <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/channel-and-prevent-multi-agency-panel-pmap-guidance>.
- 1152 Government of the United Kingdom “Individuals Referred to and Supported through the Prevent Programme: England and Wales, April 2019 to March 2020,” *GOV.UK*, 2020, p. 6. <https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/individuals-referred-to-and-supported-through-the-prevent-programme-april-2019-to-march-2020>.”
- 1153 Government of the United Kingdom “Individuals Referred to and Supported through the Prevent Programme,” 2020, p. 7.
- 1154 Government of the United Kingdom “Individuals Referred to and Supported through the Prevent Programme,” 2020.
- 1155 Government of the United Kingdom “Individuals Referred to and Supported through the Prevent Programme,” 2020.
- 1156 European Forum for Restorative Justice, “Promising Strategies of Restorative Justice in Anti-LGBT Hate Crimes,” *Let’sGoByTalking*, 2020, <https://www.euforumrj.org/sites/default/files/2021-11/Promising%20strategies%20booklet%20%281%29.pdf>.

- 1157 Merili Pullerits et al., “Successes and Challenges of Delivering Hate Crime Community Projects,” *UK Home Office*, 2020.
- 1158 Pullerits et al., “Successes and Challenges of Delivering Hate Crime Community Projects,” 2020, p. 35.
- 1159 We have not accessed evaluations of these tools, but have listed the features that appear to support accessibility.
- 1160 “Our Mission and History,” *ADL*, n.d.
- 1161 “Report A Hate Crime,” *OC Human Relations*, August 19, 2012.
- 1162 “About,” *STOP AAPI HATE*, n.d.
- 1163 “Hate Crime,” *Galop*, n.d.
- 1164 “About Us,” *Stop Hate UK*, accessed July 25, 2022, <https://www.stophateuk.org/about-us/>.
- 1165 “Submit a Report to Tell MAMA,” *Tell MAMA*, accessed June 30, 2022, <https://tellmamauk.org/submit-a-report-to-us/>.
- 1166 “About Us,” *Tell MAMA*, n.d.
- 1167 “About Netsafe,” *Netsafe*, n.d.
- 1168 Nova Scotia Government, “Review of Intimate Images and Cyber-Protection Act Complete,” *Nova Scotia Government*, September 7, 2022, <https://novascotia.ca/news/release/?id=20220907001>.
- 1169 *Pennsylvania Statutes Title 42 Pa. C.S.A. Judiciary and Judicial Procedure* § 8309. See also “Combatting Hate Crime: A Resource Guide,” *Office of Attorney General Commonwealth of Pennsylvania*, accessed July 22, 2022, <https://www.attorneygeneral.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Hate-Crime-Resource-Guide-2-21-19-003.pdf>.
- 1170 *California Civil Code* Section 51.7.
- 1171 California Department of Justice, Division of Law Enforcement, “California Laws That Prohibit Hate Crimes and/or Provide Enhanced Penalties for Specified Hate-Related Acts,” *California Department of Justice*, June 30, 2021, <https://www.oag.ca.gov/system/files/media/2021-dle-05.pdf>.
- 1172 *California Civil Code* section 52.1.
- 1173 California Department of Justice, Division of Law Enforcement, 2021.
- 1174 California Department of Justice, Division of Law Enforcement, 2021.
- 1175 *Civil Action for Racial, Religious, or Ethnic Harassment, Violence or Vandalism*, § 8.01-42.1., accessed July 22, 2022, <https://law.lis.virginia.gov/vacode/title8.01/chapter3/section8.01-42.1/>.
- 1176 BC Public Service Agency, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 30, 2022).
- 1177 BC Public Service Agency, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1178 BC Public Service Agency, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1179 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1180 The Multiculturalism Branch and responsibility for the *Multiculturalism Act* moved from the Ministry of Tourism Arts and Culture to the Ministry of Attorney General in December 2020.
- 1181 “Attorney General BC Mandate Letter,” *Government of British Columbia*, November 26, 2020, https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/government/ministries-organizations/premier-cabinet-mlas/minister-letter/eby_mandate_2020_jan.pdf.
- 1182 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1183 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1184 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1185 Ministry of Attorney General, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1186 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1187 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”

- 1188 “Mandate Letter Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General,” *Government of British Columbia*, February 25, 2022, https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/government/ministries-organizations/premier-cabinet-mlas/minister-letter/pssg-farnworth-mandate_2022_-_secured.pdf.
- 1189 These standards have been added to the Provincial Policing Standards here: <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/justice/criminal-justice/policing-in-bc/policing-standards>. The *Police Act* allows government to create binding standards on police and to evaluate the compliance of police with those standards.
- 1190 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1191 *Correction Act Regulation* B.C. Reg. 58/2005, s.21(1)(h).
- 1192 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1193 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1194 Ministry of Health, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 22, 2022).
- 1195 Ministry of Mental Health and Addictions, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 22, 2022).
- 1196 Fraser Health Authority, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 15, 2022).
- 1197 Interior Health, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 6, 2022).
- 1198 Island Health, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 9, 2022).
- 1199 Northern Health Authority, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 7, 2022).
- 1200 Provincial Health Services Authority (PHSA), “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 20, 2022).
- 1201 Providence Health Care, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 3, 2022).
- 1202 Vancouver Coastal Health, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 9, 2022).
- 1203 First Nations Health Authority, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, 2022).
- 1204 “Mandate Letter Minister of Health,” *Government of British Columbia*, November 26, 2020, <https://news.gov.bc.ca/files/HLTH-Dix-mandate.pdf>.
- 1205 “Societal Consequences of COVID-19,” *BCDC*, n.d., <http://www.bccdc.ca/health-professionals/data-reports/societal-consequences-covid-19>.
- 1206 First Nations Health Authority, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1207 PHSA Fostering a Culture of Respect Policy, FHA’s Respectful Workplace Policy, NHA’s Respectful Workplace Policy, Island Health Respectful Workplace Policies, VCH Respectful Workplace and Human Rights Policy, Providence Health Respect at Work Policy, IHA Workplace Environment Policy and Procedure.
- 1208 Ministry of Education and Child Care, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 18, 2022).
- 1209 Ministry of Advanced Education and Skills Training, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 12, 2022).
- 1210 University of Northern British Columbia (UNBC), “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 20, 2022).
- 1211 “National Forum Anti-Asian Racism Report,” *University of British Columbia*, 2021.
- 1212 BCIT, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 8, 2022).
- 1213 Camosun College, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 7, 2022).
- 1214 Selkirk College, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 28, 2022).
- 1215 School District 57 – Prince George, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 8, 2022).

- 1216 School District 20 – Kootenay-Columbia, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 1, 2022).
- 1217 School District 63 - Saanich, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 2, 2022).
- 1218 School District 36 - Surrey, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 1, 2022).
- 1219 Ministry of Education and Child Care, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 18, 2022).
- 1220 ERASE Report It is an anonymous reporting tool for students, available at <https://erasereportit.gov.bc.ca/>.
- 1221 “MyEducationBC,” *Government of British Columbia*. MyEducationBC is a software that manages student demographics, enrollment, attendance, programs and courses, achievement and individual education and learning plans and reports.
- 1222 City of Kelowna, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 8, 2022).
- 1223 District of Kitimat, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 24, 2022).
- 1224 City of Nanaimo, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 5, 2022).
- 1225 District of Squamish, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 4, 2022).
- 1226 City of Vancouver, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 6, 2022).
- 1227 City of Victoria, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, June 6, 2022).
- 1228 City of Williams Lake, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 9, 2022).
- 1229 BC Ferries, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 13, 2022).
- 1230 BC Transit, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 24, 2022).
- 1231 TransLink, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 7, 2022).
- 1232 “Choose Transit System,” *BC Transit*, n.d., <https://www.bctransit.com/choose-transit-system>.
- 1233 City of Kelowna, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1234 BC Ferries, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1235 BC Transit, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1236 In B.C., not-for-profit/non-profit organizations are known as societies. Societies are independent, democratic organizations that are required to comply with the *Societies Act* and their own constitution and bylaws. See <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/employment-business/business/not-for-profit-organizations>.
- 1237 Ministry of Citizens’ Services, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 8, 2022).
- 1238 Ministry of Children and Family Development, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, April 19, 2022).
- 1239 Ministry of Labour, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 16, 2022).
- 1240 Ministry of Social Development and Poverty Reduction, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, May 27, 2022).
- 1241 Gender Equity Office, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 28, 2022).
- 1242 Cabinet Office, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, February 4, 2022).
- 1243 WorksafeBC, “Response to Information Request” (BCOHRC Hate Inquiry, British Columbia, March 23, 2022).
- 1244 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”

- 1245 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1246 Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General, including Emergency Management BC, “Response to Information Request.”
- 1247 Burnaby Together, MOSAIC, and Stand with Asians Coalition, “Oral Submission.”
- 1248 Eliminate Hate, “Oral Submission.”
- 1249 Hua Foundation, “Oral Submission.”
- 1250 South Okanagan Immigrant and Community Services, “Oral Submissions.”
- 1251 South Asian Legal Clinic of BC, “Oral Submission” (BCOHRC hate Inquiry, British Columbia, December 16, 2021).
- 1252 VBRG, “VBRG Association of Counseling Centers for Victims of Right-wing, Racist and Antisemitic Violence in Germany,” VBRG, n.d., <https://verband-brg.de/english/>.
- 1253 “Here to Help - Victim NI,” *Police Service of Northern Ireland*, n.d., <https://www.psni.police.uk/safety-and-support/advice-and-information/hate-crime>.
- 1254 *Hate on the Net Act*, Government of Austria, 2020, https://www.ris.bka.gv.at/Dokumente/BgblAuth/BGBLA_2020_I_148/BGBLA_2020_I_148.html.
- 1255 UN General Assembly, *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, December 10, 1948.
- 1256 UN General Assembly, *Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court*, July 17, 1998.
- 1257 UN General Assembly, *Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide*, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 78, December 9, 1948, p. 277, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3ac0.html>.
- 1258 Canada ratified the ICCPR in 1976. See Government of Canada, “International Human Rights Treaties to Which Canada Is a Party,” *Government of Canada*, 2021, <https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/abt-apd/icg-gci/ihrli-didp/tcp.html>.
- 1259 UN General Assembly, *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women*, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1249, December 18, 1979, p. 13, accessed July 26, 2022, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3970.html>.
- 1260 Canada ratified the ICERD in 1970. See Government of Canada, “International Human Rights Treaties to Which Canada Is a Party,” 2016.
- 1261 UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), “General Recommendation No. 35: Combating Racist Hate Speech,” *Refworld*, September 26, 2013, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/53f457db4.html>.
- 1262 UN General Assembly, *Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities*: resolution, January 24, 2007.
- 1263 UN General Assembly, *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples*: resolution, October 2, 2007.
- 1264 UN General Assembly, *Convention on the Rights of the Child*, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1577, November 20, 1989, p. 3, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b38f0.html>.
- 1265 OHCHR, “OHCHR and Freedom of Expression vs Incitement to Hatred” *OHCHR*, n.d.
- 1266 United Nations, “The UN Strategy and Plan of Action,” 2019.
- 1267 United Nations, “United Nations Guidance Note on Addressing and Countering COVID-19 Related Hate Speech,” May 11, 2020.
- 1268 United Nations, “Engaging Religious Actors to Counter Hate Speech, Prevent Incitement to Violence, and Build Peaceful and Inclusive Societies,” 2021.
- 1269 *Plan of Action for Religious Leaders and Actors to Prevent Incitement to Violence That Could Lead to Atrocity Crimes*, 2017.